

**SPATIAL PRACTICES IN THE MOBILE NETWORK
AND THE RISE OF INDIVIDUAL POWER:
A CASE STUDY OF
THE SUNFLOWER STUDENT MOVEMENT IN TAIWAN**

Master's Thesis

Che-Wei Hsu

Intercultural Communication

Department of Language and Communication Studies

University of Jyväskylä

February 2020

JYVÄSKYLÄN YLIOPISTO

Tiedekunta – Faculty Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences	Laitos – Department Department of Language and Communication Studies
Tekijä – Author Che-Wei Hsu	
Työn nimi – Title SPATIAL PRACTICES IN THE MOBILE NETWORK AND THE RISE OF INDIVIDUAL POWER: A CASE STUDY OF THE SUNFLOWER STUDENT MOVEMENT IN TAIWAN	
Oppiaine – Subject Intercultural Communication	Työn laji – Level Master’s Thesis
Aika – Month and year February 2020	Sivumäärä – Number of pages 128
Tiivistelmä – Abstract <p>This thesis chooses the Sunflower Student Movement as a case to analyze the mutual interaction between power-knowledge relation and mobile communication-body relation within a specific social context. The Sunflower Student Movement was a civil protest composed of students, civic groups and the general public. The participants protested against the passing of the Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement (CSSTA) at the Legislative Yuan. For the first time, protesters occupied the Taiwanese parliament. With the widespread of mobile devices (such as smartphones), the Sunflower Student Movement has marked a new form of resistance in the era of mobile communications. This study uses the discourse of newspapers as the primary source of data. Based on Fairclough’s critical discourse analysis and Foucault’s power-knowledge relation, this case study explores three interrelated dimensions of society in Taiwan. The first part focuses on discussing Taiwan’s current political and economic environment to trace the relevance of social changes and generational conflicts. The second part mainly shows how the various combination of body and mobile devices creates specific spaces. This social phenomenon has transformed the meaning between space and place, blurring the boundary between virtual and physical space. The third part is an in-depth analysis of the manifestation of personal power in the movement. Individuals, as the subject and object of power, have complicated the resistance and monitoring strategies between government and the civic public with the innovation of mobile networks.</p> <p>This study argues that knowledge is constructed in specific social conditions at a given period. The multiple forms of discourse created during the Sunflower Student Movement influenced the collective consciousness of the public. Moreover, the evolution of mobile networks has changed the ways of knowledge dissemination. In this social context, the relationships between body, power, and knowledge have established a dynamic system of continuous transformation between citizens and government.</p>	
Asiasanat – Keywords Sunflower Student Movement, power, knowledge, body, mobile communication, critical discourse analysis	
Säilytyspaikka – Depository University of Jyväskylä	
Muita tietoja – Additional information	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 INTRODUCTION	5
1.1 Background and motivation of the study	5
1.2 The aim of the study	11
2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....	15
2.1 Media and mobile networks—from “the extensions of man” to “the Thumbelina”	15
2.1.1 Media as practices.....	17
2.1.2 The mutual transformation of space and place	18
2.1.3 Spatial practices	19
2.2 Foucault’s power-knowledge relation.....	21
2.3 Culture, memory and resistance	22
3 METHODOLOGY	27
3.1 Framework and methods.....	27
3.1.1 Genealogical approach—discourse, knowledge and power.....	27
3.1.2 Critical discourse analysis	28
3.2 Data collection.....	34
4 RESEARCH RESULTS	38
4.1 Collective and connective action: revisiting the Sunflower Student Movement	38
4.1.1 Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement and the social movement.....	39
4.1.2 The meaning of “Taiwan”: imagining Taiwanese people.....	46
4.1.3 Cultural memory and the “sunflower generation”	53
4.2 Mobile media and political space in the networked society	61
4.2.1 Mobile media as the mobile communication—formation of mobile network	62
4.2.2 Mobile media and political space	68
4.2.3 Governmental response to the impact of new media	73
4.3 Individual power and civil participation.....	77
4.3.1 The boundary of democracy and freedom.....	78
4.3.2 Political participation in private and public space	84

4.3.3 Individual power	89
5 CONCLUSION.....	96
5.1 Mobile network, spatial practice and power relation.....	96
5.2 Two formations of discourse—power and knowledge	98
5.3 Limitation.....	101
5.4 Origin, implication and future research	103
REFERENCES.....	106
REFERENCES FROM DATA.....	120
APPENDIX.....	126

