Ethics as a Major Element of Sustainability in Educational Leadership across Finnish Education

Qazi Waqas Ahmed

ABSTRACT

Ahmed, Qazi Waqas. 2016. Ethics as a Major Element of Sustainability in Educational Leadership across Finnish Education. Master's Thesis in Education, University of Jyvaskyla. Institute of Educational Leadership.

The present study is an effort to analyze the concept of *Ethics as a major element of sustainability in educational leadership across Finnish Education*. It mainly involves with the elements such as ethical leadership and the notion of sustainability in Finnish educational leadership.

The current research is mainly thematic discussion, and it discusses the above mentioned elements through qualitative method. In this respect, the present study rests on phenomenological approach, which has provided the researcher a better understanding of the phenomenon under investigation.The data was gathered from the principals and superintends working in different leadership roles in different cities of Finland.

The present study has considerable findings, where it has brought out the facts that after analyzing the interviews, it is clear that ethical and sustainable leadership are of paramount significance. Similarly, trust, mutual collaboration and sense of mutual responsibilities are essential elements for the progress and positive outcome in educational institutes.

The current research is of significant value, as it sheds light on the basic elements of educational leadership, because everything depends upon leadership. It leads the reader towards a new dimension, which is the essential relationship between ethics, sustainability and leadership. Moreover, where it reflects the characteristics of Finnish education system, it also provides guidelines to the international educationists in making their respective educational systems more progressive and systematic.

Finally, the present study concludes that ethics plays a vital role in sustainability of educational leadership in Finnish education.

Key words: Finland, Education, Leadership, Ethics, Trust, Sustainability.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

DEDICATION

Parents are the ultimate role models for children. Every word, movement, and action has an effect. No other person or outside force has a greater influence on a child than the parents, and my parents who divined me to always be in incessantly inspiration to hanker for knowledge. They always guided me in each and every step to explore the world. They strived to achieve this honor of effectuating master degree. They were always curious to do one can, in making me and my siblings prolific and effective for a healthy society.

Dear Dad, Sweet Mom, and Dear Brother

I could never have done this without your faith, support, and constant encouragement. Thank you for teaching me to believe in myself, in God, and in my dreams. I specially, thank to my dear brother Adil Khalil who is the actual source of my migration to Finland for my studies. He was persistent in enduring to support and help me attaining this achievement. He made me able to study and to live in a new environment. He helps me a lot to cope with difficulties and issues being on my own, and to do not to lose the track of my own society and cross-cultural society as-well.

ABBREVIATIONS

PISA   Programme for International Student Assessment

OECD   Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development

PIAAC   Programme for International Assessment of Adult Competencies

GERM   Global Education Reform Movement

WCED   World Commission on Environment and Development

CONTENTS

1   INTRODUCTION

Education plays a vital role in the success of any country. It establishes a peaceful and progressive society with a bright and successful future. Finland is a small country, in both geographical scale and in respect of population as compared to the most of the other European countries. It boasts many distinctive characteristics such as least rate of corruption, crime and less financial crises while superb and excellent education in the last two decades where students from developed and developing world came to study.

The present study is an effort to analyze the concept of *Ethics as major element of Sustainability in Educational Leadership across Finnish Education*. According to Dossey (2003, p. 1435) Finland pulled the attention of entire world because of their student's best performance, in the measurement conducted by (PISA) programme for international student assessment (2000 and 2003). This achievement by Finnish students left the other European countries frozen with surprise, that how they got this marvelous achievement. This privilege of Finnish education attracted the research scholars all over the world to think and to explore the elements responsible for their success.

According to Kupiainen, Hautamaki and Karjalainen (2009, pp. 35-36), many national and international research scholars concluded their research tasks by determining a number of factors, contributed in this magnificent achievement of Finnish schooling system. Among those factors responsible for Finnish educational achievement are; equity, quality, teachers with highly prestigious pedagogy, strong parental involvement, relationship of school with community, strong chain of trust and well sustained and dynamic leadership. Similarly, it is demonstrated in OECD report, (2007, p. 16) that according toPIAAC (Programme for International Assessment of Adult Competencies) surveys, Finland is a top performing country in adult literacy. The results remarkably revealed that the new generation who studied in the same comprehensive schools in Finland is an absolute success.

Aho (2008) posits that the PISA successes were a significant encouragement for Finnish teachers and educators. Furthermore, Sahlberg (2009) explains that quality education is a multidimensional process, which is impossible to achieve through a straight line. Consensus, cooperation, trust, leadership, and democratic participation are the key elements of success. Hargreaves and Fink (2006, p. 38) state that Finland seems particularly successful in implementing, sustaining and maintaining policies and practices, that constitute sustainable development. They further argued that sustainable leadership makes everything easy to focus on all aspects of learning. It also creates the atmosphere feasible to preserve, protect, and promote the true essence of education.

In words of Halttunen (2016, p. 4) leadership in Finland can only be seen in the light of tasks distribution, or it can also be visualized by the process of influence, and good relationship among team members. Hargreaves and Fink (2007, p. 16) opined that leadership is the soul of an organization. It must be noted that, ethical sustainability in educational leadership enables Finnish schools, and their teachers to concentrate on developing their teaching and learning, as they best see it to be needed. Their leadership in education has increasingly followed the idea of ethical and distributed leadership.

1.1   Background of Finland's Education System

According to Kuusilehto-Awale and Lahtero (2013, pp. 09-10), success of Finland in education is its escape from the corrupting influences of GERM (Global education reform movement). This movement has infected most of the European countries, by introducing test based competition, standardized curriculum, and marketization in education. Most of the European countries were under this policy in education. Whereas, Finns totally ignored GERM and give different response to same challenge witnessed by PISA. Kuusilehto-Awale and Lahtero (2014, p. 6) further argued that since 2000, Finland has been the central figure for international leaders and educators, when the first PISA results were published. Finland was a top scorer in mathematics, science, and literacy. This

was totally astonishing and unbelievable news for the entire world and for the Finns as well. Finnish teaching and learning is not done for international testing. Their teaching has an objective, to make every single child a lifelong learner and valuable client of society.

In words of Niemi (2012, pp. 19-23), Finland's momentous and frequent success in the PISA survey has pulled the attention of entire world and has been a distinctive country among European countries, which ensures quality and equality in education for all. Sahlberg (2011, p. 2) contends that educational leaders and policy makers in different countries around the world, were inquisitive to know about the Finnish strategies and formulas of providing equitable access of education in schools. While talking about educational sustainability that how Finland achieved sustainable development in education, Kuusilehto-Awale and Lahtero (2013, p. 17) states that the culture of good governance, sense of mutual collaboration and strong element of trust gives autonomy to the local schools in Finland. Their concern and focus on special needs education, backed and support in achieving promising result. Therefore, educational excellences with the continual top performance in the PISA (2000, 2003, and 2006) results are seen as futuristic and visionary struggle of Finland.

1.2   **Problem Statement**

Leadership is a crucial element in education. It plays a vital role, and brings remarkable and positive consequences. Louis (2007, p. 3) argues that administrators and teachers should speak enthusiastically about the benefits of collaboration, trust, mutual support and ideas which help them to work smoothly and also help them to cope with difficulties.

According to Darcy (2010, p. 200) "crises of trust effect on power, and leads towards failure" so, lack of trust is mainly due to the negative influences of power, deception or irresponsibility. Similarly, Ravitch (2010, p. 2) was in the opinion that "doubts and skepticism are signs of rationality". Bass (1999, p. 191) was on the opinion, that trust is only the central element to measure the capaci-

ty and loyalty of leader. While talking about honesty and truthfulness Bennis (1989, p. 140) contends that true leader do not command excellence, he construct excellence, and a path of reaching excellence he must be a leader of good character. Excellence always starts from honesty, trust, and good character of leader who unite the entire team towards a common goal. In the process of being a sustainable leader, one has to be a person of honorable character which could only be achieved by moral values, trust, and truthfulness.

In addition to this Davis and Thomas (1989, p. 17) were in the opinion that we have not seen a good school with a poor principal or a poor school with a good principal. We have seen failed schools turned into successful and deplorably excellent schools turn down. In each case, reason could easily be traced by the quality of the principal.

Leadership is basically the focal factor of the institution. Supervision, leadership, and management are those elements which plays vital role in any development. Without the mentioned factors, none of the institution, organization or any other setup can survive. Therefore, when we talk about sustainable leadership, it is very dynamic, ethical and intellectual leading where the leader is highly responsible, trustable and has appealing interaction among his/her followers. It is not about particular organization or firm but it supports, helps, and works for the well-being of whole society.

In the light of above debate, present study aims to analyze the concept of ethics, and its role in sustaining the educational leadership. The current research is highly thematic; hence it majorly revolves around four important themes such as; notion of ethics, role trust, cooperation and sustainability as one of the pillars of educational leadership. Many critics such as Kuusilehto-Awale, Hargreaves, Bass, Ciulla, Davis and Thomas, Darcy, Fullan, and Greenleaf talk about the mentioned themes.

1.3   Research Questions

The current research aims to answer the following questions, with the help of systematic study of established knowledge.

1. What are the ethical dimensions and values aligned with sustainable educational leadership?
2. How to build trust and sense of duty as organic through sustainable educational leadership?

1.4   Significance of the Present Study

The topic under recent discussion is significant, as it sheds light on the basic element of education which is leadership, because everything depends upon leadership. It leads the reader towards a new dimension, which is the essential relationship between ethics and sustainable leadership. Moreover, where it reflects the characteristics of Finnish education system, it also provides guideline to the international readers, in making their respective educational systems more progressive and systematic.

1.5   Objectives of the Present Study

The present study aims to determine the elements such as ethics, the role of mutual co-operation, sustainable leadership and elements of trust as one of the pillars of Finnish education. It makes a strong sense of subjective and thematic analysis. The present study answers the above mentioned research questions in a comprehensive way.

1.6   Chapter Division of the Present Study

Chapter introduction deals with the introduction of the research thesis, and it deals with the concise discussion relevant to the present study. Further, this

section discusses problem area, research questions, objectives, and significance of the current research.

The section of literature review deals with the established works relevant to the current research. It discusses a number of areas related to the present study, such as concept of ethic and its various dimensions, sustainability and its role in educational leadership, different pillars of educational intuition, and role of elements such as trust, quality, and mutual co-operation in the context of Finnish schooling system. This portion of the thesis, mainly discusses two important areas under sub-headings which are the core of present study. These two major areas are ethics and sustainability in educational leadership.

In the chapter of research methodology, the researcher discusses the research methodology of the present study. The present study rests on qualitative research based on interpretation of human experiences, perspectives, and relationships of individual to other individuals. The nature of present study and the subject matter is phenomenological.

In the next section of the thesis researcher has analyzed and discussed the interviews of participants, about the concept of ethics as major role in leadership and about the element of sustainability in education. In this section the researcher has answered the research questions convincingly.

The last part of the present study concludes the discussion and reflects its findings. It also justify that the researcher answered the research questions convincingly, and concisely tells the outcomes of the debate in a comprehensive way.

2   LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1   **Ethics**

Ethics is a term more related to philosophical notion. Its anatomy is Greek word "ethos" which means custom or character. In this regards it concerns with moral and behavioral requirements. In other words, ethics is defined as a behavior, which is morally accepted as good one and right one, as opposed to bad one or wrong one. According to Trevino (1986, p. 602) in the context of an educational organization, ethics can be viewed as the practice of those values and issues, which are the most important to stakeholders of any institution. Ethics is the code of values and moral principles, which guides individual or group's behavior with respect to what is right and wrong.

In words Vairagya (2012, p. 56) the real purpose of education is to prepare the student not only to dare, but to defend the truth and reality. Mentioned critic blame the modern liberal educational format and says that the key purpose of education must be love, care, and trust. Every child should study those subjects or discipline, which he/she loves to study. Thus the education should not produce tension, but it is supposed to be the way of relaxation and peace.

Murphy and Enderle (1987, p. 126) were in the opinion, that a person with an ethical mind thinks and asks himself a question, that what kind of people workers or citizens do I want. If all the people adopt the mind set which I have, and do what I do, then how the atmosphere of country or society would be like. But the fact of the matter is that ethics is a very broad and comprehensive phenomenon, and there are no expressed views for worldly recognized ethics. So, it varies from region to region, country to country, but one thing is clear that everything which is immoral and against the dignity is unethical.

2.2   Ethical Leadership in Education

Ethics and education are essential and inter-related by nature. As ethics tells us to do right and good things, same is the purpose of education. In educational leadership we have to do right things whereas our ethics helps us to keep alive our values and character in making decision and doing things right.

According to Krishnamurti (2007, p. 5) in today's world the purpose of education is to earn livelihood, and this is a complete failure of education. Quality of education should not be understood, simply as an ability to read and write. For the quality of education, leader of school should have the utmost responsibility to prepare every individual a true human being, which is the right of every child. In words of Frank (2002, p. 81) "ethical leadership develops when, one examines his or her own inner character while making decisions". Ethical leader shouldn't have any gap between his actions and words. He should be a practical, and free from egoism. Ethical leader always play a vital role for the fame of institute. He builds trust and always works for public interest. He always considers himself, under the observation from inside and outside as well. Such thinking will never let him allowed for committing anything immoral.

