

This is a self-archived version of an original article. This version may differ from the original in pagination and typographic details.

Author(s): Jeyasingh, Punidan D.; Sherman, Ryan E.; Prater, Clay; Pulkkinen, Katja; Ketola, Tarmo

Title: Adaptation to a limiting element involves mitigation of multiple elemental imbalances

Year: 2023

Version: Accepted version (Final draft)

Copyright: © Authors 2023

Rights: _{CC BY 4.0}

Rights url: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

Please cite the original version:

Jeyasingh, P. D., Sherman, R. E., Prater, C., Pulkkinen, K., & Ketola, T. (2023). Adaptation to a limiting element involves mitigation of multiple elemental imbalances. Journal of the royal society interface, 20(198), Article 20220472. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsif.2022.0472

1	Adaptation to a	limiting element	involves mitigation of m	nultiple

2 elemental imbalances

3 Punidan D. Jeyasingh^{1,2}, Ryan E. Sherman², Clay Prater², Katja Pulkkinen¹, Tarmo Ketola¹

4 ¹ Department of Biological and Environmental Science, University of Jyväskylä, P.O. Box 35, FI-

5 40014, Finland.

- 6 ² Department of Integrative Biology, Oklahoma State University, 501 Life Sciences West,
- 7 Stillwater, OK 74078. U.S.A. Email: puni.jeyasingh@okstate.edu
- 8 Author Contributions: PDJ, KP, and TK conceived, designed, and conducted the experiments.
- 9 RES generated ionomic data, that was analyzed by CP. PDJ interpreted data and wrote the
- 10 manuscript with input from all authors.
- 11 Article Type: Research Article.
- 12 Competing Interest Statement: Authors declare no competing interests.
- 13 Keywords: ecological stoichiometry, experimental evolution, ionomics, nutrient use efficiency,
- 14 Serratia.
- 15 Running title: Eco-evolutionary ionomics

16 This manuscript includes:

17	Main Text
18	Figures 1 to 3
19	Tables 1 to 2
20	Supplementary Files (1 Table; 2 Figures; 1 data file)
21	
22	

23 Abstract: About twenty elements underlie biology, and thus constrain biomass production. 24 Recent systems-level observations indicate that altered supply of one element impacts the 25 processing of most elements encompassing an organism (i.e., ionome). Little is known about the 26 evolutionary tendencies of ionomes as populations adapt to distinct biogeochemical 27 environments. We evolved the bacterium Serratia marcescens under five conditions (i.e., low 28 carbon, nitrogen, phosphorus, iron, or manganese) that limited the yield of the ancestor 29 compared to replete medium, and measured the concentrations and use efficiency of these five, 30 and five other elements. Both physiological responses of the ancestor, as well as evolutionary 31 responses of descendants to experimental environments involved changes in the content and use 32 efficiencies of the limiting element, and several others. Differences in coefficients of variation in 33 elemental contents based on biological functions were evident, with those involved in biochemical 34 building (C, N, P, S) varying least, followed by biochemical balance (Ca, K, Mg, Na), and 35 biochemical catalysis (Fe, Mn). Finally, descendants evolved to mitigate elemental imbalances 36 evident in the ancestor in response to limiting conditions. Understanding the tendencies of such 37 ionomic responses will be useful to better forecast biological responses to geochemical changes.

38

39 Introduction

40 The lowest level of biological organization is represented by about twenty elements (Williams & 41 Frausto da Silva 2005), and is referred to as the ionome, the entire suite of elements 42 encompassing an organism (Salt et al. 2008). Some of these elements (i.e., carbon, hydrogen, 43 oxygen) are necessary for the organic framework required for all major biomolecules (e.g., 44 carbohydrates, proteins, lipids) and are the most abundant bioelements. Others play key roles in 45 the: structures of biomolecules (e.g., nitrogen, phosphorus, sulfur), maintenance of ionic balance 46 (e.g., calcium, sodium, magnesium), and catalytic functions (e.g., iron, manganese). Elemental 47 quotas of cells are under selection because perturbations to the supply or processing of an 48 element (e.g., mutation in a transporter) impact growth and fitness (e.g., Jeyasingh & Weider

49 2007; Merchant & Helmann 2012). Biologists have traditionally focused on the elements that are 50 most imbalanced between supply and biological demand to predict key biological process (e.g., 51 growth; van der Ploeg et al. 1999), from cells (Droop 1973) to ecosystems (Schindler 1977). 52 Because no element functions in isolation, efforts to characterize the effect of any one 53 biogenic element quickly discovered the importance of elemental linkages in biology (e.g., 54 Redfield 1958; Sterner & Elser 2002). The ratios of abundant bioelements (e.g., C, N, and P) 55 have been useful in exploring key ecological (e.g., Sterner et al. 1992), evolutionary (e.g., Kay et 56 al. 2005) and eco-evolutionary processes (e.g., Jeyasingh et al. 2014). Several studies have also 57 isolated the impact of elemental supply in the contents of key elements in biomass over micro-58 (Turner et al. 2017; Warsi & Dykhuizen 2017), and macro-evolutionary timescales (Baudouin-59 Cornu et al. 2001; Acquisti et al. 2009; Quigg et al. 2003). Typically, adaptation to a limiting 60 element is thought to result in changes in use of that element by altering its efficiency, substituting 61 it with another element with similar functions, or entirely dispensing it (reviewed in Merchant & 62 Helmann 2012). Yet, such studies consider only a small subset of biogenic elements. A common 63 assumption in such work is that information on the other (unmeasured) elements that are in the 64 system is superfluous. While such assumptions (e.g., single-nutrient limitation) are due to 65 mathematical and empirical obstacles, they must be revisited, particularly when models based on 66 such assumptions perform poorly in describing nature (e.g., Sommer 1991; Harpole et al. 2011). 67 Moreover, observations in the post-genomic era are illuminating considerable diversity in the 68 physiological processing of a single element within and among species because they are 69 quantitative traits controlled by numerous loci, and changes in the supply of a single element 70 invoke system-wide physiological adjustments in the quotas of most, if not all elements found in 71 an organism (i.e., its ionome; Baxter 2015; Huang & Salt 2016). 72 In addition to complexity at the physiological level highlighting the importance of

information of most biogenic elements in a system under study, the geochemical conditions in
 each location is also heterogeneous, with the abundance of one element impacting the availability
 of multiple others (e.g., Gustafsson 2013). We know surprisingly little about the relevance of