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background and motivation of the study

The advent of the mobile phone could alter interpersonal communication and social norms in mediated communication (Campbell & Russo, 2003; Ling, 2004). Since the first generation of the iPhone released in 2007, the field of mobile communication has been expanded and redefined (Hjorth, Burgess & Richardson, 2012; Berry & Schleser, 2014). Using and carrying smartphones and other mobile devices have become a new social and cultural phenomenon for the human to articulate knowledge in everyday lives. Smartphones are not only a type of tool but also part of the human body. These essential features have created a fast flow of knowledge exchange. Individuals no longer need to be restricted to a particular time and space to share information. For example, people can update any information via social media when they are in motion. Some critical issues will snowball and trigger many discussions. Thus, we are experiencing a new era of shortening time and expanding space on the Internet. This idea means that people can gain knowledge from different sources in multiple forms. In other words, people are now living in the smartphone era with ubiquitous opportunities to challenge the fixed social order. According to the International Telecommunication Union (ITU, 2019), the estimated number of “mobile-cellular telephone” subscriptions was roughly 8.3 billion by the end of 2019. There were an estimated 6.4 billion “active mobile-broadband” subscriptions (p. 5). Today, with the stable growth rate of Internet use, there are more mobile phones than people in the world. As to Taiwan, the number of mobile phone subscribers was about 29.2 million in 2018, based on a survey of the National Communications Commission (NCC, 2019). Besides, the penetration rate of the Internet has reached 82.1 %. The mobile Internet access has increased steadily every year, standing at 77.3 % in 2018, according to a survey by Taiwan Network Information Center (TWNIC, 2018). Mobile devices with the Internet have been closely related to various practices in our everyday life. In this sense, this study

considers the mobile network one of the most important social and cultural phenomenon in political participation to connect the past to the future in Taiwan's society.

Many scholars have developed different ideas of the mobile network to explore the relationship between individuals and mobile mechanisms. For example, de Souza e Silva (2006) defines mobile devices as "all types of mobile technologies that promote remote and local multipersonal communication and connection to the Internet, allowing users to exchange information while moving through urban spaces" (p. 262). She has developed the concept of hybrid spaces to observe the mobility of users connected with the Internet to exchange information. Mobile devices allow the possibility of carrying the Internet and "wearing the city" (Kalin & Firth, 2016). In other words, the technological features of mobile devices mean not only the instantaneity of speed but also the movement of instantaneity. Thus, the essence of this media phenomenon that mobile devices have provoked is different from the Internet or traditional phones (Ferraris, 2015; Huang & Tsao, 2015). Mobile media has become the strategic tool for grassroots to achieve specific political goals. Thus, mobile network not only can be considered the connectivity of mobile devices and the Internet, but also the reproduction of knowledge-power relations. In this study, power is seen through the lens of spatial practices, especially the so-called human mobility. The use of mobile devices is part of the process of mobile communication. Campbell (2013) said that "by mobile communication technology, I mean devices and services that supported mediated social connectivity while the user is in physical motion. This interaction may take place through voice, text, picture, video, or otherwise" (p. 9). Mobile communication should be considered the interrelated relationship between the body, space and connectivity. Mobility and the human body are the mutual concepts that are essential for people to connect and interact with others in multiple spaces. This thesis reflects on the idea that mobile media are the extension of the self (Campbell, 2008). In this sense, since mobile media tend to be small, individuals can easily carry them

from one place to another. Thus, people can transform relations between body and space. For example, individuals are no longer restricted to specific areas to communicate with others. They use their mobile devices with the Internet to create shared space. Following this, mobility, in this study, means that individuals can rely on mobile media to access space physically and virtually anytime and anywhere.