Noddings (2005, p. 9) contends that most of the schools are not properly looked by the element of care. Young kids of those schools don't get the chance to grow themselves as they ought to be. Such condition is a major cause in educational failure. Furthermore, Kuusilehto-Awale (2014, p. 234) states in respect of care and ethical values, that leaders must ensure all the students in school are grown in such a way, that they care themselves, as they care of others in the society. Hence, the element of care in school leadership contributes and promotes trust, confidence, and ethics of teaching and learning in schools.

Cuilla (2005, p. 333) proposes, that ethical leadership in education transports the encouraging consequences, for team members and for school. It reflects and brings effectiveness and satisfaction in the follower's job. He further argues that "an ethical leader is an effective leader" and usually it is observed

that an ethical and trustable person make himself effective. Whereas Jones (1995, p. 869) argued that "ascetic person lives from inside and believes that being ethical leader is a personal excellence" therefore dealing with all the concerns is not important, but working intentionally and truthfully for public interest is important. Educational institutes with ethical leaders always focus to build the character of children's by promoting their mental, physical, and moral abilities which is their complete nourishment.

In words of Hitt (1990, p. 95) the criteria relevant for judging ethical leader includes; individual values, conscious intention, freedom of choice and character. If a leader is humble, playing role for the greater good, honest and fair, he is actually the presentation of true ethical behavior. Mentioned critic further argued that ethical sustainability could only be achieved when rights and duties are distributed according to the principle of equality. So, every individual will get due rights and duties, without any discrimination.

Lewis (1944, pp. 18-19), opined that if educational leaders learn their values and ethics with their heads not by heart, then they are just like a man without a chest. The heart can never take the position of head. Therefore leaders first learn the knowledge about values, and then apply it to everyday life. Mentioned critic further says, that every person is gifted with different qualities and different thoughts. So, mere the use of tactics will not be enough to govern the institution, nor the pre-planned rules are enough to solve any problem or dispute.

2.2.1   Characteristics of an Ethical Leader

In words of Wilhelm (1996, pp. 222-223), "the prominent characteristics of an ethical leader, is the ability to have a clarity of thoughts and vision. He should make everything clear to his subordinates, about their activities and roles for achieving goals". Leader of an organization should have self belief and he proves it through actions, by helping teachers and other team members. When all this happens, it automatically trickles down to students in the classroom. Therefore, the more you will experience such things in leadership the more you

will see effective teachers as effective leaders. Those communities are more likely to be successful in their visions, whose focus is on building trust based leadership in all areas.

According to Greenleaf (1977, p. 20) the essence of ethics in leadership is "service to followers is the primary source of leader". He further argued that there are some acceptable and unacceptable behaviors, where ethical behavior is defined as behavior which is good and right, and opposite to bad and wrong. Ethics is the code of values and moral principles, which guides an individual's or group's behavior with respect to what is right or wrong. Whereas, leadership is an art of persuading the followers and give them right direction to accomplish the goals.

Duffield and Mccuen (2000, p. 79) states that ethical maturity in leadership is very much important in education. It reflects how an individual approaches a problem, which deals with morals and values. Similarly, according to King (2008, p. 719) ethical norms makes a leader able enough to handle any critical situation in a typical way. Ethical consistency makes the personality of leader more reliable. It builds trust between leader and followers and handles the disputed situation with patience, by keeping in mind the safety of all the concerns. Mentioned critic further argued that ethical leadership is generally manifested by sincerity, trust, assurance, compassion, moral values, and endurance. These qualities may be learnt but ultimately these can be traced back from a religious foundation. So, those who assimilate faith at their work place are considered as ethical leaders, because ethics derived from a place of faith.

According to Kannair (2005, p. 51) followers learn about moral values, faith and care by examining the actions of leader. The more the leader "walks and talks" by doing and translating his ethics into action, the higher level of trust and respect he creates among his team members. Therefore an ethical leader will be automatically generated, when there is no compromise on moral values, by implementing and obeying principles of trust.

2.2.2   Responsibilities of an Ethical Leader

Kuusilehto-Awale (2014, pp. 229-231), suggests that an ethical and responsible leadership is the spirit of age. In her views, the term responsible means "answerable for one's duty or task in one's domain of work". Ethical leadership is also the name of "sense of responsibility". Starratt (2005) discusses that in an ethical schooling, each student must be valued, and educational leader should have the competency to undertake his area of work honestly.

According to Heifetz (2006, p. 80) the primary responsibility of an ethical leader is to deal with conflicts among followers, and to instruct them on the right way. Arguing further he gave an example, that leaders are just like the drivers of car, they focuses and keep their eyes at front and have a short glimpse on sides and back. They remain careful and active all the time, because any careless attitude may invite any accident at any time.

Ravitch (2010, pp. 2-3) states that very fundamental and necessary thing is to understand the education, purpose of education, leadership and ethics because "doubts and skepticism are signs of rationality". Mentioned critic further opines that success of any school could easily be traced back by the leader of the school, because leader is the examples of moral character and moral leader always start from self. Therefore, ethical and moral rules are necessary to govern a successful organization.

In Vairagya (2012, p. 39) opinion, educational leader must be caring and loving one in his school. Love gives no ideology but provides freedom. In an educational setting, neither parents nor teachers should apply any type of ideology on young kids. They should perform their duties as guiders and let the child free to commit mistakes and errors, because this is the best way to enable the child to learn in better manner. In the view of Starratt (2005, p. 124) educational leaders should motivate the young generation to be a dynamic citizens of the global community. They should perform, rather just to be observer. The mentioned critic suggests that ethical leadership is only possible, when leaders have moral values and know that how to serve the needs of humanity in today's world of advancement.

2.2.3   Role of Trust in Ethical Leadership

Rost (1991, p. 161) states that "the leadership process becomes ethical, when leader creates an environment of trust, where the entire team freely agrees that the future changes and developments are the reflection of their mutual co-operation". Ethical leader always makes his team committed to excellence through affection, mild tone, and trust. Attitude, behavior, and character are the reflections of leader's behavior. In an educational institute, any misbehave; misconduct or unethical action would defiantly hurt and affect children's character and self respect of followers. It ultimately leaves bad impression on public, and badly affects the fame of institute.

Darcy (2010, p. 200) states that ethical leadership is the ability to strengthen people in an institute, organization, firm or a group. Leadership and ethical values are essential to each other. Ethics is a systematic, virtual, and moral way of judgment. Ethical leader should be highly ambitious and worthy person, because crises of trust are the major problem in the way of leadership. "Crises of trust affects power" so lack of trust is mainly due to the negative influences of power, deception, or irresponsibility. Mentioned critic further argued, that crises of trust and lack of trust, can also be attributed to a shadow side of leadership. This shadow includes the negative influences of power, privilege, deception, inconsistency, irresponsibility, and misplaced loyalties. Such factors badly effect on leaders integrity and values. Therefore, the chief aim of an ethical leader is to serve the followers by keeping the element of trust (p. 201).

Gardner (1990, p. 77) states in his book on leadership that ''we should trust that our leaders will keep alive their character and values, which are not so easy to set according to laws". Lived values, and character of leader forces him about caring for others whereas integrity and honor also bring sense of tolerance and mutual respect. Leader, who always works within the framework of their values, could easily be called an ethical leader.

Burns (1978, pp. 1-2) opines that today there are lots of crisis in leadership, and the main issues in leadership crisis are intellectual power, lack of trust, decisions based on personal interest and nepotism. He further argues that it is the

most difficult phenomenon to understand in this world. We have failed to understand and recognize the real meaning of leadership, which is mostly happening in the world. We have failed to develop a consensus even to put a proper standard to measure the capacity and loyalty of leader. Therefore, the only solution is to trust and to be trusted.

2.3   Four Influential ways of Ethical Leadership

Hitt (1990, p. 98), described in his book, that there are four influential ways of how a dynamic and ethical person makes decisions are as under, and discussed below.

1. End result ethics: The moral justification of action is based on the consequences.
2. Rule ethics: The moral justification of the action is based on legislations.
3. Social ethics: The moral justification of actions is based on norms of society.
4. Personal ethics: The moral justification of action is based on the individual's decision.

End result, is the moral justification of action and it is based on the consequences of your actions. Therefore, decisions should be made by observing and considering the results of the work in advance because, human being faces many crucial situations where making any decision looks critical and problematic (Hitt, 1990, p. 100).

In rule ethics, the moral justification of the action is based on rules and legislations. In law, man is guilty when he violates the rights of others. But in ethics, he is guilty if he only thinks of doing so. Followers of this medium strictly follow the principles and rules determined by the society. Thus, under this ethical system, one can take decision by considering the rules strictly. (Hitt, 1990, p. 107)

Social ethics is the moral justification and actions, based on norms and the rules of surrounding community. Leaders are responsible for ethical norms and

codes of society, because they are the guiders of their employees (Hitt, 1990, p.114).

Personal ethics, is the moral justification of action, based on the individuals own consequences. In this ethical system, decisions are made according to the situation. One should make decisions which deal with personal perception of right and wrong (Hitt, 1990, p. 120).

The abovementioned four ethical systems by Hitt (1990) should frequently used by leaders during their leadership in any organization. An ideal leader should have the best knowledge of all these ethical ways because; the ethical system deals with the question and concept of right and wrong. Therefore the main purpose of education and leadership is to become critical, by observing the right and wrong, that what is helpful and essential for everybody.

According to Fullan (1999, p. 18) "deep and moral purpose of leader is to provide guidance, but they can also have blinders, if their ideas are not challenged through the dynamics of change". A leader of an organization keeps their values alive, and builds a unity of trust among team members. He further argued that ethics encourage the hunt of internal good, such as the virtues. Ethics also protect leaders from behaviors, based on external goods like fame, money, and power which look good, but worst in results. While talking about ethical sustainability, Rost (1991, p. 162) opines that ethical leader aims at the progress of institute in such a way, that public interests are not affected. He is always committed to excellence and never compromise on any action or deal, which affect the moral norms. In educational institute sustainability, stability, and good accountability could only be achieved when leader knows his values, obeys law of self-respect, and keeps in mind the respect and honor of his followers.

2.4   Eight Principles of Ethical Leadership can be effectively applied to the School Environment.

Ethics is an essential element in educational leadership. In recent age, leadership is based on moral and ethical values. The obstacle is to define, that what

are moral and ethical values and how we can measure and apply them in an educational setup. Similarly, this is also a question, that what traits are expected to be an ethical leader.

In this context, Marshall (2006, pp. 170-177), proposed eight principles of ethical leadership, which offers a strong and fruitful guidance for educational administrators. These principles have significant discussion about ethical leadership within the domain of educational institutes, particularly in the schools. Marshall's eight principles of ethical leadership are discussed as under;

Firstly, he argues about personal courage. In this principle the leader must have the courage to stand against the policies, which are deviating and challenging for the progress of institute or any organization. Challenges could be local, national, or even at global level.

Secondly, self control is important principle. In this regard an ethical leader must have the qualities, such as self disciple and integrity. It is understood that leaders are followed and copied by their followers. So, success of institutes lies in the success of leaders. Leaders should be role model, disciplined and balanced ones. The relation between the leaders and followers should rest on mutual respect and trust.

Thirdly, public interest ahead of self is an important element. It means that what is the best for students, and staff must be preferred by the individual interest of leader. Public needs and interest should be preferred to individual's needs and interest.

Fourth principle of ethical leadership is task and employee centeredness. As per this principle, the school leader must create a base of success from the strengths of teachers and staff who are directly involved with the students. Therefore, a successful leader should focus on the needs of students and teachers.

Fifth comes about the principle of recognizing talent. This is also essential for an ethical leader that he should be able to recognize the talent of followers. Besides this, the leader must analyze the excellence done by staff and students as a contribution for the institute. He should place them on the place where

they really contribute their respective role for the progress and prosperity of institute.

Requiring high ethics from everyone is also an important principle. A successful leader is not only self centering, but he also requires high ethics from others, particularly from his students and staff members. He should also involve the parents for gaining ethical values.

Seventh principle of ethics is sensitivity and understanding. It can be applied to the political, social, and economic domains of the school's setting. This is the most important principle to sustain and maintain equity and trust among staff members and students as well.

Finally, Inclusiveness is debatable principle of ethics. It is a sense of gaining trust and cooperation within an institute. Trust plays an important role in the progress of any organization. Inclusiveness needs to assemble all the stakeholders of school to get on one page for making and implementing decisions in school setting.

To conclude the whole debate in regards to above mentioned eight principles, it is understood the fact that firm ethical practices are inspirational to followers. Therefore, educational leaders need to adopt ethical practices for the progress of institutes and for getting fruitful result of their efforts.