76 geochemical heterogeneity to the biological processes that happen upon it, and may underlie the 77 prevalence of nutrient co-limitation of ecological systems (Harpole et al. 2011; Fay et al. 2015; 78 Browning et al. 2017). Another pressing motivation is to understand the biological relevance of 79 anthropogenic changes to not only abundant (e.g., P, Elser & Haygarth 2020) but also trace (e.g., 80 Fe; Björnerås et al. 2017) bioelements (Kaspari 2021). For example, Peñuelas et al. (2022) found 81 that while the use of elements involved in biochemical structure has changed between 10-(e.g., 82 C) and 80-(e.g., P) fold, the Anthropocene is characterized by over a 100-fold change in most 83 metals involved in catalysis (e.g., Fe, Zn), with nickel (Ni) use having increased over a 1000-fold. 84 Integrative, systems-level approaches will be required to forecast the biological responses to 85 changes in the cycles of bioelements (e.g., Peñuelas et al. 2019; Bianchi 2021). 86 One way to gain a systems-level understanding of the relevance of any one element is to 87 not only focus on the quotas of elements encompassing an individual, but also the use efficiency 88 of an element. Defined as the amount of new biomass produced per unit element assimilated, 89 nutrient use efficiencies (NUE; Vitousek 1982) are quantitative traits that impact growth at lower 90 levels (e.g., organismal; Sherman et al. 2020) manifesting as biomass production and material 91 fluxes at higher levels of organization (e.g., ecosystem; Fukushima & Matsushita 2021). Although 92 we have known that changes in the NUE of a single element is associated with correlated 93 changes in the NUEs of other elements (e.g., Jeyasingh et al. 2017; 2020), we have yet to 94 capture the general tendencies of ionomes and ionome-wide NUEs as evolution proceeds in 95 distinct biogeochemical environments (Sardans et al. 2021). Another way to explore the chemical 96 system in the context of biology is to observe its behavior when known perturbations are applied, 97 compared to some idealized environment (e.g., fastest growth; maximal yield). Such an exercise 98 is similar to the approach used by ecologists to identify imbalances in elements between a 99 consumer and its diet with simplifying assumptions regarding bioavailability (e.g., the trophic 100 stoichiometric ratio; Filipiak & Weiner 2014). Comparing the quota of an element in the ideal (e.g., 101 fastest growth) condition with the quota of that element in a limiting (e.g., slower growth) condition 102 provides information on the elements that are imbalanced, as well as the degree of imbalance.

Such information places ionome-wide data in the context of substantial modular information onthe metabolism of each element (e.g., Kaim et al. 2013).

105 In this study, we first (i) tested predictions about the relationships between supply of 106 various elements (i.e., C, N, P, Fe, Mn) and the growth of the cosmopolitan bacterial pathogen, 107 Serratia marcescens (Grimont & Grimont 1978; Flyg et al. 1980). Compared to a replete medium 108 (referred to as Full), we expected low supply of elements involved in biochemical building (i.e., 109 LowC, LowN, LowP) will result in larger growth and yield penalties than low supply of trace 110 elements (i.e., LowFe, LowMn) that serve catalytic functions. We then (ii) tested the nutrient 111 sparing hypothesis, which predicts that lineages acclimating or adapting to low supply of an 112 element will increase their use efficiency for this element (NUE= yield ÷ concentration of 113 element). Next, we (iii) tested whether ionomes of descendants are more variable than the 114 ancestor, and quantified ionomic divergence across different environments. Furthermore, (iv) we 115 predicted that trace elements involved in catalysis, with fewer loci directly involved in their 116 processing, would be more prone to disruptions due to *de novo* mutations and vary more 117 compared to bulk elements involved in building and balance of most, if not all, biochemicals that 118 are under the control of multiple loci. Finally, (v) because we expected (and found, see below) 119 ionomes in the limiting treatments (i.e., LowC, LowN, LowP, LowFe, LowMn) will differ from that 120 of the ancestor in the fastest growing conditions (i.e., Full), we tested whether lineages evolve 121 toward an ionome that is similar to that of the ancestor in the fastest growing condition using 122 isometric log-ratio balances.

123

124 Materials and Methods

Study organism: We used a single clone of Serratia marcescens (DB 11; Flyg et al. 1980) as the ancestor. A few cells of a single clone frozen in glycerol was resuscitated overnight in LB medium to derive cells for the initiation of the experimental lineages. *S. marcescens* is an opportunistic bacterium that is ideal for experimental evolution because it can be grown at room temperature, thrives in a wide variety of conditions, and its cultures are difficult to contaminate with other

microbes. *S. marcescens* is a cosmopolitan and pathogenic bacterium capable of infecting
several species (Grimont & Grimont 1978). It has been used extensively in experimental evolution
studies and shown to evolve in response to various environmental conditions such as
temperature (e.g., Ketola et al. 2013, Bruneaux et al. 2022) presence of predators (e.g., Friman et
al. 2008) and competing bacterial species (e.g., Ketola et al. 2016).

135

136 Growth and yield of the ancestor in the six nutrient supply conditions: Growth measurements 137 were initiated by pipetting 100 µL of thawed stock of ancestor in 5mL of modified M9 full growth 138 medium. After 24 h, 10 µL of this culture was transferred into each well of the 100-well Bioscreen 139 plates containing 400 µL of media from each of the six media (Table S1). Each treatment was 140 replicated 16 times, for a total of 96 measurements. Growth was measured in a Bioscreen 141 spectrophotometer (Growth Curves AB Ltd. Helsinki, Finland) at 600 nm in 5 min intervals for 3-7 142 days until growth had clearly reached maximum yield in all wells. Maximal growth rate and yield 143 were analyzed from the optical density (OD) measurements with a MATLAB (version 2008b; Math 144 works Inc., Natick, MA, USA) script that fits linear regressions into In-transformed population 145 growth data consisting of 30-datapoint sliding time window (see Ketola et al. 2013). Maximum 146 growth is found within the window with the steepest linear regression. Yield was given by the 147 maximal average OD among the sliding windows. Analysis of variance, followed by Tukey's post 148 hoc tests were used to test whether the environment had significant effects of growth and yield.

149

Experimental evolution: The evolution experiment was initiated from the ancestral strain that was revived from a stock maintained at -80°C by inoculating 100 μ L into 10 mL of modified M9 growth medium and grown at ~20°C for 74h. Ten μ L of this preculture was inoculated into 5 mL of each of the six growth media (Table S1) in 15 mL culture tubes. Each treatment was replicated 10 times (i.e., 10 lineages evolving in each of the 6 treatments) and maintained in static cultures at room temperature. After thoroughly homogenizing, 5 μ L of each culture was transferred to fresh respective media every 24h for 29 days. Note that this transfer regime is meant to sample the

157 most common life-history strategy in the population. Optical densities (OD) of 400 μ L sample of 158 bacterial cultures grown overnight were measured daily on a Bioscreen spectrophotometer 159 (Growth Curves AB Ltd. Helsinki, Finland) at 600 nm in 5 min intervals for the entire duration of 160 the experiment. The mean of the first 3 OD measurements was used in calculation of 161 accumulated generations as follows: $\log_2 [(OD \text{ day } x \div OD \text{ day } x-1) \times (\text{inoculum size} \div \text{ culture}$ 162 volume)].