In *The archaeology of knowledge and the discourse on language* (Foucault, 2010), Foucault defined his discourse:

[I]t does not set out to be a recollection of the original or a memory of the truth. On the contrary, its task is to make differences: to constitute them as objects, to analyze them, and to define their concept. (p. 205)

Based on Foucault's idea, this thesis is not to unify a general idea or confirm a fact, but to analyze the differences and interpret social phenomena. This thesis examines the relationship between spatial practice and individual power. They are composed of various elements, such as: national consciousness, cultural identity, generational conflict, digital gap, and so on. In other words, this study does not intend to assert the correctness of the truths, but to reflect on the possible forms of modern society in Taiwan. This pattern is the concrete interaction between power and space, extending to the political, economic and cultural fields. It is an unstable, fractured, and decentralized system. According to Foucault (1990, 1991), the exercise of power can construct a series of knowledge. For example, He pointed out that discourse can have the potential to declare the power's functions and forms. Foucault (1990) suggested that "discourse transmits and produces power; it reinforces it, but also undermines and exposes it, renders it fragile and makes it possible to thwart it" (p. 101). Due to the use of mobile devices, the transmission of information (texts, images, stories and videos) is not

limited to time and space constraints. Information that can be seen everywhere shapes a variety of opinions, positions, and arguments. If knowledge can be used as a representation of a fact, power must act in the process of disseminating and acquiring information. Therefore, the power relation in this thesis echoes the following arguments: “Power is employed and exercised through a net-like organization. And not only do individuals circulate between its threads; they are always in the position of simultaneously undergoing and exercising this power” (Foucault, 1980, p. 98).

As above noted, Bauman (2000) said that “power has become truly exterritorial, no longer bound, not even slowed down, by the resistance of space” (p. 11). The mobile devices (smartphones in particular) has contributed to the independence of space. Users of mobile technology can respond quickly with the speed of a digital signal wherever and whenever they go. Following this idea, due to the growth of the mobile network, new models of interacting with people, and various ways of circulating information will change how people involve themselves in social movements and political participation. For instance, Castells (2012) has proposed the concept of “networked social movement” to explore major social movements in recent years. He claims that although these social movements were embodied in different contexts or societal cultures, they relied on the applications of the Internet and social media to become a reality. The new forms of social movements imply that the power-holders can conceal and express their intentions under cover of a digital signal. As a result, in the era of mobile media, the importance of power relations is that “the people operating the levers of power on which the fate of the less volatile partners in the relationship depends can at any moment escape beyond reach—into sheer inaccessibility” (Bauman, 2000, p. 11). Thus, the concept of human mobility assumes that the unpredictability of spatial practices in cyberspace has changed the way we connect with people and the societies around us.

This study explores the dynamics of mobile communication technology, power, and

body by analyzing the case of the Sunflower Student Movement (太陽花學運) in Taiwan. Illustrating and exploring these dynamics, this study suggests that the Sunflower Student Movement in Taiwan has transformed the power relations between the government and the public. The Sunflower Student Movement happened between March 18 and April 10 in 2014. Taiwanese citizens took to the street to protest the Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement (CSSTA) with China. Although this agreement was not carefully evaluated, the government at the time claimed that the trade pact would boost the economy of Taiwan and provide a huge opportunity for China's services market. However, the general public worried that Taiwan's economy would be damaged due to political pressure exerted by China in the future. Furthermore, many Taiwanese people believed that this agreement would threaten Taiwan's cultural identity and subjective consciousness in the long term. To obstruct the legislative procedure, protesters occupied the unicameral legislature of Taiwan, the Legislative Yuan (立法院), which unveiled the prelude to the student movement (Ho, 2015; Jones & Su, 2015; Rowen, 2015). The highest administrative organ called Executive Yuan (行政院) was also temporarily stormed by activists during this movement. The protesters controlled the government institutions, which underlined the uniqueness of the Sunflower Student Movement in the history of the social movements in Taiwan.

According to the National Development Council (NDC, 2014), in 2014, the penetration rate of smartphones exceeded that of desktop computers. Smartphones arguably have become the most popular devices for surfing the Internet since then. However, the survey result showed that there was a widening digital divide. The Internet users between the age of 12 and 39 who had used the Internet was as high as 97.2 %, while those aged 40 to 65 and over plummeted from 86.1% to 24.1% (NDC, 2014). The Sunflower Student Movement took place in 2014, marking a new phase of integration between the digital era and the civic movement. The generation gap and the digital divide made individuals perceive political

issues differently. One possible example was that the initial occupation of this movement consisted of university students. These students were familiar with the use of social media and mobile communications. This cultural phenomenon showed that the young generation succeeded in using the old and new media to create a unique political and social landscape (Liu & Su, 2017). In addition, one study suggested that the use of new media only significantly improved the knowledge politics of those with higher education levels (Liu, 2018). Therefore, the Sunflower Student Movement also revealed long-term conflicts in Taiwan's society. Precisely, the historical and cultural memories hidden in different generations have expanded the impact of unequal information during this movement. That is to say, the younger generation has exercised the power of the mobile network in this given time, and partially changed the fixed ideology and social structure.