2.5 Sustainable Leadership in Education

Sustainability in leadership is an ability to maintain organizational values in a more persuasive and affective way. It is the ability to continue a defined behavior indefinitely. Therefore, sustainability in leadership in the domain of education means a more systemic, rightly defined and enthusiastic leadership.
According to Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 5) "sustainable educational leadership and improvement preserve and develops deep learning for all. It spreads and lasts in a way that it creates benefits for other schools as-well. Sustainable leadership focuses on education and learning in a unique and unconventional

way. It has depth in itself and it really matters. It is helpful not only for learning and learners but it highly contributes in social formation.

While talking about the importance of sustainability in leadership Hargreaves and Fink (2003, pp. 3-4) state that sustainability in educational leadership is as important as education is itself. In an educational institution the existence and prevalence of true leadership is paramount. Lack of sustainability in educational leadership may lead the students to build a perception, helpful only in earning money and making them just economically strong. While social ethical and religious values are thrown back behind the curtain. In a society it is possible only through the sustainable leadership, that all the areas of learning for a student and for other individuals can be covered.

Hargreaves and Fink (2006, p. 125) asserted that "the ultimate goal of leadership in sustainability is to create a knowledge sharing schools, trust building societies and professional learning communities". Further they described four pillars of educational sustainability, which supports leadership and sustainable communities are as under:

1) Learning to know 2) Learning to do

3) Learning to be 4) Learning to live together

All these four pillars bring sustainability in leadership and sustainability in learning at school level. It also influences the whole society in order to make professional learning communities.

Senge (2006, p. 372) suggests that sustainable leadership is all about how we figure out the future that we truthfully wish. As on different stages we are opposed, we try as best as we can to cope, with conditions we believe are further than our control. Hargreaves and Fink (2006, pp. 127-128), foster a sustainable learning in a sense, that it depends upon the part of leader's ability. It creates conditions and environment where teachers learn to recognize the usefulness of their existing values and practices in order to advance their students' education. This could only be achieved, when leader treats their teachers like family members by giving them full autonomy.

Schein (1992) puts forward, that leader should possess the ability to share knowledge and support with ongoing learning process, which is the most salient value of sustainable leadership. Similarly, Razik and Swanson (2001) proposed that leaders, who work according to the needs of time, sustained their educational setup. Such leaders are no longer able to make the whole community a professional learning community.

According to Owen, Hodgson and Gazzard (2004, p. 284) "ongoing leadership in education requires freedom and self determination to develop and enrich school environment. It supports and guides their thinking, emotional well-being, creativity, dialog, openness, trust, and responsibility". Such elements are very useful and necessary for the progress and prosperity of any organization. Similar opinion given by Hargreaves (2003, p. 33) that sustainable educational leadership helps to provide an environment of deep and broad learning, for all students and for all the adults. Teachers who work with them are learning for understanding, learning for meaning and learning for life. It is a kind of learning that engage students in every walk of life such as intellectually, socially, emotionally, and spiritually.

In words of Fullan (2001, p. 4) every educational institute requires a leader to run the institution. It is obvious, that this statement further demands, that there are indeed functions of leadership, characteristics of leadership, ethics of leadership and tasks of leadership in other words there should be sustainability in leadership, which makes the whole team able enough to work collectively.

Bennis (1992, pp. 25-28), contends that for sustainable leader to start his work in any organization, should have four competences. The first attribute is management of attention by acquiring commitment with people. Leading a community to learn necessitates by obtaining a great sense of commitment from all stakeholders. Management of meaning is the second quality that leaders should possess. It could be carried out through, precise and clear communication of shared vision. Thirdly, trust and consistency are major determinants in reaching successful leadership. Lastly, management of self which requires leaders to know what their skills are, and how they deploy them effectively.

2.5.1   Characteristics of Sustainable Leadership

According to Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 8) one of the prominent characteristics of sustainable educational leadership, that it is not self focused. It keeps eyes open in the sense that it does no harm, and actively participates in social formation. Sustainable leadership unconventionally believes in cohesion, cooperation, and learning from verities. It avoids all those factors that may weaken the learning process. It also introduces such ways for research and learning, which are feasible and adoptable for both teachers and students. It reveals and polishes talent in early age rather than late career.

In words of Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 13) sustainable educational leadership respects past, present and future. Past is given its due respect and importance and same is the case with present and future. Future in this respect becomes more important because our outcomes are going to be shown in future. Only future is the age that is comparatively (with past and present) in our hands and we can control it. We can make better future suitable for learning and practicing, if we do focus on future by keeping in mind the past experiments and theories.

In addition to above Mitchell and Sackney (2009, p. 4) explain that sustainable leadership is all about shared and common beliefs. It is about ethics and collaborative work where leader and learning communities reproduce the spirit of continuous learning. They develop and sustain the whole environment through deep learning that happens through collaboration. They construct a school culture, based on shared consultation, common beliefs, principles, vision, values, and professional practices. Further they argued that the leader initiate ways to ascertain and nurture the effective conditions of organizational structures that induce others to participate in making professional learning community.

According to Bennis and Nanus (1985) leadership is a vital instrument to develop vision that can mobilize communities for a progressive future. In this modern era of the world, there have been so many changes are happening like increasing the global competition, the rises of difficulties, complexity, and the

demise of hierarchy and power. All of them are creating new and far-reaching challenges to all communities worldwide. Douglas, Burtis and Pond-Burtis (2001, p. 58) explain, that visionary leaders always played their roles like bridge for easy accomplishment. "Vision is an inherently communicative act". They further argued that in order to demonstrate leadership in this era of the world. Leaders required positive characteristics, strong vision, inspiration, trust and cooperation, strategic orientation, integrity, and organizational sophistication for achieving organizational sustainability. All these make a leader collaborative and highly skilled person, who can easily bring people towards common goal.

In words of Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 6) sustainable educational leadership is a shared responsibility that does not unduly deplete human or financial resources, and avoids in exerting negative damage on community environment. Sustainable leadership has an activist engagement, builds an educational environment and increase organizational diversity. It promotes cross-fertilization of good ideas and successful practices in communities by shared learning.

As Collins and Porras (1994, p. 31) state that sustainable leadership preserves and advances the most valuable aspects of life over time, year upon year from one leader to the next. They further remind us that all the leaders no matter how charismatic or visionary eventually dies. This is the only way that lasts. If not forever at least for many times, for years, but ideas never die. Sustainable leadership is an idea that once it has been implemented, the participants may come and goes, but the positive results would live long. It contains and always promotes the up-coming and necessary changes for educational betterment.

2.5.2 Sustainable Leader, the Agent of Educational Change

According to Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 1) "educational change is rarely easy to make always hard to justify and almost impossible to sustain. But once you accomplished, it works and keeps working". Mentioned critics further argued that sustainable educational leadership has a practical approach towards

past, present and future. It is controversial to those ideas based on emotional achievement with past. When it is a matter of education and learning, it becomes necessary to forget about old emotions and beliefs that are no more in use. It focuses and promotes new changes for the betterment of education. Sustainable educational leadership remembers past experience, experiments in present and makes a suitable platform for future (pp. 9-10).

Hargreaves and Fink (2006, p. 38) argued that Finland seems particularly successful in implementing, sustaining and maintaining policies and practices that constitute sustainable development in education. They further argued that Sustainable educational leadership makes everything easy to focus in all aspects of learning. It also creates the atmosphere feasible to preserve, protect, and promotes the true essence of education, where Finnish education system is true representation of sustainable education. While talking about the importance of leader in educational institute, Fullan (2005, p. 27) states that give me a lever long enough and I will change the whole world. For a sustainable change in education, Fullan confirmed that lever is a leadership. Furthermore, in words of Hargreaves (1997, p. 9) "change gives educators an opportunity to sit down as a group and collaboratively make changes without being forced". It is a collaborative work, depends on the leadership of others. It is like a wide garden where many colored flourishing fruits being plants and trees are grown. They are shadowy spread fragrance and also support each other.

A discourse on and an inquiry into how sustainability comes to be, Fullan (2005, pp. 14-15), gives eight elements to understand its depth and importance which are:

1. Public service with a moral purpose
2. Commitment of changing context at all levels
3. Lateral capacity
4. Building networks
5. Deep learning
6. Good accountability
7. Dual commitment to short-term and long-term results

8. Cyclical energizing and the long lever of leadership.

If a system is to be mobilized in the direction of sustainability, leadership at all levels must be the primary engine. The placement of these elements in any organization is an easy way of achieving educational sustainability. All eight elements are simultaneously feed feeding to each other. Therefore the following elements are not only beneficial for school settings but it also benefits the whole community.

Fullan (2001, p. 13) states that sustainable leaders should be nearly as concerned about the success of other schools in the district, as they are about their own school. Sustained improvement of schools is not possible unless the whole system is moving forward. Leaders being the agents of change should treat students, teachers, and parents equally. Their job is to display explicit, deep, and comprehensive moral purpose which should be worthy enough for organization and society. Above mentioned critic further states that Finland is continuously pushing his efforts in improving schools on a large scale. The continuous struggle of policy makers, teachers and leaders makes it possible and they acquired educational reform which is well maintained, consistent, fruitful and sustainable (p. 14).

2.6 Seven Principles of Sustainable Leadership in Education

According to Hargreaves and Fink (2003, pp. 4-9), sustainability in leadership is the ability of leader to recognize the difficulties of system together with human values that endorse sustainability. They presented seven principles in terms of educational change and development.

1. Sustainable leadership creates and preserves sustained learning.

In the domain of education, sustainability is of much significance. The very first thing in this context is to nourish. While talking about learning and education, it is to be remembered that sustainable learning matters, lasts, and engages the learners intellectually, socially, and emotionally as well. Sustaina-

ble leadership creates a fruitful environment which brings positive outcome. In other words, it preserves the sustainable context.

2. Sustainable leadership secures success over time.

Secondly, to sustain the success is really a big challenge for any kind of leadership. It's only sustainable leadership that maintains and sustains the achieved success for longer time. It is not about changing the conditions but it makes the things more permanent and dynamic. This sort of leadership spreads beyond individuals in chains. Leadership succession events are almost emotionally charged with feelings of expectations, hesitation, loss, or relief. Thus sustainable leadership plans and equips for succession. It demands high level of attention and succession can be achieved through grooming the successors.

3. Sustainable leadership sustains the leadership of others.

Sustainable leadership is not self centered rather it cares about the leadership of others as well. It polishes the successors and distributes leadership throughout the institute and organization. Sustainable leader keeps eyes open in the sense that it actively participates in social formation and think of other schools of community equal to his own school.

4. Sustainable leadership addresses issues of social justice.

Sustainable leadership also discusses, matters related to society. In this respect it reflects care about how communities can be persuaded to debate about social issues and it provides these issues with solution and justice. It acknowledges the elements which affect the school. For instance, the leader of one school should care and think about the need of other schools as well. This concern is basically a social concern which resolves social issues.

5. Sustainable leadership develops rather than depletes human resources.

It is such kind of leadership which provides rewards and outcomes. It really captures and appeals others' attention. It develops human and material resources rather decreasing them. Sustainable leadership knows well that how to take care of their leaders and how to make the leader able to care of them.

6. Sustainable leadership develops environmental diversity and capacity.

Sustainable leadership creates a well maintained environment. It cultivates and recreates the situation that stimulates the followers. It enables the people to prosper in their individual role as well as team members. It also creates excellence in learning, teaching, and leadership. In the views of critics (Hargreaves and Fink, Kuusilehto-Awale and Sahlberg) standardization and marketization in education are the real enemies of sustainability. Standardization and marketization claimed that there should be market like competition in education. Therefore, in the race of competition one can forget the real core of learning.

7. Sustainable leadership undertakes activist engagement with the environment.

In the struggle of standardization, all the traditional schools sooner or later will lose their image, but sustainable leadership is the only model which undertakes them to engage with the environment. Thus, sustainable leadership works as an activist for organizations to engage them with the environment.

These seven principles of sustainability in leadership, creates a dominant observation and a positive impact that a principal can have on teachers and most importantly, on student learning as well.

2.7 Symbolic link between Ethical and Sustainable Leadership

According to Owens and Valesky (2011, p. 55) the concepts of ethical leadership and sustainable leadership are fully intertwined. Each one is essential even necessary to achieve organizational success. Therefore, the organization having sustainable educational leadership is their focal part in continual growth of school. To seek sustainable educational leadership the school principal, teachers, parents, and school board, all of them must be committed and work together for the development of a school culture. It nourishes, develops and strengths their students with the march of time. Mentioned critics argued further that trust is the only element which brings people on the same page.

Collins (2001, p. 15) explains in his book "Good to Great" that "why some organizations make a quick progress day by day and others don't". Collins highlighted two key points in order to figure out the reason; 1) a culture of discipline itself creates and involves duality. On one hand, it requires people who make their progress constant and smooth in a working system; however, on the other hand, it gives autonomy and responsibility to the people of the working system. 2) All personnel and stakeholders in the organization constantly struggle for sustainable results, which is the actual aim and goal of organization.

In support of above mentioned statements, Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 11) talk about sustainable achievement that "it is a system, a culture and a place where the working bodies like principal, teachers and supporting staff work collaboratively with shared responsibilities and lead together". They further argued that to maintain and sustain leadership, schools must apply shared and collaborative initiatives based on trust and ethics. This is the real essence and holistic approach to sustainable leadership.