163 The purity of all cultures was verified using species-specific 16S rRNA markers and 164 confirmed to be Serratia marcescens. Bacterial cells were harvested from fresh cultures by 165 centrifugation at 4000 x g for 10 min. Bacterial genomic DNA was extracted using the Wizard 166 Genomic DNA Purification Kit (Promega, USA). Amplifications of the bacterium-specific 16S 167 rRNA gene region were performed using universal primers 799f and 1492r. PCR reactions were 168 performed in a total volume of 20 µl containing 4 µl of 5X green reaction buffer, 0.2 µl GoTaq 169 DNA polymerase (5 U/µl), 1 µl of 0.5 µM forward primer, 1 µl of 0.5 µM reverse primer, 2 ul of 0.2 170 mM dNTPs, 10.8 µl of distilled H2O and 1 µl of genomic DNA. PCR reactions were performed on 171 a BioRad 1000C thermal cycler, under the following conditions: 95°C for 30 minutes, followed by 172 30 cycles at 95°C for 30 seconds, 54°C for 30 seconds, and 72°C for one minute, and a final 173 extension at 72°C for 5 minutes. Five microliters of the PCR products were run on a 1.5% 174 agarose gel to verify correct amplification. The PCR products were purified using 10 U of 175 Exonuclease I and 1 U of Fast APTM Thermosensitive Alkaline Phosphatase (Fermentas GmbH, 176 Germany) for 15 minutes at 37°C, followed by enzyme inactivation for 15 minutes at 85°C. The 177 purified PCR products were then sequenced with the same primers used in amplification using 178 Big Dye Terminator (v3.1) Cycle Sequencing Kit (Applied Biosystems). Briefly, each 20 µl 179 sequencing reaction mixture contained 1 µl of PCR amplicon, 0.16 µM of either forward or 180 reverse PCR primer, 0.5 µl of BigDye Ready Reaction Mix, and 1 X sequencing buffer. The 181 sequencing reaction conditions were as follows: 30 cycles of denaturing at 96°C for 10 seconds, 182 annealing at 50°C for 5 seconds, and extension at 60°C for 4 minutes. The sequencing products 183 were purified using ethanol/EDTA/sodium acetate precipitation. Sequencing was performed on an

ABI 3130xl 16-capillary automated genetic analyzer. The sequences were compared with the NCBI database through BLAST searches to confirm species identity as *Serratia marcescens* (http://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Blast.cgi).

187

188 Growth and yield: At the conclusion of experimental evolution trials, 8 clones were extracted from 189 eight of the populations in each evolutionary treatment. Clones were isolated by dilution plating 190 on nutrient broth agar and grown overnight into high OD in 1 mL of the respective medium where 191 the population had been evolving. The clone cultures were frozen in a 1:1 ratio with 80% glycerol 192 on Bioscreen C 100-well plates and stored at -80°C. Two clones from each of the 8 populations, 193 from all 6 evolutionary treatments were randomized in a 100 well Bioscreen plate which included 194 four ancestral clones $(2 \times 8 \times 6 = 96 + 4 = 100)$. The remaining 6 clones were treated similarly, for 195 a total of four full plates (i.e., 400 clones). This frozen clone library enabled easy and fast growth 196 measurements from frozen stocks using a cryo-replicator system (Duetz et al. 2000; Ketola et al. 197 2013; 2016). Growth measurements were initiated by cryo-replicating the frozen clones into wells 198 of a Bioscreen plate filled with 400 µL of full growth medium. After 24 h, 10 µL of each clone 199 culture was transferred into each well of the 100-well Bioscreen plates containing 400 µL of 200 media from respective treatments. All four replicate clone plates were measured in all six growth 201 media. Bacterial growth was measured in a Bioscreen spectrophotometer for 3-7 days until 202 growth reached maximum yield in all wells (see above). Analysis of variance, followed by Tukey's 203 post hoc tests were used to test for significant differences in growth and yield due to treatment 204 and evolution.

205

Ionomics: For ionomics analyses, one clone from each of five populations evolving in each of the
six media were randomly chosen. The clones were precultured by inoculation of 100 µL of frozen
culture into 1 mL of the modified M9 full medium overnight. Preculture was added into 250 mL of
growth media in 500 mL Corning polycarbonate Erlenmeyer flasks (Corning Inc. New York,
NY,USA) placed on a shaker at ~20°C and grown for 12h. This incubation time was chosen

211 based on pilot data to ensure that all cultures were in log phase growth at the time of harvesting 212 (i.e., before the Full treatment reached K). While we acknowledge that population sizes of each treatment will be at different positions relative to K (with Full closest to, and LowC farthest from; 213 214 Fig. 1), the ionomic comparisons of interest in this paper is between the ancestor and 215 descendants in identical conditions, minimizing any growth phase differences impacting the 216 ionome. All clones were cultured in the medium they had been evolving in. For each clone, a 217 replicate ancestral clone was cultured in the respective medium. The culture was then centrifuged 218 (Sorvall RC-6+, Thermo Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA; 4570 x g, 15 min, 4°C), the supernatant 219 was discarded and the pellet was diluted in 7.5 mL of autoclaved distilled water in 15 mL tubes. 220 which were further centrifuged (Megafuge 1.0 R, Thermo Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA; 6000 rcf, 221 20 min, 4°C). After removal of supernatant, the samples were frozen at -20°C until elemental 222 analyses.

223 Samples were dried at 60°C for 72h, and subsamples of known mass (to the nearest μg ; 224 XP2U, Mettler Toledo, Columbus, OH, USA) were analyzed for carbon and nitrogen content using an automated analyzer (varioMicro Cube; Elementar Americas, Mt. Laurel, NJ, USA). Another 225 226 subsample of known mass was rinsed in oxalate to minimize elements adsorbed to cells (Hassler 227 & Schoemann 2009), digested for 24 h in 70% trace metal grade HNO3 in 15 mL metal-free 228 polypropylene tubes and injected into an inductively-coupled plasma optical emission 229 spectrometer (ICP-OES, Thermo Scientific icAP 7400, Waltham, MA, USA) to quantify all other 230 elements in the Serratia ionome. ICP-OES analysis was validated and calibrated with aqueous 231 multi-element external standard reference solutions (CPI International, Santa Rosa, CA, USA) 232 and an in-line internal standard of Yttrium (CPI International, Santa Rosa, CA, USA) to correct for 233 instrument drift or potential matrix effects. When the elemental concentrations were within the 234 range of blank controls, they were considered to be at the detection limit of the instrument and 235 excluded from further analysis. This resulted in 10 elements which were above LOD in all 236 samples. We calculated nutrient use efficiencies (NUE) of each of these 10 elements and

compared differences among environments and evolution using MANOVA, followed by Tukey'spost hoc tests.

Differences in ionomic composition across nutrient limitation treatments were assessed using isometric log ratios (ILRs). Raw elemental data were first subdivided into linearly independent ratios (or balances) by splitting the dataset sequentially into smaller parts. For instance, a dataset containing measurements of C, N, and P may be split into two dual ratios (e.g., C:P and N:P). ILRs were then calculated as:

(Egozcue and Pawlowsky-Glahn 2005) 244 ILR= SQRT (rs/r+s) ln $[q(c^+)/q(c^-)]$ 245 where r and s represent the number of elements on the left- and right-hand side of the ratio and 246 $g(c^+)$ and $g(c^-)$ minus represent the geometric mean of elemental percentages on the left- and 247 right-hand side of the ratio, respectively. Once calculated, we ran a principal components analysis 248 (PCA) on this collection of ratios, and total ionomic imbalance for each form of nutrient limitation 249 were diagnosed through comparisons to ancestral isolates using pairwise 95% confidence 250 intervals of Aitchison distances (i.e., centroid ± 95% CI overlap of unbiased ILRs). As ILR 251 ordinations can be difficult to interpret, we examined imbalances for individual elements in each 252 limitation treatment using concentration ratios of an element under nutrient limitation standardized 253 to the concentration of this element in the ancestral strain growing in the Full medium (with fastest 254 growth and highest yield), where imbalances of a given element are indicated by 95% CIs not 255 overlapping optimum threshold values of 1 (Parent et al. 2020). Differences in individual 256 elemental concentrations between ancestral and descendent linages are likewise indicated when 257 confidence intervals of these groups do not overlap.