The political movement marked three important implications. First, it was the first time that the university student controlled the space of the Taiwanese legislature. The Taiwanese legislature can be regarded as a "public sphere" (Habermas, 1989), where students discussed their political and societal perspectives during the period of occupation. Second, thanks to the rapid development of mobile communication (especially the popularity of smartphones), the protesters could share any information (including pictures, videos and texts) no matter when or where even though they were inside the legislative building. Third, with digital devices, people could be seen acting as so-called "networked individuals" (Wellman, 2001; Dutton, 2009). Due to the features of mobile media, individuals could grasp every opportunity to communicate with people, even though they were in a forbidden place. This new tactic has altered the ways of connecting the physical world with the networked world, sometimes called "cyberplace" or "cyberspace."

1.2 The aim of the study

The Sunflower Student Movement can be seen as a single historical event that suddenly occurred, but of course, it also reflected the complex political and historical context in Taiwanese society. Based on Foucault's power-knowledge concept (1980, 1990, 1991), this research considers mobile network and spatial practices basic elements in media practice and everyday agency. The research method uses Fairclough's critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 2006) to focus on the relationship between the movement and social context, further exploring the intertwined relationship between Taiwan's cultural identity, economy and politics. In the background of cultural identity in Taiwan, this study seeks to achieve the following goals by analyzing texts of newspapers from the time of the movement.

First, this study examines the political, historical and cultural entanglement from the past to the future. After the end of World War II, although Taiwanese people got rid of the shadow of Japanese colonial rule in the half-century, what followed was the controversial policies of Nationalist government (國民政府). In 1947, a series of policies implemented by the Nationalist government led to the outbreak of the 228 Incident. The 228 Incident resulted from a large-scale anti-government uprising triggered by Tobacco Monopoly agents' improper confiscation of contraband cigarettes from a woman. The Nationalist government, led by Kuomintang (國民黨, KMT), violently suppressed the protesters and killed thousands of civilians by military force in Taipei on February 28. The incident led to fierce conflicts between locals (本省人) and mainlanders (外省人), which have impacted on Taiwanese history and political landscape (Lai, 1994). In 1989, the Taiwanese government proclaimed the lifting of martial law. In the following year, the Wild Lily Student Movement (野百合運動) initiated by university students further requested the government to reform the political system, such as the direct election of Taiwan's president and vice president. This successful

student movement not only marked the transitional stage of Taiwan's democratization, but also showed the influence of the social movement on the government's policy. Similarly, the Sunflower Student Movement was also a large-scale social movement mobilized by university students. However, the participants' use of modern technology tools led to a completely different form of mobilization and organization compared to the Wild Lily Student Movement.

The name "Wild Lily Movement" symbolized the subjective identity of Taiwan and the pursuit of justice (Lin, 1990, p. 116), while the name "Sunflower Student Movement" was a historical accident. This name "Sunflower" was widely used after a florist contributed many sunflowers to the Legislative Yuan to encourage students (Ho, 2019, p. 11). Through the spread of images in media, the sunflower became the symbol of this political occupation and made the connection with wild lily. To some extent, the "Sunflower" inherited the spirit of the Wild Lily Movement of 1990. Although the demands and social backgrounds of these two movements were nearly different, they both promoted the development of the political institutions in Taiwan. Therefore, the Sunflower Student Movement not only showed the younger generation's insistence on political reforms, but also carried the shared memory of Taiwan's democratization process. More importantly, overnight, the ruling party awakened people's memories of the history of martial law. Under this historical context, the concept of "Taiwanese people" (台灣人) strengthened in this movement present the integration and change of Taiwan's politics, culture and society.

Second, this study explores the role of mobile media in such societal movements. The development of modern digital technology has promoted more people to immerse themselves in the space of collective imagination. For example, the use of social media has aroused widespread concern among political and social actions. Individuals and groups can quickly organize and deliver messages through the immediacy and connectivity of the Internet, and

use the infinite creativity of virtual space to influence the patterns of the real world. Such a phenomenon allows people to gather considerable energy in a short period and challenge the inequalities of power. When the message on the Internet replaces word of mouth, everyone's ideas will have a great chance to be combined into a universal yearning. Thus, people's consciousness will be embodied in the various means of practice. The Sunflower Student Movement has been seen as a new form of protest. Participants controlled the authority and media that called for more people to cooperate. By the use of mobile media, the young generation has been more willing to be involved in political actions.