According to Kouzes and Posner (2002, pp. 18-22), there are different attributes of school leader which clears the road and helps in achieving ethical sustainability. Honesty, forward looking and role model are the attributes of a good leader, described as under:

The key to success lies in honesty. It can be described as fidelity of leader. The element of honesty plays a vital role in the sustainability and success of a good leader.

Secondly, the element of forward looking is mentionable. A leader must be forward-looker who doesn't stick with past but he remembers past experience, because by getting help from past and experiments in present one can easily makes a suitable platform for future.

A forward-looking leader is capable in promoting the growth of an organization. This vision can only be sustained with the help of motivation, trust and a shared vision among the team members.

Thirdly, a good leader is not only good for him, but he or she is a role model and a source of great inspiration for his followers. He should be such an influential leading figure, that his followers and colleagues willingly follow him. Above mentioned attributes are the great sources of ethical sustainability of an educational leader.

Hargreaves and Fink (2006, p. 191) also talk about ethical sustainability that "leadership develops and does not reduce human resources, it always renews people's energy" If ethics and values are not the center of leadership, then authority and power leads towards crises. Therefore, sustaining anything for an organization may be very difficult but not impossible. They further argued, that leaders who are careless always 'burned out' by excessive demands and start diminishing the resources. In such condition neither they have the physical energy nor mental and emotional capacity to sustain and develop professional learning communities.

World commission on environment and development (1987) introduced the concept of sustainability in such a way that human being has the ability to make the development sustainable, by ensuring that it meets and fulfill the needs of the present, without compromising the aptitude of future generations to meet their needs (WCED, p. 43). Whereas Bennis (1989) states that ethical sustainability in leadership is a distributed necessity and a shared responsibility. It benefits not just a few at the expense of the rest, but it benefits all students, schools, and whole community. He further argued that sustainable leadership recognizes and cultivates different types of learning, teaching, leading and provides different kinds platforms in fertilizing excellence.

Hargreaves and Fink (2006, p. 190) opined that the concepts of sustainable leadership may allow an organization to achieve competitive advantage toward continuous improvement. The real value and charm of sustainable leadership could only be achieved by using ethics and moral values as a major force in decision making process. If values and ethics are not the base in decision making process, then sustaining or stabilizing any organization may be difficult. In words of Deal and Peterson (1999, p. 87) sustainable leadership creates and es-

tablishes a set of values and principles. It purposes and strengthens the educational process in the school environment. Mentioned critics argued further that sustainable leader knows well that how to take care of their teachers and other leaders, and how to make teachers and leaders able enough to take care of themselves. Significantly and considerably it is the individual passion, and commitment of the leader that drives the values and purposes into reality.

2.8 Researcher's own Definitions of key Terms of the Present Study

Below are the researchers own definitions of key terms used in the present study which are; education, ethics, trust, leader and leadership, ethical leadership, sustainability and sustainable leadership.

1. Education

Education is a process of creating and then sharing of knowledge from one generation to another. In other words, it can be defined as a system or practice of teaching and learning. In a broader term, education can be termed as a conscious and unconscious process of telling and getting knowledge through which an individual can grow learning and realization. It can also be considered as a process of realization through formal or informal learning.

2. Ethics

These are moral principles which enable us to make the difference between the wrong and right in a specific society. In other words ethics vary from society to society, but people of a society usually have the same ethical values. Furthermore, ethics not only reflects the moral codes but ethical values incorporate cultural, social, political, and economical values as well.

3. Trust

Trust is a firm belief with convincing understanding and confidence on others. It works on different grounds such as educational, social, personal, and moral. In educational leadership trust can be defined as a regard or integrity of

thoughts which bears the elements such as respect, firm conviction, and sense of responsibility. Sincerity, hardworking and dedication to one's task are the key principles behind the word 'trust'.

4. Leader and Leadership

A leader is the head or representative of any organization. He has certain followers to lead in a particular area of work in an institute. A leader should have distinctive leadership qualities such as, character, moral values, trust, and sense of collaboration. Leadership is a basically those distinctive features or characteristics of a leader, which enable him to lead his followers towards their targeted goals successfully.

5. Ethical leadership

As the term ethics has been defined above, so an ethical leader is a person who possesses ethical values in his leadership. His styles of work reflect care for all those moral, cultural, social, and political values which the society has.

6. Sustainability and sustainable leadership

It is the ability to sustain something, effectively and successfully for the achievement of desired results. Sustainable leadership is the most important element of a leader in which he is able to sustain his leader with distinctive style by making progress in the organization.

3   RESEARCH DESIGN

This chapter talks about the research design and method, on the basis of which the present study dwells. An academic research at any level is a complete process of finding out the answers of the researcher's questions. Two main research methodologies are often used in academic research. Firstly, the quantitative research which is commonly based on statistics and mathematical calculations. Secondly, qualitative research sees the world as a unit which is active and ever changing with the passage of time. The present study is a qualitative research, rests on phenomenological approach, and analyzed through thematic discussion.

3.1   The aim of the Study

According to Darling-Hammond (2009, p. 18) in Finland, school leaders and teachers speak enthusiastically about the benefits of collaboration, trust, mutual support, sharing resources, and ideas which helps them to work smoothly. Therefore, the present study aims to determine the elements such as ethics, mutual co-operation, trust, and elements of sustainability in leadership, as one of the pillars of Finnish education. The researcher selected qualitative research with phenomenological proceedings, which makes a strong sense of subjective and thematic analysis. The present study aims to answer the research questions in a comprehensive way, with the help of systematic study of established knowledge.

3.2   Qualitative Research

According to Strauss and Corbin (1990, p. 17-18) "qualitative research creates findings not arrived at, by means of statistical measures or by some other

means of quantification". Furthermore, the authors pointed out that a qualitative research involves a "nonmathematical and analytic procedure that the result in findings derived from data collected by a variety of means". Whereas, in words of Björk (2008) the qualitative research usually includes in-depth interviews, subjective or document analysis, stories based and dialogic relations. Therefore, the qualitative research is a real subjective practice which is strong enough to enlighten the inside point of view before the targeted readers. In words of Bogdan and Biklen (2003, pp. 4-7) the qualitative researchers are mainly interested about the importance of participant's views and perspectives, try to make sense of their lived experiences and capture them as much as accurately.

According to Creswell (2007, p. 78) the most commonly used research approaches in qualitative research are narrative approach, grounded theory, case study, ethnography and phenomenological approach. Creswell (2009, pp. 173-177), further argued that qualitative research is all about the meanings, definitions, notions, characteristics, descriptions, and symbols. So, qualitative research is more subjective approach that aims to gain an in-depth understanding of human behavior and lived experience. The mentioned critic further argued that in qualitative research, if the researcher is studying individuals, then approach could be phenomenology or narrative. If a researcher investigates any activity process or event then it could be case study or ground theory Whereas, if the researcher studies about behavior or culture of individual then that study will be ethnography.

The researcher has used empirical part as a direct source for the data collection. All in all, a qualitative method of data collection, and phenomenological approach permitted the researcher to reach in an in-depth understanding, by conducting in-depth interviews of Finnish educational leaders.

3.3   **Phenomenology as Research Approach**

Phenomenological approach was born out in the writings of several German philosophers. Edmund Husserl (1859- 1939), was one of the well known writers who contributed alot in creating phenomenology as a research approach. As outlined earlier, this study seeks to discover the notion of ethics and sustainability in educational leaders and their lived experiences.

In the beginning, the selection among the various approaches of qualitative research was demanding and makes me think and re-think several times. As the researcher aims to understand the lived experiences and perspectives of Finnish educational leaders, therefore the selection of phenomenological approach for this study was worth being because, it restricts researcher from being bias and provides better understanding of the phenomenon under study. Current research rests on phenomenological approach, because the nature of the present study and the subject matter was phenomenological where in-depth interviews were used for data collection.

According to Creswell (2007, pp. 58-59), phenomenology is an idea without assumption, because it does not make judgments about the matter until it can be supported by information, provided by the participants of study. The mentioned critic further says, that a phenomenological research is related with the "intentionality of consciousness" because it states as individual's consciousness is indicated towards an object or problem. Such problems could only be perceived by investigating individual's experience.

In words of Van Manen (1990, p.9) phenomenologist's do not spend time to categorize, simplify, and reduce phenomena to abstract laws rather they are interested in our lived experience. In phenomenology, "perception is regarded as a primary source of knowledge, and that source cannot be doubted". According to Moustakas (1994, p. 105), in phenomenology the internal act of consciousness, and the relationship between the phenomenon's itself, and self is very important. Practices and experiences have been illuminated by comprehensive descriptions, vivid and accurate renderings of experiences, rather than

measurements, ratings and scores. Similarly, Welman and Kruger (1999, p. 189) state that "the phenomenologist's are interested in understanding the social and psychological phenomena from the participant's opinion. It attempts to understand the perception, perspective, and understanding of people in a particular situation or phenomenon. In words of Lester (1999, p. 1) phenomenological approach is directly connected with the paradigm of individual knowledge and subjectivity. It gives priority to individual's perspectives, interpretations and makes the approach more reliable in understanding subjective experience.

Last but not the least; the researcher was further motivated by the passions and convictions of leadership development. He was curious to know their contribution behind sustainable Finnish education. The researcher was thinking that the learning from their lived experiences will defiantly expand the scope of understanding. Therefore, it will be easy to know about the past, present state of affair, challenges involved and best practical solutions. Thus the selection of phenomenology was the most appropriate research approach for this study.

3.4   Research Process

In the beginning, the researcher was thinking to make this research a comparative study between the Finnish and Pakistani education system, but the limitations of research and time frame of masters degree programme did not allow him to conduct the research at wider level. Therefore, after a consultation and discussion with research supervisor, the researcher decided to limit his research only about basic Finnish education. The topic selected by the researcher for investigation was; *Ethics as major element of Sustainability in Educational Leadership across Finnish Education*.

As the researcher's aim was to understand the lived experiences and perspectives of Finnish educational leaders by conducting in-depth interviews, therefore it was not so easy for him to find Finnish educational leaders, who would be ready to share their professional life experiences about the given topic. Preliminary, the issue of the language to be used in the interviews remained

one challenge, while finding the right candidates about the given topic was another. Therefore, the researcher request to his research supervisor Dr. Leena Haltunen and one of his teachers Madam Lea Kuusilehto-Awale, to find and recommend him the right candidates for interviews.

The researcher forwarded them the detailed research plan and some explanations including literature reviews about the given topic. In a few weeks, researcher received emails from research supervisor and madam lea, that five participants, including two superintendents and three school principals are ready to share their knowledge and experience about your given topic, for the purpose research data. They also assure the researcher that all the participants can speak very good English.

3.4.1 Data and Data Collection

The present study majorly dwells upon the technique of in-depth interviews, which is used as an instrument, to collect data from individuals, working different leadership roles in different social units, such as schools and municipality. The aim of data collection is to try to ensure the differences in responses to questions, can be interpreted as reflecting differences and multiple angles of the issues in the domain of current debate. According to Silverman (2006, pp. 144-148), interviews are considered as a wealthy source of data collection, where the researcher would have an opportunity to recognize, that how people evaluate their complexities and success about the given topic.

In last week of December 2014, the researcher contacted two superintendents and three principals of different municipalities to obtain permission, in order to conduct interviews for his research. Once, permission was granted he contacted to his department for official approval to conduct the study. In the first week of January 2015, the researcher received approval from the institute and his supervisor to begin the data collection. Then, he emailed to all the principals and superintendents a letter of permission and questions of interview in advance.

3.4.2   Construction of Interview Questions

Every project and research requires a review of previous literature. While constructing the interview questions we think that the subject matter is unique, but someone somewhere has already published something similar. Therefore it's the review of literature that helps and guides in designing and validating the interview question (Jacob & Furgerson, 2012, pp. 2-3). The researcher constructed and developed the interview questions after a thorough review of previous literature and by keeping in mind the research questions of the present study. Wilson (2004, p. 65) contends that if you consult the literature relevant to your research idea, you will learn to know the easy way to approach your query of research. The purpose of this kind of interview was to generate and to figure out the detailed and comprehensive explanation of human experiences. Interviews were basically taken on the basis of questionnaires (see Appendix).

Before conducting the research interviews a pilot interview was attempted. According to Van Teijlingen and Hundley (2001, p. 1) in pilot studies the researcher gives a "test run" to his research instruments, and one of the advantages of conducting the pilot test is to know that the proposed instruments are appropriate for collecting data or not. The researcher has attempted the pilot study with one of the staff members of institute in order to test the quality of an interview, and to see that how the planned procedure of conducting the interview works.

3.4.3   Conducting the Interviews

In mid of January 2015, the researcher contacted research participants about the interviews, and they expressed interest for participation. In last week of January 2015, two participants and the researcher fixed a time and date to meet for an interview, which were successfully completed in the second week of February 2015. Meanwhile, the researcher got response from rest of the participants and date and time for interviews were fixed in March, which were successfully completed in the last week of March.