258

259 Results

260 Maximal growth rate (r_{max}) of the ancestor were affected by the nutrient environment (Fig. 1;

F_{5,90}= 4.08; P=0.02), with Tukey's HSD post hoc tests revealing that r_{max} in LowP was different

262 from Full and LowFe. No other treatments were different from each other. Yield was also affected

263 by treatment (F_{5,90}= 39.22; P< 0.0001), with post hoc tests revealing four homogenous subsets</p>

264 (i.e., treatments within a subset do not significantly differ from each other): (i) Full, LowMn, (ii)

265 LowFe, (iii) LowP, and (iv) LowN, LowC. We considered the Full treatment as the unlimited,

266 reference treatment to contrast with other treatments.

267 All lineages were evolved for ~285 generations (mean= 285.91; SD= 0.73). Descendants 268 differed from the ancestor in both r_{max} and yield depending on the nutrient supply environment, as 269 indicated by the posthoc results denoted by stars above boxplots (Fig. 2). Compared to the 270 ancestor, descendants exhibited lower rmax in the LowN, LowFe, LowMn, and Full treatments but 271 did not significantly differ in the LowC and LowP treatments (F_{5.87}= 21.51; P<0.0001). Yield of 272 descendants were significantly lower compared to the ancestor in the LowC, LowN, and LowP 273 treatments, as indicated by posthoc tests and denoted by stars above boxplots ($F_{5,82}$ = 53.39; 274 P<0.0001). Yield did not significantly diverge in the LowFe, LowMn, and Full treatments. 275 Significant differences in both r_{max} and yield between ancestor and descendants were observed 276 only in the LowN treatment.

277 Serratia from different treatments occupied different regions of ionomic space (Fig. S1). 278 To test whether such shifts are driven by jonome-wide nutrient sparing, we performed a MANOVA 279 on the nutrient use efficiencies of the ten measured elements (NUE; yield ÷ concentration of 280 element in Serratia). The test was significant and revealed interactive effects of environment and 281 evolution on the NUE of C, N, Fe, Ca, Na, and S (Table 1). Both environment and evolution 282 independently impacted the use efficiency of P and Mg, while Mn and K use efficiencies were 283 impacted by the environment alone. Univariate analyses (Fig. S2) illuminated substantial 284 differences in the NUE of elements due to the environment, evolution, and their interaction. 285 Importantly, the shifts in NUE were not only related to the element that was experimentally 286 manipulated (e.g., P) but also several others. For example, although LowP conditions caused a 287 divergence in the NUE for P (Fig. S2a), it also caused a divergence in the use efficiencies of C 288 (Fig. S2a), S, and Ca (Fig. S2b).

Coefficients of variation (CV) measurements show that highly abundant elements
 involved with biomass construction (C, N, S) were less variable across all lineages/limitation

treatments with the exception of P, which is also involved in catalysis. Elements involved with
charge balance (Na, Ca, K, Mg) were the second most variable, and trace catalytic elements (Fe,
Mn) varied the most (Table 2a). CV values indicate that descendant lineages were more variable
than ancestors, except under LowFe (Table 2b).

295 lonomic variation appeared to be related to evolutionary changes in elemental use 296 intended to balance cellular concentrations of a given limiting element through correlated shifts in 297 a few elements in LowC, LowN and Low P treatments, and ionome-wide adjustments in LowFe 298 and LowMn treatments (Fig. 3). Descendants evolved in the Full treatment exhibited similar 299 ionomes to ancestral controls (i.e., confidence interval for all elements overlap the dashed vertical 300 line in Fig. 3a). In all other treatments (Fig. 3b-f), descendants evolved unique ionomic responses 301 to individual forms of limitation compared to the ancestor (i.e., there is no overlap in the 302 confidence intervals of some elements). For example, in the LowC treatment (Fig. 3b) the C 303 content bar of the ancestor does not overlap the dashed line, while that of the descendants does. 304 More apparently, Na content of the ancestor in LowC conditions is significantly higher than the Na 305 content of the ancestor in the Full treatment (represented by the dashed line) because confidence 306 intervals do not overlap the dashed line. The adjacent bar indicating the Na content of 307 descendants evolved in LowC showed an overlap with the dashed vertical line, indicating a 308 mitigation of excess Na over evolutionary time. Note also that all such imbalances were not 309 mitigated. For example, both ancestor and descendants in LowC conditions contained more P 310 than the ancestor in the Full treatment. Several such differences were also evident in other 311 treatments (Fig. 3c-f), indicating ionome-wide adjustments.

312

313 Discussion

Significant treatment effects on growth parameters of the ancestor indicate that the conditions
were suitable for the culture of *Serratia*, and that the chemical manipulations of the culture
medium were physiologically relevant for *Serratia*. Consistent with prior observations on several
taxa, including *Serratia* (Poole & Braun 1988; Angerer et al. 1992; Kuo et al. 2013; Pittman et al.

318 2015), the greatest impact on yield was due to lower energy (glucose) supply, followed by lower 319 supplies of bulk elements (N, P), while impacts of lower trace metal supplies were relatively 320 muted (Fig. 1). As discussed in Warsi et al. (2018), relatively little is known about the adaptive 321 responses of microbes to limitation by metals, which impact different physiological components 322 compared to macronutrients (e.g., C, N, P). Growth curves from six different conditions indicate 323 distinct impacts on physiology (Fig. 1a), with limited supply of elements involved in biochemical 324 building (C, N, P) decreasing yield to a greater degree compared to elements involved in 325 biochemical catalysis (Fe, Mn). Importantly, evolutionary diversification in growth rate and yield 326 depended on the environment, with only lineages evolving under N scarcity altering both growth 327 and yield (Fig. 2). In all other treatments, either growth or yield diverged. Treatments that had 328 large impacts on the yield of the ancestor (i.e., LowC, LowN, LowP; Fig. 1b) resulted in significant 329 reduction in yield of the descendants (Fig. 2b). On the other hand, treatments that caused 330 divergence in growth rate (i.e., LowFe, LowMn, Full; Fig. 2a) were conditions that had longer 331 period of fast growth prior to entering the stationary phase (Fig. 1a). The LowN treatment belongs 332 to both of these groups, and accordingly, evolutionary effects can be found in both traits when 333 evolved in N limitation (Fig. 2). Together, these observations indicate that selection on the shape 334 of the growth curve depends on the biogeochemical environment. Because such adaptation is not 335 only due to loci underlying elemental use, but also loci controlling other covarying traits (e.g., size; 336 Gounand et al. 2016) further studies exploring such interactions (e.g., by studying strains of 337 different sizes or controlling renewal rate in chemostats) are needed to explain the distinct growth 338 curves in response to changes in the supply of various elements. 339 Note that values of the growth parameters (r, K) were lower in the descendants 340 compared to the ancestor. Although counterintuitive, it has been observed in experimental 341 evolution studies (e.g., Ketola et al. 2004; Lenski 2010) as discussed in Kokko (2021).

Specifically, although theory predicts that natural selection should increase mean fitness, fitness
proxies such as growth can become uncoupled from fitness. For example, it is plausible that the

344 abstracted lab conditions, with different selection pressures compared to the environment from

which the ancestor was isolated, selection can act to reduce both growth and yield to matchresource renewal cycle and abundance of resources.

347 While growth is a classical trait of interest to evolutionary biologists, evolution in growth 348 must be associated with adjustments in the materials required for growth, with important 349 ecological impacts. However, because the ancestor adapted to experimental conditions by 350 decreasing values of classical fitness proxies (i.e., growth rate, yield), adaptive inferences 351 regarding the shifts in NUEs is not straightforward. For example, direct selection for rapid growth 352 would enable us to test predictions arising from the growth rate hypothesis (e.g., Isanta-Navarro 353 et al. 2022). Regardless, the main inferences arising from observations on NUEs across the 354 ionome is that adaptation to limiting supply of an element often involves shifts in the use of not 355 only the limiting element (as posited by the nutrient sparing hypothesis), but also correlated shifts 356 in multiple other elements (Table 1). For example, in LowP conditions, significant divergence in 357 NUE was observed for not only P, but also C, S, and Ca (Fig. S2). We have little theoretical 358 guidance regarding the ionomic responses of organisms and represents an important frontier. 359 Understanding ionome wide shifts in NUEs should have important ecological and evolutionary 360 implications because it represents a change in the biogeochemical niche (Penulas et al. 2019). 361 While much remains to be understood about the ecological relevance of ionomes (Jeyasingh et 362 al. 2017; Kaspari 2021; Hofmann et al. 2021), we do know that differences in the NUE of multiple 363 elements impact trophic transfer (e.g., Jeyasingh et al. 2020), and can alter the geochemical 364 environment for subsequent generations (e.g., San Roman & Wagner 2018).

Although we are far from a mechanistic explanation of observations reported herein, the data suggest that quotas of different elements may evolve at different rates. The experimental evolution design employed here allowed us to ask whether *de novo* mutations impact the quotas of all elements similarly. First, we found that descendant ionomes exhibited greater variation than the ancestor in all environments besides LowFe (Table 2), indicating the key role of mutations in generating ionomic diversity. Moreover, ionomes of descendants diverged more from that of the ancestor in environments that did not constrain yield (i.e., LowFe, LowMn, and Full), while

ionomes of descendants in environments that had large effects on yield (i.e., LowC, LowN, LowP)
exhibited ionomic overlap (Fig. S1) suggesting that greater number of cell divisions in the Full,

374 LowFe, and LowMn treatments allowed greater divergence of populations.

375 Nevertheless, ionomic variation was not equally partitioned among the measured 376 elements either in the acclimatory responses of the ancestor to different treatments or in the 377 evolutionary responses of descendants. Elements involved in biomass construction (C, N, P) 378 were less variable compared to elements involved in ionic balance (Na, Ca, K, and Mg), and 379 biochemical catalysis (Fe and Mn), which varied the most. lonomes of descendants in the Full 380 medium diverged considerably in elements serving catalytic functions although such imbalances 381 arose in a lineage-specific manner (Table 2). Interestingly, elements involved in biochemical 382 building and balance were not as highly imbalanced or variable as trace metals among replicate 383 descendant lineages. This observation suggests that evolutionary tendencies of ionomes may not 384 be equal in all dimensions. One hypothesis to explain this pattern arises from the nature of 385 genomic architecture, where some elements (e.g., Fe, Mn) are controlled by fewer loci than 386 others (e.g., C, N, P) and more prone to be disrupted by de novo mutations. In other words, the 387 number of loci impacting proteins that control the intake, metabolism, and storage differ among 388 elements. For example, of the 4622 proteins coded for by the Serratia genome (NCBI ID 1112), 389 126 are involved in processing of P, while 26 are involved with Fe, and only one for Ni. Thus, a 390 mutation at a locus underlying Ni processing could have a much higher impact on the 391 concentration of Ni in the cell, compared to the impact of a mutation at a locus underlying P 392 processing on the P content of a cell. Comparison of ancestral ionomes in the Full medium with that of ancestral and 393

descendant ionomes (i.e., imbalance ratios) in the various limitation treatments (Fig. 3) provided a window into the system-wide adjustments made in response to selection specific to each biogeochemical condition. While multivariate ionomic imbalance ratios in all treatments differed from that of the optimally growing ancestor, significant divergence of elemental imbalances across the ionome was observed only in LowFe and LowMn treatments (Fig. 3e, f). In both cases,

399 the elemental imbalance ratio was lower in descendants than in the ancestor acclimating to the 400 same environment, suggesting some adaptive value in mitigating elemental imbalances. Such 401 mitigation did not involve the element in limiting supply (i.e., Fe or Mn), rather descendants in 402 LowFe decreased their Na imbalance and those in LowMn treatments decreased their Fe 403 imbalance compared to the ancestor. As LowFe organisms also increased their Mn 404 concentrations, these results suggest substitution of these two adjacent elements in the periodic 405 table (Fitsanakis et al. 2010). Clearly, there are more such complex interactions in the data 406 reported herein, as well as those typical of ionomic studies. For example, Eide et al. (2005) 407 quantified the ionomes of over 200 yeast genotypes and found that mutations impacted the 408 quotas of multiple elements, and most genotypes occupied unique locations in ionomic space. 409 Placing such ionome-wide observations in the context of our understanding about the evolution of 410 elemental quotas and use indicates that a focus on unitary elements, while illuminating the 411 biochemical mechanisms (e.g., Casey et al. 2016), may miss substantial shifts in the quotas and 412 use of other elements, which must impact the chemistry of the environment, potentially altering 413 multifarious selection on subsequent generations.

414 lonomic changes emerge from myriad genomic, anatomical, and physiological 415 adjustments. While mapping such responses is beyond the scope of any one study, general 416 inferences regarding the evolution of ionomes can guide exploration of biochemical mechanisms 417 as well as ecological consequences (Jeyasingh et al. 2014; Penuelas et al. 2019). We observed 418 (Table 2) that elements involved in biochemical catalysis (e.g., Fe, Mn) are more variable and 419 evolutionarily labile than elements involved in biochemical balance (e.g., Ca, Na) and biochemical 420 building (e.g., C, N). Lability of metal catalysts is particularly noteworthy for the study species, the 421 pathogenic S. marcescens, because metals play key roles in virulence (Palmer & Skaar 2016). 422 More specifically, our observations indicate that it is possible that metal quotas change as a 423 population adapts to differences in the supply of other elements, thereby increasing the likelihood 424 of virulence. Although the mechanism of virulence may not change (e.g., a metal in a pathogen 425 enzyme oxidizing host integument, Aachmann et al. 2012), allocation of metals to such virulence-

426 relevant machinery may be sensitive to acclimatory or adaptive adjustments in response to 427 limitation of another element. Consequently, measuring one or a small subset of elements to 428 understand any biological process is bound to ignore a substantial proportion of underlying 429 mechanisms. Observations in this study indicate that adaptation to limitation of a particular 430 element involves readjustment of multiple other elements. Understanding the general tendencies 431 of such rearrangement should reveal a systems-level picture of the dynamic interactions among 432 genetics, traits, and the environment. More generally, this study highlights the utility of 433 observations at the interface of inorganic chemistry and biology (e.g., Williams & Rickaby 2012) in 434 advancing ecological and evolutionary theory, although much work remains. Placing our modular 435 understanding of bioelements in systemic context, as attempted here, may be useful in 436 forecasting biological phenomenon using chemical information – a central challenge in the 437 Anthropocene characterized by rapid changes of large magnitude in the inorganic chemistry of 438 the biosphere.