The researcher went to the offices of his each interviewee; all of them greeted him warmly and provided a relaxed environment for the discussion. Prior to each interview, the researcher discussed brief description and purpose of his study and then participants signed consent form agreeing to participate and allow the interview to be recorded. They were asked through oral interviews (face to face) to share their practical experiences and opinions in respect of key questions relevant to the present study. As Moustakas (1994, p. 34) states that "to derive a textural description of the meanings, and essences of the phenomenon" we should allow each participants to describe their perceptions, thoughts and experiences about the given topic.

The interview questions mainly revolve around the concept of leadership, and its essential elements such as trust, mutual cooperation, ethics, and sustainability in education. Approximately, each interview lasted about 45 minutes to one hour. The researcher recorded all the interviews and then wrote them down after a careful listening, and kept all recorded data confidential.

3.5   Data Analysis

According to Hatch, (2002, p. 148) in a qualitative research by doing the analysis process, researcher at all the time involves his own intellectual capacities, "mindwork", to create a sense of qualitative data. Whereas, in words of Rosenwasser, David and Stephen (2006, p. 2) in the process of analyzing data or text, it is fundamental to ask that what does the text means. An analysis part of research ought to answer "how something does, what it does, or why it is as it is". Mentioned critic further argued that data analysis provides the researcher a clear and focused lens to view and to easily understand the subject matter of the study. According to Patton (2002, p. 432) quantitative data deals with figures and numbers, whereas qualitative data deals with connotation and meanings. The most familiar sources of qualitative data include observations, interviews, and documents. Qualitative analysis of research transforms the collected data into findings and discussion.

As stated above, the present study is about basic education of Finland. Therefore, the researcher focused on finding the concepts of ethics, mutual co-operation, trust, and elements of sustainable leadership. Thus, the collected data of present study is analyzed by thematic analysis.

3.5.1 Thematic Analysis

Creswell (2009, p. 193) says in a qualitative approach, if the analysis is thematic then the researcher should include ideas, descriptions and perspectives of the research participants which are supportive to themes. Creswell (2007) and Moustakas (1994) opined that it is conventional, that a phenomenological researcher analyzes the data through the discovery of language and themes which emerge from the interviews of the participants in the study. The researcher chose thematic analysis because of its numerous advantages as it allows a novice researcher to learn about how to do qualitative analysis without any difficulty within a short period of time (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 97). According to Attride-Stirling (2001, p. 388) the thematic network of analysis splits the text and allows the researcher to search the clear explanations and to find out the reasons about hidden significance of the phenomenon.

3.5.2 Analysis of the Present Study

The researcher conducted the present research in order to analyze the element of ethics and its significance in ethical and sustainable leadership in the education of Finland. In this respect, the researcher interviewed five participants including three principals and two superintendents for sharing their respective experiences in the context of above mentioned area of debate. The researcher employed thematic analysis in the present study because thematic analysis is an independent descriptive approach in qualitative research. According to Vaismoradi, Turunen, and Bondas (2013, p. 400) thematic analysis is based on recognizing, reporting and analyzing themes within the data. Whereas, Attride-Stirling (2001, p. 387) states that thematic way of analysis is an emblematic

means of organizing and illustrating themes at different levels in different shapes.

The thematic analysis in this research is worth choosing as it is fundamental analysis approach in qualitative research. In a thematic analysis there are two ways to analyze the data which are inductive and deductive. According to Braun and Clarke (2006, pp. 83-84), the aim of an inductive approach is to go from specific information to general information. This is also called a data driven approach because in the process of coding the data comes from data itself. Whereas, deductive approach of analysis goes from general to specific information which is so called theory driven analysis.

The present study dwells upon the technique of inductive approach of thematic analysis, because this approach gives a clear picture and understanding of the data as compared to theoretical analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006, pp. 83- 84). The researcher started the data analysis by thorough listening of recorded data and start converting it into a written material. The process of interviews transcription was not only necessary to write, to organize and to arrange the data but to familiarize and to understand the real essence of data was important (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 87-88). Before the researcher declared his interviews transcription complete, he played the audio data over again in order to compare it with conversion to recheck and to ensure the accuracy of interviews transcription.

The researcher read the transcribed data many times for clear and better understanding, where every piece of information was taken into the account and examined carefully in the light of research questions. As Braun and Clarke (2006, p. 88) contends that after listening and transcribing the recorded data it is good to listen the recording over again and to compare with the written text. The next step was to exclude the information from written material that was mentioned by the interviewees but irrelevant to present study. The researcher excluded the irrelevant ideas from the transcribed data and actively immersed him within the data, started discerning, and categorizing the data and meanwhile noted down the important themes as-well.

The next stair was the process of coding where the researcher sorted out the important and valuable debate related to phenomenon. During the process of coding the researcher identify themes which emerged directly from data (Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2008, p. 83). While reading the transcriptions of interviews the researcher illustrated the text, and highlighted the text by using different colors and placed under the outlined themes. All the similar codes were grouped for further identification in order to remain on smooth track and for better understanding.

The researcher reviewed all the themes which emerged from data in order to assure him that selected themes are clearly defined by the data. As Braun and Clarke (2006, p. 91) state that it is necessary to ascertain, that dialogue (interviews) clearly defines the themes which you extract from data. The fundamental key areas of present study are being supported by the views of participants of the study. Here is an example from one of the themes that how the direct quotes by interview participants (Leaders) support the themes directly in the present study.

Theme: Role of trust and mutual cooperation.

> The most important and valuable way to lead from office is to develop good relation and interaction based on trust, because trust is the only element which gives you satisfaction that everyone is working efficiently (S-1).

> We provide a free and open atmosphere, where a teacher can be a student and a student can teach at certain time. We believe that if you trust others and others trust you then you don't have to do everything by yourself. Others will cooperate with you, and I think this is the essence of good leadership (P-3).

This research has analyzed total of four themes which emerged directly from the data and those themes are; concept of leadership, role of trust and mutual cooperation, ethical leadership in education and sustainability in educational leadership. Mentioned themes emerged after a thorough process which includes listening, transcribing and analyzing the interviews of the participants and also by keeping the literature review of the present study in mind. In the section of the findings, the researcher describes categorically all these themes as

much as possible in detail, where the researcher has drawn findings against each theme that readers can easily figure out, how these themes constitutes and contributes in order to answer the research questions.

4   FINDINGS

The process of analysis led the writer towards the summery of findings, where every single theme is categorically discussed. It clears the way and expends the lens of reader, in order to understand the phenomenon more precisely. Whereas, the chapter conclusion of this study offers a discussion about how the findings of this research could be used in both educational settings and in further research studies. Following themes are as under and discussed below;

1. Concept of leadership and its styles
2. Concept of sustainability in educational leadership
3. Role of trust and mutual cooperation
4. Ethical leadership and education

4.1   Theme 1: Concept of Leadership and its Styles

When the researcher asked the participants to share their respective views about leadership in the domain of education, they shared their thoughts as per their experiences. The interviewee named [1]P-1 argued that the important element in leadership is the ability to receive the feedback and to stay in contact with teachers, parents, and students in order to polish their moral values. Whereas S-2 opined that element of trust and consistency is very important, because students are the center of a successful leader. Further when P-1 was asked about his leadership styles, he answered that in our leadership we never think of 'I' we always think of 'WE'. We sit together, work collaboratively and then we make decision, because we trust each other.

The interviewee, P-3 was asked about his views, in respect of important elements of a leader. He replied that in Finland school leaders used to exercise the idea of shared leadership. In Finland, all the principals are like teachers, and they wants to be a teacher as well. By teacher he did not mean to teach in the

---

[1] P 1, 2, 3 indicate to Principal one, two and three.

class room, what he meant was to have discussion with teachers regularly through meetings. Similarly, when someone comes to his office for assistance, then he realizes that now he is doing his job that others feel the need of his leadership. Furthermore In leadership we gave free hands to our workers to make decisions by their own, to consider their responsibility, and bring new ideas as much as possible. S-1 also talked about the idea of shared leadership that in Finland leader is a boss and subordinate at the same time. According to him, there should be frankly meetings and discussions among team members. He further said that leadership is a position, and if someone feels assistance in any problem, we collaboratively solved the issue.

The idea of shared leadership by P-2 is linked with the views of P-3 who also talked about collaboration and shared responsibilities. In this respect P-2 was also asked to share his opinion and thoughts about his chosen approach of leadership, he exposed his thoughts as below;

> It's Interesting, in my opinion every single person is a leader, e.g. if I have 240 students and many teachers in my school all of them are leaders. In an organization one person cannot be perfect. So, mutual understanding, learning, sharing and discussions are the key elements to fulfill any kind of lacking or gap, because everyone have his own skills of leadership (P-2).

Similarly, when [2]S-1 was asked to share his view about maintaining his leadership styles, he answered that he always listen people around before making any decision. By doing this, he learns more and then he takes decision after analyzing his own perception, as well as the given opinions. S-2 also shared his point of view, stressed on the elements such as interaction, good relationship and the existence of trust. The following lines reflect his thoughts about leadership on his part.

> I mostly sit here in education office, and schools are around the offices. It happens very seldom that I meet teachers. I meet principals once or twice in a month so I have little time for teachers that's why I have to think very carefully that how can I lead, so that there happens something between teachers and pupil. I think one of the most important things is good interac-

---

[2] S-1 and S-2 are used as short forms for superintendent 1 & 2

tion, good relationship, and trust with principals, of course with teachers but especially with principals because I meet them bit more often than teachers. It's only the element of trust which ensures leader, that subordinates are discharging their duties accordingly (S-2).

S-1 shared his respective views, that leader's job is to ensure his team members that if the vision, mission, and our values are common then making any decision will be easy. It is also the duty of leader to ensure his subordinates that they are equally treated. When he was asked about the challenges or difficulties that he encountered during his work, then he replied as below;

> We compromise, if something occurs among us. We don't have big difference in our ethical values, it's quite same, and we care and trust each other. So, we never face such a big challenge or difficulty. We have same goal and different ideas to reach, and we make compromises on one others ideas and choose the best one to go with. In Finland especially in educational organizations we have to work together. So, if someone show bad attitude, misbehave or lack of trust in his/her job then we simply say goodbye, because we don't compromise on lack of trust (S-1)

Finally, S-1, S-2 and P-3 reflected their thoughts that everybody in school including teachers must work as a leader, because everyone is responsible, and in Finland, being responsible is the key element of leadership. Secondly everyone has skills and techniques to share; therefore it's the responsibility of leader to create a platform that every individual can have a chance to exercise them. P-3 further said that a leader must have clear vision about his goal and job description, because it's also his/her responsibility to let his followers to have clear direction to be followed.

4.2 Theme 2: Concept of Sustainability in Educational Leadership.

In Finland, sustainable development is the navigation of education. The aim of education is to develop a sustainable environment, where students can think about a sustainable lifestyle, and understand the necessary elements in order to build a sustainable future. While talking about sustainability and sustainable

leadership, and how it gets help from past experiences and uses those in present to make better future policies, P-2 argued;

> We have a five year plan policy. Once, in five year we do a big questionnaire to all the teachers and assistants, students and parents. We divide all the five years feedback and then we analyze it every year. By doing this way we get help from past in order to solve the present issues (P-2).

During talking about sustainable educational values, P-3 shared his opinion that a leader must clearly know his vision about his targeted goal. He should also let his followers know the direction, which leads them towards their mutual destination.

> We get certain values in our school and values are brave, creative, hard-working, responsible, and pioneer in some area. Very first day when students and teachers come, I tell them the values and vision of the school. Because people must know that what is the goal. We focus on sustainable leadership because our focus is to maintain and sustain good environment which is helpful for teaching and learning (P-3).

The point of view shared by P-3 can be linked with the notion given by S-2 who argued that a leader should have the ability to have clarity of thoughts and vision. S-2 further opined that ethics and sustainability in leadership can only be achieved by having strong chain of trust and sense responsibility because inspite of distance between office and schools, it is trust that makes one feel responsible and confident.

When S-2 was asked to tell that what is there in leadership to be sustained. He shared his views that a good leader has to know where the organization should go and to sustain educational leadership one should have the element of care and trust. He should also be very careful, that how and where to guide the organization. Similarly, In respect of sustaining leadership S-1 also argued that good leader is always hard for projects but soft for people. If any project which is hard to do, and we really need to achieve. We support and help each other, because we work as a team and distribute responsibilities. In respect of cooperation among teacher, student, and parent, S-1 further spoke as under;

If I think why we exist, the only reason we exist, because of pupils/students. If there won't be any pupil we all just go home. Now, what would happen to these children's if school leader would not do his work? It will effect on teachers and then on students. So, the progress of the teachers even the whole institute is related with the principal (S-1).