439

440 Acknowledgments

441 PDJ thanks KP, TK, Mikko Mönkkönen, Jouni Taskinen and the Department of Biological and

442 Environmental Science at the University of Jyväskylä for making this work possible. We thank

443 Roghaieh Ashrafi for 16s PCR, Emmi Räsänen for lab assistance. Support from Fulbright Finland

444 to PDJ, Academy of Finland grant #260704 to Jouni Taskinen and #278751 to TK, Finnish

445 Cultural Foundation grant to KP, and US National Science Foundation grant #1930736 to PDJ is

gratefully acknowledged. The authors thank the editor and anonymous reviewers at *RS Interface*for constructive comments.

448

449 References

Aachmann, F. L., M. Sørlie, G. Skjåk-Bræk, V. G. H. Eijsink, and G. Vaaje-Kolstad. 2012. NMR
structure of a lytic polysaccharide monooxygenase provides insight into copper binding,
protein dynamics, and substrate interactions. Proceedings of the National Academy of
Sciences of the United States of America 109:18779–18784.

- Acquisti, C., J. J. Elser, and S. Kumar. 2009. Ecological nitrogen limitation shapes the DNA
 composition of plant genomes. Molecular biology and evolution 26:953–956.
- Aitchison, J. 1986. The statistical analysis of compositional data. Chapman and Hall, London;
 New York.
- Angerer, A., B. Klupp, and V. Braun. 1992. Iron transport systems of Serratia marcescens.
 Journal of bacteriology 174:1378–1387.
- Baudouin-Cornu, P., Y. Surdin-Kerjan, P. Marlière, and D. Thomas. 2001. Molecular evolution of
 protein atomic composition. Science 293:297–300.
- Baxter, I. 2015. Should we treat the ionome as a combination of individual elements, or should we
 be deriving novel combined traits? Journal of experimental botany 66:2127–2131.
- Baxter, I. R., O. Vitek, B. Lahner, B. Muthukumar, M. Borghi, J. Morrissey, M. L. Guerinot, et al.
 2008. The leaf ionome as a multivariable system to detect a plant's physiological status.
 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America
 105:12081–12086.
- Bianchi, T. S. 2021. The evolution of biogeochemistry: revisited. Biogeochemistry:154: 141–181.
- Björnerås, C., G. A. Weyhenmeyer, C. D. Evans, M. O. Gessner, H.-P. Grossart, K. Kangur, I.
 Kokorite, et al. 2017. Widespread Increases in Iron Concentration in European and North
 American Freshwaters: Increasing Iron Concentrations. Global biogeochemical cycles
 31:1488–1500.
- Browning, T. J., E. P. Achterberg, I. Rapp, A. Engel, E. M. Bertrand, A. Tagliabue, and C. M.
 Moore. 2017. Nutrient co-limitation at the boundary of an oceanic gyre. Nature 551:242–246.
- Bruneaux, M., I. Kronholm, R. Ashrafi, and T. Ketola. 2022. Roles of adenine methylation and
 genetic mutations in adaptation to different temperatures in Serratia marcescens.
 Epigenetics: official journal of the DNA Methylation Society 17:861–881.
- 478 Casey, J. R., A. Mardinoglu, J. Nielsen, and D. M. Karl. 2016. Adaptive Evolution of Phosphorus
 479 Metabolism in Prochlorococcus. mSystems 1.
- 480 Droop, M. R. 1973. Some thoughts on nutrient limitation in algae. Journal of phycology 9:264– 481 272.
- 482 Duetz, W. A., L. Ruedi, and R. Hermann. 2000. Methods for intense aeration, growth, storage,
 483 and replication of bacterial strains in microtiter plates. Applied and Environmental
 484 Microbiology 66:2641–2646.
- Eide, D. J., S. Člark, T. M. Nair, M. Gehl, M. Gribskov, M. L. Guerinot, and J. F. Harper. 2005.
 Characterization of the yeast ionome: a genome-wide analysis of nutrient mineral and trace
 element homeostasis in Saccharomyces cerevisiae. Genome biology 6:R77.
- 488 Egozcue, J. J., and V. Pawlowsky-Glahn. 2005. Groups of Parts and Their Balances in
 489 Compositional Data Analysis. Mathematical geology 37:795–828.
- Elser, J. J., C. Acquisti, and S. Kumar. 2011. Stoichiogenomics: the evolutionary ecology of
 macromolecular elemental composition. Trends in ecology & evolution 26:38–44.
- 492 Elser, J., and P. Haygarth. 2020. Phosphorus: Past and Future. Oxford University Press.
- Fitsanakis, V. A., N. Zhang, S. Garcia, and M. Aschner. 2010. Manganese (Mn) and iron (Fe):
 interdependency of transport and regulation. Neurotoxicity research 18:124–131.
- Fay, P. A., S. M. Prober, W. S. Harpole, J. M. H. Knops, J. D. Bakker, E. T. Borer, E. M. Lind, et
 al. 2015. Grassland productivity limited by multiple nutrients. Nature plants 1:15080.
- Friman, V.-P., T. Hiltunen, J. Laakso, and V. Kaitala. 2008. Availability of prey resources drives
 evolution of predator-prey interaction. Proceedings. Biological sciences / The Royal Society
 275:1625–1633.
- Flyg, C., K. Kenne, and H. G. Boman. 1980. Insect Pathogenic Properties of Serratia
 marcescens: Phage resistant Mutants with a Decreased Resistance to Cecropia Immunity
 and Dtxreased Virulence to Drosophila. Journal of general microbiology 120:173–181.
- 503 Fukushima, T., and B. Matsushita. 2021. Limiting nutrient and its use efficiency of phytoplankton 504 in a shallow eutrophic lake, Lake Kasumigaura. Hydrobiologia 848:3469–3487.