Similarly, S-1 was asked, to share his experience and point of view that how does he get help from past in the course of his leadership, he asserted, that he analyzes the things first, that where he went wrong. Then he thinks what should be done differently from earlier to bring out the new and positive result. Therefore, first to recalls his own analysis and then discussions with workers, supervisors, and colleagues. Because, these things reflect that what was the earlier situation and what changes need to be made. He also tries to get information from different sources like past experiences, studies, articles and books. Similar idea shared by P-1 that if others did the same and succeeded, then why wouldn't we? Therefore, this is important to find out the reason by thorough analysis of mistakes and work done to avoid the future failure. Whereas S-2 states that analyzing previous experiment, finding the cause of the failure to bring out a positive and new result is a good process. Through analysis of mistakes and work done, one may avoid the future failure and this is the real essence of sustainable leadership. In education, people believe that a headmaster or a principal is a great learner, because in the whole community thinks that these people are the most influential one. Therefore, they must be good learners because they are responsible persons of community. S-2 exposed his thoughts and experiences;

In Finland sustainability in leadership is about sharing ideas and positive change in education which should be helpful and conducive for teaching and learning, and make our students a lifelong learners (S-2).

Furthermore, while talking about the sustainability in educational leadership; P-2 and S-1 spoke about the idea of shared leadership. They said that every teacher is a leader and leader also works as teacher in Finland. We work with coordination, cooperation and trust. They also suggest that workers must be

empowered and provided a full autonomy to decide the things relevant to their description of job.

4.3   Theme 3: Role of Trust and Mutual Cooperation.

The researcher approached to P-3 and asked him about the role of trust and cooperation as significant elements in sustainable leadership. In his reply to researcher's question, he said that through building relationships, encouragement, appreciation, positive feedback, and helping each other educational leadership can be sustained.

> We do a lot of things together, because we trust on each other. We use humor to promote good relationship in which equality is a major thing that we equally treat everyone. We provide a free and open atmosphere, where a teacher can be a student and a student can teach at certain time. We believe that if you trust others and others trust you then you don't have to do everything by yourself. Others will cooperate with you, and I think this is the essence of good leadership (P-3).

The above mentioned idea is very much similar with the idea of S-2 that parents, teachers and students are a triangle in education and the bond to make this triangle strong is the element of trust, because trust plays an important role in building a prosper community. In this respect P-1 argued that it is important to have discussions that we do not have same values because we are different. Therefore, it's only the element of trust which brings us on same page. We also discuss with our teachers that what is important at school. Then they help children's and make them able enough realize that everything in school is important.

In this respect, S-1 shared his views about the role of trust and cooperation in sustainability. He argued that he tries to take workers specially leaders of the schools into the discussions. He said, that they organize some events, where all the principals and teachers participates, and there he discusses every major issue and about the future tasks. From such gathering, he gets some new ideas which are very helpful. He encourages the workers to develop new ways of do-

ing things, because it's important to find out the new ways of doing things. If any of his working members is doing something new, he appreciates him/her. Instead of discouraging, he also doesn't blame him/her for wrong doing, because when one does something new there is also a chance of success and failure. Therefore, he believes in trying best to achieve best.

> In our education system the most important and valuable way to lead from office is to develop good relation and interaction based on trust, because it's the only trust which gives you satisfaction that everyone is working efficiently (S-1).

P-3 states that there should not be punishment on failures, unless there is a deliberate attempt which is lack of trust, because trust is the key element of leadership in education. When the leader appreciates the performance of a good worker, he or she will work more hard to give best effort for the next time.

S-2 and P-1 equally emphasized the need of trust, sense of responsibility and cooperation for the growth of ethical and sustainable leadership. They argued that leader must have the ability to interact with the teachers and create an environment of mutual cooperation and trust, which are the key elements of leadership. P-1 also suggested that a good leader must not take the sudden decision without the consult of his teachers and followers; rather he is supposed to put the situation before them and let them suggest their opinions and views, and this is the essence of cooperation. The interviewee was also asked that how leadership does create a good and enabling environment which is conducive and helpful for an organization or for community, he answered the researcher's query as below;

> I have to show the values every day when I meet with one teacher or one student or group of teachers or group of parents, I have to keep in my mind the moral values, then I step by step lead them like walking the same route and ensure them through dialogues and conversation (P-1).

While talking about the significance of trust and mutual responsibility S-1 argued that, trust and co-operation are the core elements in education and leadership. P-1 and S-2 also gave similar opinion about the role of trust in leadership:

that in Finland a leader gives and gets trust and work like team with mutual responsibility because, trust is a backbone of successful educational leadership. S-2 further spoke about trust as under;

> It is also important that principals should say to me, this does not work; this is not well, can we do something in different way. That is trust, and without having trust they will never say such thing. So, I would say that without the element of trust it is just like a theater where things change in no time (S-2).

4.4   Theme 4: Ethical Leadership and Education

As ethics plays vital role in successful educational leadership. While talking about ethics and ethical leadership, interviewee P-1 argued that ethical leadership is like taking the responsibility. It's all about shared values and trust, and it creates consistency in your work. Taking feedback and asking for feedback is also very much important in leadership. Furthermore with regard to ethics in education, P-2 argued that every child is unique; every child has his/her own needs. Therefore, ethics in educational leadership is about seeing the child first, fulfilling his/her needs, and to think what is best for him/her. He further debated that "we have shared leadership with distributed necessities. In our meetings and discussions, every one shares his opinion, and valued the other's opinion".

When S-1was asked to share his views about ethics and educational leadership he shared his view as under;

> If I think of ethics, there is a very strong connection between ethics and our pupils. Behind our decisions, it's the ethics which puts you on track for right decisions, E.g. In sharing resources; we think how it is beneficial for principals, for teachers, especially about our pupils. Ethics is our values, that how we act, and what is behind our actions (S-1).

S-1 was further asked that being ethical leader how he promotes good relationship. He answered, that the essence of question is how my relationships are with principals. If principals are not good in their job, how it is possible that they will be good with their teachers, and then how can I believe that teachers

will be good with pupils. Therefore, the top leader should be some kind of role model for principals, and then principals should be role model for teachers, and then teachers for pupils. This bond or chain of relation could only be built with ethics and trust. For good relationship, we provide full autonomy to our principals and teachers to do work on their own way, and this thing really builds their confidence and trust.

S-2 was interviewed to share his point of view about an ethical leader in promoting good relationship among team members. His views were similar with S-1 that we have organizational models. If principals are not loyal with their job, then how can I believe that they are good with teachers? So, by this way pupils learning will badly affected. Further, he spoke that we give full autonomy to our principals and teachers to do work on their own way because they trust on each other. S-2 was also asked about the lack of expectation, on the part of teachers and students, he responded the interviewer's query through following lines;

> We have quite big organizations, and we think that trust is important but if you lose trust. Like you have done mistake and you want to hide. I ask you hey, is it really that happens? You say no. That kind of happening destroys the ethics and trust. It's not a danger if you do mistake. If you are honest we can always fight to find solution. We can look at, to find the solution but if you are not honest, you hide your mistakes and lie. Then even it's very hard to say, but we have to say that you should leave the organization. What so ever the situation is, we cannot compromise or work without ethics (S-2).

So, his spoken words clearly show that ethics is something essential for every organization. He means that non-existence of problems or issues have no importance. But, facing and solving those problems or issues with honesty and cooperation is really remarkable. Similarly, a large organization is like a home where everybody is a family member, and everybody owns the organization by keeping in mind the element of trust, cooperation, sense of responsibility and honesty.

S-1 and P3 equally stressed on the elements such as trust and mutual responsibility as working principles of ethical leadership in education. They

argued that these elements are like backbone for ethical leadership and education. S-2 states that leader must be pragmatic one who can decide in any situation. He further argued that educational leaders mostly sit in their education office, and met with principals once or twice in a month and don't have time to meet teachers. Therefore, it's our ethics and trust which gives us satisfaction.

The experiences shared by all the participants reflects similarities about all the mentioned themes, as they stressed on the point that everybody, including teachers, should work as leader because such sort of thinking create a sense of responsibility and cooperation. Beside this, all of them spoke about the role of trust in leadership, as only trustable followers are given the chance to decide the things and to share the opinion.

All the interviewees, agreed on the point that teacher plays a vital role in the development of student and of course parents are equally important. Parents should actively participate, and there should be a direct connection between parents and teachers to be well aware about pupils. Teachers are very essential and heart of education. Teachers should be given autonomy to create a school's culture, which should be superb for pupils learning, and parents equally co-operate. But, again if the top leadership is not working well or don't know how to lead, teachers work will start destroying and it does not happen today or tomorrow. Slowly, the organization will start moving towards decline and learning process will be effected seriously.

All the participants shared their respective views about the notion of ethics as major element in the construction of sustainable and ethical leadership. They stressed on the significance of ethics in the domain of education. They emphasized the need of trust, sense of responsibility and cooperation for the growth of sustainable leadership in education. Further, they unanimously agreed that elements such as trust, cooperation, and sense of responsibility are key elements to strength educational leadership. The discussion of the participants shows that ethical values and the element of sustainability are backbone for the success of educational leadership.

5   DISCUSSION

The present study was an effort to explore the concept of *Ethics as major element of Sustainability in Educational Leadership across Finnish Education.* It has majorly debated the element of ethics and its role in sustaining the educational leadership. The study has discussed elements such as trust, cooperation, and sense of responsibility as essentials in the course of ethical and sustainable educational leadership. In this regard, the current research has answered the following research questions.

1. What are the ethical dimensions and values aligned with sustainable educational leadership?
2. How to build trust and sense of duty as organic through sustainable educational leadership?

The present research involved the elements of ethics and sustainability in Finnish educational leadership. It was discussed by all the principals that for a leader, trust and equality in treatment with fellow workers are an important element. All the team members should have clear and direct interaction, sense of co-operation and strong chain of trust among each other. As Rost (1991, p. 161) states that a leader creates an environment of trust, where the entire team freely agrees that the future changes and developments are the reflection of their mutual co-operation. A good leader should praise workers if they do good job and he should also help them in figuring out issues, and in finding solutions for those issues.

All the superintendents argued that mutual collaboration and cooperation are very much important. These things bring motivation in employees and enable them to do their best in a good environment. Two-way communication, giving them respect, and giving importance to their ideas and suggestions helps sustainability in leadership. Sustainable leader makes all the employees realize that they all are doing the same job, only their responsibilities are different. The

above mentioned point of view can be linked with the notion given by Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 11) who talk about ethical and sustainable leadership that it is a system where all the working bodies like principals, teachers, supporting staff and parents work collaboratively. For this approach trust plays a key role because trust may answer many more questions in this regard; as it is involved in ethics and morality. All workers should have an opportunity of an open discussion where they could discuss major issues and may get new ideas and new ways of doing things which are helpful.

It was discussed by all the participants that parents and other concerned people in the society play an important role in educational development, in this regard every month a meeting should be conducted and parents should have an open excess to teachers in order to know about their children. Ethics are a moral value which include trust mutual understanding and respect for others are very important to treat others, as you want to be treated therefore friendly atmosphere in educational institute is very important for smooth learning. As King (2008, p. 719) states that ethical norms and dimensions makes a leader able enough, to handle any critical situation in a typical way. Therefore, if problems are occurring by staff members then the leader should discuss and explore what is the reason and why teachers are not cooperating. Law and rules bind everyone to perform his duty accordingly, otherwise he may get punished. Before any decision warnings should be given and compromises should be made if a leader encounters any challenge or difficulty.

Similarly, teachers and students should be demonstrated about values and vision of the school that they must know what our goals are. By organizing events within the school or sometimes among schools creates a sense of cooperation and trust. This visionary idea can be linked with the views of Wilhelm (1996, pp. 223) who argued that one of the prominent characteristics of a good educational leader is the ability to have a clarity of thoughts and vision that where exactly to go. Leader can promote good relationship among teachers and students by arranging different events. These events also provide feelings that

they own their school. All these things mingled with appreciation and helping each other and also build trust among team members.

The important ability of sustainable leadership is to get feedback, by keeping in mind the moral values. Whereas trust also plays an important role in getting feedback because it is the only element which ensures you that your leadership styles are understood, recognized and practiced by your sub ordinates. As Lewis (1944, pp. 18-19) opined that if educational leaders learn their values and ethics with their heads not by heart, then they are just like a man without a chest. Therefore leaders first learn the knowledge about values by heart, and then apply it to everyday life.

Leaders should motivate the workers to do their jobs willingly and everyone should be aware of the value set by the institution. Every task should lead towards the desired destination and problems should be handled through table talks. All the interviewees provided further details that the Finnish education success is dependent on trust in its teachers and leaders as well, because leaders set an environment for them to enjoy full professional autonomy. As Cuilla (2005, p. 333) proposes ethical sustainability in leadership transports the encouraging consequences for team members and for school. It reflects and brings effectiveness and satisfaction in the follower's job.

A leader is to keep teachers', parents' and students' opinions in mind while making decisions. Further in order to create a good environment in school setting, a leader must keep in mind the moral values. Further, parents' students' and teachers' should be involved and concerned about discussions and decision making arguments regarding studies. Apart from this, a leader, students, and teachers may sit together and have discussion to create good relation among each other. In words of Hargreaves (1997, p. 9) change gives educators an opportunity to sit down, as a group and work collaboratively without being forced". This could only be possible by having a strong chain of trust among team members.