- Gounand, I., T. Daufresne, D. Gravel, C. Bouvier, T. Bouvier, M. Combe, C. Gougat-Barbera, et
 al. 2016. Size evolution in microorganisms masks trade-offs predicted by the growth rate
 hypothesis. Proceedings. Biological sciences / The Royal Society 283.
- 508 Grimont, P. A., and F. Grimont. 1978. The genus Serratia. Annual review of microbiology 32:221– 509 248.
- Harpole, W. S., J. T. Ngai, E. E. Cleland, E. W. Seabloom, E. T. Borer, M. E. S. Bracken, J. J.
 Elser, et al. 2011. Nutrient co-limitation of primary producer communities: Community colimitation. Ecology letters 14:852–862.
- Hofmann, P., A. Clark, P. Hoffmann, A. Chatzinotas, W. S. Harpole, and S. Dunker. 2021.
 Beyond nitrogen: phosphorus estimating the minimum niche dimensionality for resource
 competition between phytoplankton. Ecology letters 24:761–771.
- Huang, X.-Y., and D. E. Salt. 2016. Plant lonomics: From Elemental Profiling to Environmental
 Adaptation. Molecular plant 9:787–797.
- Isanta-Navarro, J., C. Prater, L. M. Peoples, I. Loladze, T. Phan, P. D. Jeyasingh, M. J. Church,
 et al. 2022. Revisiting the growth rate hypothesis: Towards a holistic stoichiometric
 understanding of growth. Ecology letters 25:2324–2339.
- 521 Jeyasingh, P. D., and L. J. Weider. 2007. Fundamental links between genes and elements: 522 evolutionary implications of ecological stoichiometry. Molecular ecology 16:4649–4661.
- Jeyasingh, P. D., J. M. Goos, P. R. Lind, P. Roy Chowdhury, and R. E. Sherman. 2020.
 Phosphorus supply shifts the quotas of multiple elements in algae and Daphnia: ionomic
 basis of stoichiometric constraints. Ecology letters 23:1064–1072.
- Jeyasingh, P. D., J. M. Goos, S. K. Thompson, C. M. Godwin, and J. B. Cotner. 2017. Ecological
 Stoichiometry beyond Redfield: An Ionomic Perspective on Elemental Homeostasis. Frontiers
 in microbiology 8:722.
- 529 Jeyasingh, P. D., R. D. Cothran, and M. Tobler. 2014. Testing the ecological consequences of 530 evolutionary change using elements. Ecology and evolution 4:528–538.
- Kaim, W., B. Schwederski, and A. Klein. 2013. Bioinorganic Chemistry -- Inorganic Elements in
 the Chemistry of Life: An Introduction and Guide (2nd ed.). Wiley.
- Kay, A. D., I. W. Ashton, E. Gorokhova, A. J. Kerkhoff, A. Liess, and E. Litchman. 2005. Toward a
 stoichiometric framework for evolutionary biology. Oikos 109:6–17.
- Ketola, T., J. Laakso, V. Kaitala, and S. Airaksinen. 2004. Evolution of Hsp90 expression in
 Tetrahymena thermophila (Protozoa, Ciliata) populations exposed to thermally variable
 environments. Evolution; international journal of organic evolution 58:741–748.
- Ketola, T., L. Mikonranta, and J. Mappes. 2016. Evolution of bacterial life-history traits is sensitive
 to community structure. Evolution 70:1334–1341.
- Ketola, T., L. Mikonranta, J. Zhang, K. Saarinen, A.-M. Ormälä, V.-P. Friman, J. Mappes, et al.
 2013. Fluctuating temperature leads to evolution of thermal generalism and preadaptation to
 novel environments. Evolution; international journal of organic evolution 67:2936–2944.
- Kuo, P.-A., C.-H. Kuo, Y.-K. Lai, P. L. Graumann, and J. Tu. 2013. Phosphate limitation induces
 the intergeneric inhibition of Pseudomonas aeruginosa by Serratia marcescens isolated from
 paper machines. FEMS microbiology ecology 84:577–587.
- Leal, M. C., O. Seehausen, and B. Matthews. 2017. The Ecology and Evolution of Stoichiometric Phenotypes. Trends in ecology & evolution 32:108–117.
- Lenski, R. E. 2010. Phenotypic and Genomic Evolution during a 20,000-Generation Experiment
 with the bacterium *Escherichia coli*. Pages 225–265 *in* Plant Breeding Reviews. John Wiley &
 Sons, Inc., Oxford, UK.
- Loladze, I. 2014. Hidden shift of the ionome of plants exposed to elevated CO₂depletes minerals
 at the base of human nutrition. eLife 3:e02245.
- Merchant, S. S., and J. D. Helmann. 2012. Elemental economy: microbial strategies for
 optimizing growth in the face of nutrient limitation. Advances in microbial physiology 60:91–
 210.
- 556 NCBI 1112. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/genome/1112?genome_assembly_id=233157

- Novak, M., T. Pfeiffer, R. E. Lenski, U. Sauer, and S. Bonhoeffer. 2006. Experimental tests for an
 evolutionary trade-off between growth rate and yield in E. coli. The American naturalist
 168:242–251.
- Palmer, L. D., and E. P. Skaar. 2016. Transition Metals and Virulence in Bacteria. Annual review
 of genetics 50:67–91.
- 562 Parent S.-É. 2020. Why we should use balances and machine learning to diagnose ionomes.
 563 Authorea Prepr. doi: 10.22541/au.157954751.17355951.
- Peñuelas, J., M. Fernández-Martínez, P. Ciais, D. Jou, S. Piao, M. Obersteiner, S. Vicca, et al.
 2019. The bioelements, the elementome, and the biogeochemical niche. Ecology e02652.
- Penuelas, J., J. Sardans, and J. Terradas. 2022. Increasing divergence between human and
 biological elementomes. Trends in ecology & evolution. doi.org/10.1016/j.tree.2022.08.007
- Pittman, J. R., L. C. Kline, and W. J. Kenyon. 2015. Carbon-Starvation Induces Cross-Resistance
 to Thermal, Acid, and Oxidative Stress in Serratia marcescens. Microorganisms 3:746–758.
- Poole, K., and V. Braun. 1988. Iron regulation of Serratia marcescens hemolysin gene
 expression. Infection and immunity 56:2967–2971.
- Quigg, A., Z. V. Finkel, A. J. Irwin, Y. Rosenthal, T.-Y. Ho, J. R. Reinfelder, O. Schofield, et al.
 2003. The evolutionary inheritance of elemental stoichiometry in marine phytoplankton.
 Nature 425:291–294.
- 575 Redfield, A. C. 1958. The biological control of chemical factors in the environment. American
 576 scientist 46:230A–221.
- Rudman, S. M., J. M. Goos, J. B. Burant, K. V. Brix, T. C. Gibbons, C. J. Brauner, and P. D.
 Jeyasingh. 2019. Ionome and elemental transport kinetics shaped by parallel evolution in threespine stickleback. Ecology letters 22:645–653.
- Rudman, S. M., M. A. Barbour, K. Csilléry, P. Gienapp, F. Guillaume, N. G. Hairston Jr, A. P.
 Hendry, et al. 2018. What genomic data can reveal about eco-evolutionary dynamics. Nature ecology & evolution 2:9–15.
- 583 Salt, D. E., I. Baxter, and B. Lahner. 2008. Ionomics and the study of the plant ionome. Annual 584 review of plant biology 59:709–733.
- San Roman, M., and A. Wagner. 2018. An enormous potential for niche construction through
 bacterial cross-feeding in a homogeneous environment. PLoS computational biology
 14:e1006340.
- Sardans, J., H. Vallicrosa, P. Zuccarini, G. Farré-Armengol, M. Fernández-Martínez, G. Peguero,
 A. Gargallo-Garriga, et al. 2021. Empirical support for the biogeochemical niche hypothesis in
 forest trees. Nature ecology & evolution.
- 591 Schindler, D. W. 1977. Evolution of phosphorus limitation in lakes. Science 195:260–262.
- Schlesinger, W. H. 1997. Biogeochemistry: An Analysis of Global Change. Gulf Professional
 Publishing.
- Sherman, R. E., R. Hartnett, E. L. Kiehnau, L. J. Weider, and P. D. Jeyasingh. 2021. Quantitative
 genetics of phosphorus content in the freshwater herbivore, Daphnia pulicaria. The Journal of
 animal ecology 90:909–916.
- Sterner, R. W., and J. Elser. 2002. Ecological Stoichiometry. Princeton University Press,
 Princeton, N.J.
- Turner, C. B., B. D. Wade, J. R. Meyer, B. A. Sommerfeld, and R. E. Lenski. 2017. Evolution of
 organismal stoichiometry in a long-term experiment with Escherichia coli. Royal Society open
 science 4:170497.
- van der Ploeg, R. R., W. Bohm, and M. B. Kirkham. 1999. On the Origin of the Theory of Mineral
 Nutrition of Plants and the Law of the Minimum. Soil Science Society of America 63:1055.
- Vitousek, P. 1982. Nutrient Cycling and Nutrient Use Efficiency. The American naturalist
 119:553–572.
- Warsi, O. M., and D. E. Dykhuizen. 2017. Evolutionary implications of Liebig's law of the
 minimum: Selection under low concentrations of two nonsubstitutable nutrients. Ecology and
 evolution 7:5296–5309.