Students are the most important area in all teaching and learning process, because everything done by any leader and teacher is for students. Principal

should have behavior that teacher do not feel hesitation to tell a lie, if they commit mistake. But if anything found immoral, unethical or lack of trust where teachers or students do not live up to expectations, they may be said good bye. According to Darcy (2010, p. 200), lack of trust is mainly due to the negative influences of power, deception or irresponsibility. Similarly, Ravitch (2010, p. 2) opined that doubts and skepticism are signs of rationality. Therefore, the chief aim of an ethical leader is to serve the followers, by keeping in mind his moral values and the element of trust.

Professional leaders, high quality teacher education, and also pedagogical trainings are strengths of Finnish education, where teachers are not examined during the service but provided adequate supports to expand their professional development. As Hargreaves and Fink (2006, p. 38) state that sustainable educational leadership makes everything easy to focus in all aspects of learning. It also creates the atmosphere feasible to preserve, protect, and promotes the true essence of education, where Finnish education system is true representation of sustainable education.

The interviewees were of the view that in Finland parents do not have to think or worry about choosing the school for their children because, all the schools in each locality are of the same quality and funded publicly. In words of Kuusilehto-Awale and Lahtero (2013, p. 17) the culture of good governance, sense of mutual collaboration and strong element of trust gives autonomy to the local schools in Finland. All the interviewees stressed on the elements such as ethics, trust, moral values, and cooperation as key elements in their style of leadership.

Trust, moral values, and sense of responsibility are very important in sustaining leadership. Sometimes it's good to get help from the past history: it is hilly important to talk with a person who has done the same job before. Clear objectives and destination should be kept in mind but a leader should be flexible. Hargreaves and Fink (2003) suggest that we can make better future, suitable for learning, if we do focus on future by keeping in mind, the past experiments and theories. Again clarity in destination is important because there is a strong

connection between teacher and pupils. There is a shifting of ethical instructions by a systematic process, that is a superintendent who is a role model for principal and principal to teachers and similarly teachers to pupils and for the development of this process trust, moral values, and mutual responsibility are very important. As Kannair (2005) states that ethical leader will automatically generated, when there is no compromise on moral values, by implementing and obeying principles of trust.

A leader should work hard for good will and development of students, because all the efforts are for students and students are the only reason that everybody exists. Next importance is given to teachers as they are close to students more than anyone else and play vital role in student's developments. There should be conversation between principal and educational managers and responsibilities should be transferred to teachers while keeping in mind the element of trust and cooperation. The discussion of all the participants shows that ethical values and the element of sustainability are backbone for the success of Finnish educational leadership. Sustainable leader has a great sense of responsibility, cooperation and builds trust among his followers. As Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 8) opined that sustainable educational leadership is not self focused. It keeps eyes open, participates in social formation, and believes in cohesion, co-operation in learning from verities. In Finland, school leader is like a head of family who lead the followers safely, with trust, moral values, cooperation and let them share their views and opinion openly freely.

Below are the consequential points (key motifs of discussion) about the findings of the present study. These points are also drawn after a careful analysis of the participants' shared views and profound study of literature. They reflect the suggestions and conclusions drawn by the researcher himself.

1. Ethical aspects in leadership are of paramount significance as they play a great contribution for successful and sustainable leadership.
2. A leader may ensure the practice of ethical leadership by providing his staff members his personal practical module. Because a good leader is considered to be the one who presents himself as a role-model for his fol-

lowers where he lets his followers to imitate him in the course of their respective tasks.

3. Participation of parents and other social parties are important for better nourishment of pupils, because a successful educational institution has a triangle which consists of parents, teachers, and students. Such sort of a triangle provides trust based on the coordination among these three parties.

4. Trust and mutual co-operation are fundamental for success. They create an environment of ownership where everybody owns the institution and works for it with full dedication. Trust is like a backbone of the institution, and it is not important but necessary for sustainable education system. If there is lack of trust among the working fellows or between the leader and followers, then there will be a sphere of doubt and uncertainty which shall lead them towards failure.

5. Dialogue is a good strategy to deal with challenges but in case of trust, warning or punishment can be applied. In other words a good leader must be very pragmatic by having different ethical dimensions who knows well, how and what to decide as per the need of hour.

6. A leader should have the ability to receive feedback, and should be able to take responsibility. The receiving of feedback, institutional methodologies, strategies and maintaining leadership style vary from official to official on the basis of their job and destination in the department. So, a successful leader is supposed to have complete knowledge about all these dimensions. He should be consistent in implementation and in decision making. While having and acting upon these qualities, his focus should be on students' learning. All these mentioned characteristics are supposed to be in incorporated in the leadership of a successful leader.

7. Care for moral values and respect for others is very much important because the core objective of learning or education is to value others and to care for the right thing. Moral value may vary from individual to indi-

vidual of the same community. Therefore, an ethical leader has to think with multiple dimensions by keeping the respective angles of morality.

8. Leader should give autonomy to his teachers that they can look for something new and useful. He should let the followers to lead sometime if their leadership sounds better in those moments.

9. Frequent meetings and corresponding are necessary for the smooth running of schools, where teachers and workers should be free to look for something new, and equality among the workers is very necessary.

10. Good interaction, relationship, and trust between superintendents, principals, teachers, parents, and students can surely lead towards sustainable success. There must be a chain of coordination among them so that the targeted objectives can be obtained easily.

6   CONCLUSION

The conclusion drawn by the researcher based on the discussion of five participants in the portion of analysis and discussion of the present study. Further, it is also developed by keeping the literature review in mind. The present research has successfully shown that leadership in education needs the element of ethics for sustainability. All the interviews reflected the need of these elements in educational leadership. According to each interviewee the elements of ethics, trust, and mutual cooperation are backbone of sustainability in educational leadership and all these elements are observed by every successful leader in his organization. Gardner (1990, p. 19) contends that we should trust that our leaders will keep alive their character and values which are not so easy to set according to law but very important and useful for organizational success.

From the interviews discussed in the chapter of Findings and Discussion, it can be said that ethics plays an important and key role in the development of Finnish educational leadership. It creates an educational leader who has the capability to govern the educational organization with sound judgment, cooperation, and mutual trust. The study suggests that a leader being the governor of the institute should be a role model for all with the ability of sustainable leadership. In the words of Douglas, Burtis and Pond-Burtis (2001, p. 58), a sustainable leader is someone who crafts an idea, motivate people and play his role like bridge to act collectively in order to achieve the goal.

The study shows that friendly environment makes the learning easy and joyful. Good interaction, relationship, and chain of trust between superintendents, principals, teachers, parents, and students can surely lead the institution to progress. Rost (1991, p. 161) states that an ethical leader always makes his team committed to excellence through affection, mild tone and trust. Therefore, in education trust is like a backbone in institution and it is not important but necessary for sustainable development.

In the present study, the data collected from all the interviewees in respect of mentioned topic, reflects that each of them agree on the point that our school leadership is dynamic and sustainable due to a number of factors and these factors include; freedom of expression, strong chain of trust, moral values and educational triangle; where parents, teachers and students have a strong sense of mutual cooperation. Talking about the importance of mutual cooperation and trust Hargreaves and Fink (2003, p. 11) state that sustainability is a system, a culture and a place where the working bodies like principal, teachers and supporting staff work collaboratively with shared responsibilities and lead together. The study majorly involves with the discussion on the elements of trust, ethics, responsibility, and sense of cooperation in Finnish educational leadership. As all the participants state that our schools are like a home where everybody is a family member and everybody owns the organization by keeping in mind the elements of trust, cooperation, sense of responsibility and honesty.

It is crystal clear from the present study that ethics plays an important role in sustaining educational leadership. The thoughts shared by abovementioned participants reflect that leader is main pillar of any organization. So, he/she should have ethical values and must be a pragmatic one, who has the ability to understand the situation and takes sound decision. Beside this, the element of trust, mutual cooperation and sense of responsibility are those working elements which are essential in educational organization. As Cuilla (2005, p. 333) proposes that ethical leadership in education transports the encouraging consequences, for team members and for school. It reflects and brings effectiveness and satisfaction in the follower's job because ethical leader is an effective leader, and usually it is observed that an ethical and trustable person makes himself effective.The study also shows that ethical values trust, mutual cooperation and sense of responsibility are essentials in the development of educational leadership.

Finally, the researcher concludes the discussion by suggesting that ethics plays a significant role in educational leadership. Moreover, elements of trust, cooperation, and mutual responsibility are the key principles of sustainable

leadership. The researcher suggests the educational leaders to follow the debated elements such as ethics, trust, cooperation, and sense of responsibility for successful educational system. The present study also suggests that all the mentioned elements are basic and important keys of Finnish educational leadership. This claim is practically and convincingly proved through the discussion of all the participants of the present study as well. After analyzing the views shared by each participant, it is clear enough that ethics plays a vital role in sustaining Finnish educational leadership, and this statement is the very outcome of present study.

6.1   Review of the Quality of Present Study

This chapter talks about the credibility, transferability, dependability, conformability, and multiple ways to establish the truth and to uphold the quality of the present study. Research work is a systematic investigation of materials, ideas, and perceptions which aims to establish the claim by reaching to a logical conclusion. It is more intricate and complex writing rather than simple information or statements. Therefore, a researcher comes across with many barriers sometime. A commendable study is the one which is theoretically and conceptually convincing, because such things are the required quality of qualitative research. According to Tracy (2010, pp. 840-841) presentation of theory, sufficient amount of data and right selection of research methodology is the essence of qualitative research. Therefore, this research is also designed in the same manner where researcher used profound and well supported literature and standard methodology to bring insights from educational leaders who were the center of the system.

According to Shenton (2004, pp. 64-70), for an authentic research a number of elements are essentials such as credibility, transferability, dependability and conformability. Credibility involves with the claim that the results or outputs of the research are believable and logical against the claim topic of the research. Transferability refers to the context in which the research can be transferred to

other areas and this transformation is decided by the reader of the research after going through it. Dependability deals with the findings of research as consistent and could be repeated. It is measured through the standards by which the research is conducted. Whereas conformability involves with the query such as how the research findings are supported by the data collected. As Golafshani (2003, p. 601) states, quality of research is linked with a degree of reliability, and validity of the collected data and its analysis. Correct recording of data and logical interpretation of data increase the reliability, and validity of qualitative research.

The researcher enjoyed a lot while working on the present study as he had to listen different participants with their valued opinions and experiences in respect of current research topic. All the participants of the present study welcomed the researcher enthusiastically and warmly participated in interviews. While talking about the above mentioned elements such as credibility, transferability, dependability, and conformability the researcher had no hesitation in writing that the present study fulfills all these essentials elements which are essential for the validity and authenticity of the research work.

The researcher presented himself with a good discipline to his interviewees and tries to behave as much as possible as a professional during all his interviews to stay away from the risk of being treated with dislike and contempt. Such professional behavior influenced researcher's interview participants to give him relevant and genuine information about the present study (Patton, 2002, p. 552). The present research is credible in the context that it is believable and logically constructed. It has been reviewed by research supervisor, teachers, and seniors at their best level. As Creswell and Miller (2000, p. 129) describe that the peer review and consultation as an evaluator of the research work or the trail of the research work by someone who is familiar with the phenomenon guides the researcher.

Secondly it contains the notion of transferability, because it can be transferred or referred to other areas of debate relevant to the present study, such as the concept of ethics and sustainability in teaching, the contribution of parents

in the educational growth of their children and so on. Further, the present study depends upon a defined and standard methodology, so it has the element of dependability as well. The findings and discussion of the present study were logically constructed with the support of arguments in the light of collected data. It was basically thematic work that primarily rests on the discussion of the leaders interviews. A significant citation, by Healy and Perry (2000, p. 123) that report from collected data can be verified and supported by data taken as literature reviews. Thus, the present study bears the strong element of conformability as well.

Finally, while working on present study the following ethical principles were taken into the consideration, such as honesty, respect for intellectual property, integrity, objectivity, and carefulness. The researcher has also avoided all those elements which were against the codes of research, such as plagiarism, deception, and professorial imitation. By concluding, the researcher has tried at his level best to observe all the important elements/notions of research work.

6.2   Recommendations for Future Research Directions

As a Master's degree student, I had an obligation of following the academic requirements of the university, and had a limitation of time and resources as well. Most importantly, the research was focused only about the role of *Ethics as major element of Sustainability in Educational Leadership across Finnish Education*. Thus, there is plenty of room to further extend this research. Within the defined frame of the present study, the researcher had to limit it and the limits of this academic research did not allow, studying the entire factors and complexities of ethics as working element in sustaining educational leadership in everyday practice in schools. However, the present study being restricted within the basic education level has been unable to examine the whole Finnish educational leadership and the higher education of the country. On the contrary, it has only debated in the context of earlier mentioned elements such as ethical leadership and the notion of sustainability.