- Warsi, O. M., D. I. Andersson, and D. E. Dykhuizen. 2018. Different adaptive strategies in E. coli
 populations evolving under macronutrient limitation and metal ion limitation. BMC
 evolutionary biology 18:72.
- Werner, A., and R. K. Kinne. 2001. Evolution of the Na-P(i) cotransport systems. American
 journal of physiology. Regulatory, integrative and comparative physiology 280:R301–12.
- 614 Williams, R. J. P., and J. J. R. F. da Silva. 2005. The Chemistry of Evolution: The Development of 615 our Ecosystem (1 edition.). Elsevier Science.
- 616 Williams, R. J. P., R. Rickaby. 2012. Evolution's Destiny: Co-Evolving Chemistry of the
- 617 Environment and Life. Royal Society of Chemistry.

618 Figures and Tables

619 Figure 1. (a) Example growth curves of the ancestral Serratia strain in the six experimental 620 conditions over the first 48h based on optical density measurements every 5 minutes at 600 nm. 621 Curves depict averaged values of replicate measurements. Similar growth data over longer time 622 periods were used to obtain yield and growth rate estimates (see methods). The vertical line at 623 the 24h mark depicts the time at which cultures were renewed during the experimental evolution 624 study. (b) Yield and growth rate (r_{max}) of the ancestor in the six nutrient supply treatments. Boxes 625 indicate 1st and 3rd guartiles, with the line representing the median, while the whiskers indicate 626 the maximum and minimum observed values. Dots represent outliers.

627

Figure 2. Differences in (a) growth rate (r_{max}) and (b) yield between ancestor and descendants in the six nutrient supply treatments at the end of the 28d experimental evolution study. Stars indicate significant post hoc differences between ancestor and descendant within each medium. Boxes indicate 1st and 3rd quartiles, with the line representing the median, while the whiskers indicate the maximum and minimum observed values. Dots represent outliers. Shaded boxes are ancestors, open boxes are descendants.

634

635 Figure 3. Ionomic elemental imbalance ratios in each of the six treatments: (a) Full, (b) LowC, (c) 636 LowN, (d) LowP, (d) LowFe, (f) LowMn. Univariate imbalances for individual elements are 637 expressed as concentration ratios relative to ancestral optimally growing phenotypes where 1 is 638 perfectly balanced (dashed vertical line), <1 is nutrient limited and >1 is nutrient surplus. Error 639 bars for each value represent 95% confidence intervals (CI's) where error bars not overlapping 640 optimal balance thresholds indicate significant imbalances and nonoverlapping bars between 641 ancestral and descendant lineages indicate differential responses to limitation. Multivariate 642 ionomic balance differences were determined using Aitchisonian distances from optimally 643 growing phenotypes and are denoted with a * for a given treatment. Mean ± 95% Cl's are given

644	for ancient (A) and descendant (D) lineages where higher values correspond to greater deviation
645	from optimal phenotypes (centered at zero). Separate means are given for A & D lineages for a
646	given limitation treatment only when they differ significantly from one another.
647	
648	
649	
650	
651	
652	
653	
654	
655	
656	
657	
658	
659	
660	
661	
662	

- **Table 1.** Effects of environment (LowC, LowN, LowP, LowFe, LowMn, Full) and evolution
- 664 (Ancestor, Descendant) on the nutrient use efficiency (NUE= yield ÷ concentration of element in
- 665 Serratia) of the 10 elements measured (see Figure 3). The overall MANOVA model was
- 666 significant (Pillai's Trace; F_{Env}= 16.14, df= 50, 215, P<0.0001; F_{Evo}= 18.04, df= 10, 39, P<0.0001;
- 667 $F_{Env x Evo} = 2.61$, df= 50, 215, P<0.0001).

		Dependent Variable		_	
	Source	(NUE)	đf	F	Sig.
668					
	Environment	C	5	446.78	<0.000
		N	5	278.45	<0.000
		P	5	29.64	<0.000
		Fe	5	120.69	<0.000
		Mn	5	70.49	<0.000
		Ca	5	77.33	<0.000
		K	5	5.41	0.001
		Mg	5	81.17	<0.000
		Na	5	154.30	<0.000
		S	5	202.11	<0.000
	Evolution	С	1	127.29	<0.000
		N	1	103.29	<0.000
		Р	1	12.23	0.001
		Fe	1	3.07	0.086
		Mn	1	.07	0.792
		Ca	1	26.90	<0.000
		К	1	.01	0.895
		Mg	1	47.27	< 0.000
		Na	1	6.97	0.011
		S	1	75.75	<0.000
	Env * Evo	С	5	13.53	< 0.000
		Ν	5	7.73	<0.000
		Р	5	.69	0.633
		Fe	5	2.75	0.029
		Mn	5	.00	1.000
		Са	5	6.85	< 0.000
		K	5	.48	0.786
		Mg	5	1.28	0.288
		Na	5	6.15	<0.000
		S	5	8.35	<0.000

Table 2. Functional and evolutionary ionomic variation. Coefficients of elemental variation (CVs)
are shown separately for (a) elemental functional groups averaged across treatments and (b)
elemental differences between the ancestor (A) and descendent (D) lineages averaged across
elements.

(a) Function	Element	CV (%)
Building	С	4.8
	Ν	6.5
	Ρ	21.0
	S	8.3
Balance	Са	21.6
	К	35.1
	Mg	61.7
	Na	70.7
Catalysis	Fe	101.8
	Mn	129.4

(b) Lineage	CV (%)
Full A	13.8
Full D	73.9
LowC A	22.1
LowC D	29.6
LowN A	21.6
LowN D	77.9
LowP A	10.8
LowP D	24.1
LowFe A	15.2
LowFe D	11.7
LowMn A	17.0
LowMn D	21.7