The present study is categorically discussed in the context of ethics as a major element of sustainability. The research is basically thematic study and it involves with basic themes such as trust, cooperation, sustainability, and sense of responsibility as essentials in the course of ethical and sustainable educational leadership. The current research is qualitative, mainly depends on phenomenological approach. It majorly dwells upon the technique of in-depth interviews. It has talked about the concept of educational leadership in basic education system. In the context of leadership, it has only debated elements such as, ethical and sustainable leadership in education. The present study, as mentioned earlier in research limitation, has narrow area of debate. Therefore, it suggests a number of areas for future research work related to the current research topic. For instance, the researcher can explore other elements such as teachers' role in sustainable teaching, the concept of ethics on the behalf of teachers, the contribution of parents in the educational growth of their children and so on. Similarly, future research can be done on the absence of elements, such as ethical and sustainable leadership, lack of trust, carelessness in responsibility as working causes behind the failure of education.

The present study also suggests research work on a higher level, in Finnish education. Researchers can investigate different elements behind the Finnish education at a higher level. Similarly, the researchers can also make a comparative study of the current research with other developed countries and also with the developing countries, where problems in the domain of basic education are still very high.

REFERENCES

Aho, E. Pitkänen, K. & Sahlberg, P. (2006). *Policy Development and Reform Principles of Basic and Secondary Education in Finland since 1968.* Washington, D.C.:The World Bank (Education Working Paper Series, November-2, 2006).

Attride-Sterling, J. (2001). Thematic networks: an analytical tool for qualitative research. Qualitative Research, 1 (3), 385-405.

Bass, B. M., & Steidlmeier, P. (1999). Ethics, character, and authentic transformational leadership behavior, Leadership Quarterly, 10(2), 181-217

Bennis, W. & Nanus, B. (1985). Leaders: Strategies for Taking Charge: 45. New York: Harper Collins.

Björk, L. (2009, June 11). *Research as a Process.* Paper presented at the 5th Annual International Symposium on Educational Reform, University of Jyväskylä, Finland.

Bogdan, R. C. & Biklen, S. K. (2003). *Qualitative research in education: an introduction to theory and methods.* Fourth Edition. New York: Pearson Education group.

Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology.* 3 (2). pp. 77-101.

Burns, J. (1978). *Leadership.* New York: HarperCollins.

Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research Design:* Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. 3rd Edition. Los Angeles: Sage Publication.

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design Choosing Among Five Approaches.* (2nd ed.): Sage Publications.

Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into Practice, 39*(3), 124-131.

Collins, J.C. & Porras, J. I. (1994*).* Building your company's vision. p.31.

Ciulla, J. B. (2005). Integrating leadership with ethics: is good leadership contrary to human nature. P. J. Doh & S. A. Stumpf (Eds.), *Handbook on responsible leadership and governance in global business.* (pp.159-179). Cheltenham UK: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited

Darcy, K. T. (2010). Ethical Leadership: The past, present and future.*International Journal of Disclosure & Governance, 7*(3), 198-212.

Davis, G. A., and Thomas, M. A. (1989). *Effective Schools and Effective Teachers,* Allyn & Bacon, Needham Heights, MA.

Darling-Hammond, L. (2009). *The flat world and education: How America's commitment to equity will determine our future.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Deal, T. E., & Peterson, K. D. (1999). *Shaping school culture:* The heart of leadership. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Dossey, J. A. (2003). Large-scale assessment: National and international. In G. M. A. Stanic & J. Kilpatrick (Eds.). *A history of school mathematics* (Vol. 2, pp. 1435-1487). Reston, VA: National Council of Teachers of Mathematics.

Douglas, A., Burtis, J. O., & Pond-Burtis, L. K. (2001). Myth and leadership vision: Rhetorical manifestations of cultural force. *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies,* 7(4), 55-69.

Duffield, J. F., & McCuen, R.H. (2000). Ethical maturing and successful leadership. *Journal of Professional Issues in Engineering Education & Practice,* 126(2), 79.

Eagleton, T. (1983). *Literary theory:* An introduction. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Fereday, J. & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2008). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International journal of qualitative methods,* 5(1), 80-92.

Frank, D. G. (2002). Meeting the ethical challenges of leadership. *Journal of Academic Librarianship, 28(1/2), 81.*

Fullan, M. (2005). *Leadership & Sustainability: System Thinkers inAction.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

Fullan, M. (2002). *Beyond instructional leadership,* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Fullan, M. (1999). *Change Forces*: The Sequel, London, Falmer Press; Levittown, PA, Falmer Press (Taylor and Francis Inc.)

Gardner, H. (1995). *Leading minds:* An anatomy of leadership. New York, NY: Basic Books.

Golafshani, N. (2003). Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report, 8*(4), 597-606. Retrieved on May 11th, 20014. http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR8-4/golafshani.pdf

Greenleaf, R. K. (1977/2002). *Servant-leadership: A journey into the nature of legitimate power and greatness.* Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press.

Hargreaves, A., & Fink, D. (2006). *Sustainable leadership.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass /Wiley.

Hargreaves, A., & Fink, D. (2003). *The seven principles of sustainable leadership.* Retrievedfrom:http:www2.bc.edu/~hargrean/docs/seven_principles.pdf

Hargreaves, A. (1997). Cultures of teaching and educational change. In M. Fullan (Ed.), *the challenge of school change.* Illinois: Skylight Training and Publishing.

Halttunen, L. (2016). Distributing leadership in a day care setting. *Journal of Early Childhood Education Research,* 5 (1), 2-18. Retrieved from http://jecer.org/fi/wpcontent/uploads/2016/01/Halttunen-issue5-1.pdf

Healey, M. & Perry, C. (2000). Comprehensive criteria to judge the validity and Reliability of qualitative research within the realism paradigm. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal*, 3(3) 118-126.

Heifetz, R. A. (2006). Anchoring leadership in the work of adaptive progress. In F. Hesselbein & M. Goldsmith (Eds). *The leader of the future: Visions, strategies, and the new era,* pp. 78-80. San Francisco, CA: Leader to Leader Institute, Jossey Bass.

Hitt, W. D. (1990). *Ethics and leadership: Putting theory into practice.* Columbus: Battelle Press.

Husserl, E. (1970). Trans D Carr,*Logical Investigations.* New York: Humanities Press.

Jacob, S. A., & Furgerson, S. P. (2012). Writing interview protocols and conducting interviews: *The Qualitative Report,* 1-10. Retrieved from http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR17/jacob.pdf

Jones, H. B. (1995). The ethical leader:An ascetic construct. Journal of Business Ethics, 14(10), 867-874.

Kannair, J. (2007). The Ethical Mind. *Harvard Business Review,* 85(3), 51-56

King, M. (2008). Practical reasoning and ethical decision.*Ethics,* 118(4), 717-721.

Kouzes, J. M., & Posner, B. Z. (1992). Ethical leaders: an essay about being in love. *Journal of Business Ethics,* 11(5), 479-484.

Krishnamurti, J. (2007). *Think on these things.*London: Krishnamurti Foundation.

Kupiainen, S, Hautamaki, J., & Karjalainen, T. (2009). *The Finnish education system and PISA, Ministry of Education Publications,* Helsinki University Print, Helsinki.

Kuusilehto-Awale, L., & Lahtero, T. (2013). Combining equity and quality in achieving excellent outcomes in education for all – Case Finland. *Comparative Education Review* 2012-2013, 34, 7-12.

Kuusilehto-Awale, L., & Lahtero, T. (2014). Finnish Case of Basic Education for All – With Quality Learning Outcomes. *Journal of Education and Research;* Vol 4, No 1, pp. 1-18.

Kuusilehto-Awale, L. (2014). A concern for caring. *Handbook of Ethical Educational Leadership (edited by: Branson & Gross).* New York: Routledge Publishing.

Lewis, C. S. (1944). *The abolition of man.* New York: HarperCollins.

Lester, S. (1999). *An introduction to phenomenological research.* Taunton UK, Stan Lester Development. Retrieved on the 20th June 2014 from: www.sld.demon.co.uk/resmethy.pdf

Louis, K. S. (2007). Trust and improvement in schools. *Journal of Educational Change, 6*(1), 1-24.

Merriam, S., B. (2009). *Qualitative Research*: A Guide to Design and Implementation. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Mitchell, C. & Sackney, L. (2009). *Sustainable improvement:Building learning communities that endure.* Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.

Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods.* Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Murphy, P. E., & Enderle, G. (1995). Managerial ethical leadership: examples do matter. *Business Ethics Quarterly,* 5(1), 117-128.

Niemi, H, Toom, A & Kallioniemi, A. (2012). *Miracle of Education*: The Principles and Practices of Teaching and Learning in Finnish Schools.Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.

Noddings, N. (2005). *The challenges to care in schools:An alternative approach to education.* Columbia University, The USA: Teachers' College Press.

OECD, (2007). PISA 2006. Science Competencies for Tomorrow's World. Vol. 1. Paris: OECD.

Owen, H, Hodgson, V., & Gazzard, N. (2004). *The leadership manual:Your complete practical guide to effective leadership.* Great Britain: Pearson Education Limited.

Owens, R. G. & Valesky, T. C. (2011). *Organizational behavior in education:Leadership and school reform* (10th Ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education Inc.

Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (3rd ed). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Ravitch, D. (2010). *The death and the life of great American school system:* How testing and choice are undermining Education. Basic Books New York.

Rasik, T. and Swanson, A. (2001). *Fundamental Concepts of Educational Leadership.* Upper Saddle River, NJ, Prentice Hall Inc.

Rost, J. (1991). *Leadership in the Twenty-First Century:* 27. Westport, CT: Praeger.

Rosenwasser, David, and Jill Stephen. (2006) *Writing Analytically.* 4th edition. Boston.

Sahlberg, P. (2011). *The Finnish lessons:What can the world learn from educational changes in Finland*? New York: Teachers' College Press.

Senge, P. M. (2006). *The fifth discipline:* The art and practice of the learning organization. New York: Currency-Doubleday.

Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. *Education for Information,* 22(2004), 63-75.

Starratt, R. (2005). Responsible leadership. *Educational Forum,* 65(2), 124–133.

Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of Qualitative Research:* Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques. California: Sage.

Silverman, D. (2006). *Interpreting qualitative data*. London: SAGE Publications.

Slankis, E. (2006). *Sustainable thinking, sustainable leadership* – the new E.Q. Leadership (2006).

Tracy, S. J. (2010). Qualitative quality: Eight 'Big Tent' criteria for excellent qualitative research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16(10), 837-851.

Trevino, L. K. (1986). Ethical decision making in organizations: A person-situation interactionist model.*Academy of Management Review,* 11(3), 601-617.

Van Manen, M. (1990). Researching Lived Experience. *Human Science for an Action Sensitive Pedagogy.* London, Ontario: State University of New York Press.

Vairagya, S. A. (2012). *Osho's vision on education.* Osho Circle Foundation, Ghaziabad,UP, India: Fusion Books.

Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H. & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing & Health Sciences,* 15, 398-405.

Van Teijlingen, E. & Hundley, V. (2001). The importance of pilot studies, Social Research Update. 35, Department of Sociology, University of Surrey.

Wilson, M. E. (2004). Teaching, learning and millennial students. In M. D. Coomes & R. DeBard (Eds.), *Serving the millennial generation* (pp. 59-71). New Directions for Student Services, no. 106. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Welman, J. C. & Kruger, S. J. (1999). Research methodology for the business and administrative sciences. Johannesburg, South Africa: International Thompson.

Wilhelm, W. (1996). Learning from past leaders. In F. Hesselbein, M. Goldsmith, & R. Beckhard, (Eds*.), The leader of the future*, (pp. 221-226). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

World Commission for Environment and Development, WCED. (1987). Our Common Future (Oxford: Oxford University Press)Creating and sustaining professional learning communities.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1. Research Instruments

Sustainable leadership	Sustainable leadership
1. Would you please share with me your leadership styles? **2.** Would you like to share your concept of leadership? And what is there in leadership to be sustained? **3.** How do you ensure that your leadership approaches/styles positively influence teachers/leaders in discharging their duties? **4.** How do you maintain leadership approaches in relation to...? -Decision making? -Implementation and performance? -Teachers' delivery of work and good performance? -Students' learning and achievement? -Students' ability to lead independent and responsible lives after school?	**5.** How does leadership create an enabling environment conducive/favorable for an organization and for community? **6.** How you get help from past experience, to use that in present for making future policies? **8.** How does leadership become a shared understanding for practice among all schools in the community? **9.** Would you please share with me, what kind of roles are played by other parties such as teachers, parents and other organizations, in promoting educational leadership?

Ethical leadership	Ethical leadership
10. Would you share with me your views on ethical leadership? Particularly how do you think about ethical angles of leadership in education?	**15.** How much do you value the elements of trust and mutual sense of responsibility for the growth of ethical leadership?
11. How do you ensure that your ethical leadership styles are understood, recognized, and practiced by your sub-ordinates/teachers?	**16.** How do you deal with students and teachers who do not live up to expectations?
12. What elements are essential between leader and sub-ordinates in developing an ethical relation?	**17.** What are the ethical challenges and difficulties you encounter in dealing with teachers, students and parents, what could be done to address them?
13. How do you promote good relationships among your teachers, and between teachers and students?	**18.** How can you contribute in your role to enhance/promote sustainability and ethics in leadership?
14. How do you resolve conflicts among teachers and between teachers and students?	