Third, this study seeks to analyze the dynamics of the construction of knowledge and power in a world characterized by mobile networks. The methods of acquiring modern knowledge are no longer limited to books. However, various knowledge systems still influence individual values and ideologies in specific social, economic and cultural environments. People are often aware of the homogeneity and heterogeneity that lie in different forms of knowledge. A person's comprehension of some issues is related to specific types of knowledge. Individuals or groups will process corresponding information based on different life experiences and values. This contradiction is likely to bring about inevitable resistance and conflict between the public and the government. Moreover, although a few elites can no longer completely monopolize the production of knowledge, experts still dominate how knowledge is practiced in everyday life. In the field of media and communication, the relation between production and consumption has been moving towards fragmentation. Consumers can also act as producers and vice versa. Toffler (1980) used the term "prosumers" to suggest that when people consume and produce the media content, the boundary between producers and consumers will be blurred. Jenkins (2006) stressed the values of convergence culture "where the power of the media producer and the power of the media consumer interact in unpredictable ways" (p. 2). In this context, consumers can work

together in the virtual environment to solve problems concerning controversial issues and governmental policies, as Jenkins (2006) describes the concept of “collective intelligence” in the networked society. In this dynamic process, thus, the power-knowledge relation will fluctuate with various external factors, including regime change, economic recession and technological development. Under certain circumstances, if people can extend the influence of netizens to the real world, ordinary people can get more opportunities to participate in the transformation of the social power structure. Foucault (1986) suggested that “one exercises power within a network in which one occupies a key position. In a certain way, one is always the ruler and the ruled” (p. 87). Now people live in a world where political participation and the media have been combined to create new political games. There is a relative relationship between power, consumer and producer. As a result, the rise of the “individual power in the mobile network” partly means the reduction of knowledge monopoly. Individuals can acquire or create knowledge in various ways and circulate information that is beneficial to their interests.

2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 Media and mobile networks—from “the extensions of man” to “the Thumbelina”

McLuhan’s now classic idea was to point out that the influence of media shapes the forms of human behaviors (1964). He stressed that sometimes the means of message are more important than the message itself. Moreover, communication technology can not only cause sensory changes in human beings but also promote the changes in a social structure. For the Internet, Manuel Castells suggests a concept of “network society” (Castells, 1996), which discusses the Internet has been involving in people’s everyday life in every respect. People could open new ways to source and distribute the information that they receive. To explore how the Internet (the network of communities) exists in real places and how computer-supported social network affects access to resources, Wellman (2001) suggested the concept of “personalized networking”. He points out that the Internet is a complicated social network and discuss the boundaries between individuals and physical community.

In the 2000s, some scholars had proposed that mobile phones could create new personal networks or monitoring mechanisms between individuals (Campbell & Park, 2008; Fortunati, 2002; Green, 2002b). Moreover, Mizuko Ito (2008) defines the “networked publics” as a “linked set of social, cultural, and technological developments” (p. 2). Individuals gradually become active users and creators of the media with communication technologies in everyday life. Thus, with the advent of mobile media, the public can be involved in shared communities through discourse, sensory experience and social practices.

At the political level, Dutton’s (2009) research has argued that the emergence of “fifth estate” promotes the change in power and communication for the public to challenge the established societies and political patterns. Individuals can gain subtle opportunities to transform the system of power from government or organizations. In other words, the fifth estate refers to the collective knowledge that is generated in the process of exchanging

opinions and views. The flow of information formed between individuals can become collective power. As a result, the personalized mobile devices facilitate individuals to create diversified nodes which can contact the cyberspace anytime and anywhere to acquire and maintain public knowledge.

The mobile media has significantly expanded the essential concept of time-space compression (Harvey, 1990). Today the mobile network has completely changed people's perception of our society and culture. With technological innovation, the Internet has become an indispensable part of cultural life. However, Massey (1993) have proposed the concept of power-geometry to remind us that there is power inequality caused by differential mobility: "The time-space compression of some groups can undermine the power of others" (p. 63). Thus, we need to ask what the essence of mobile media (smartphone in particular) is? Maurizio Ferraris' s (2015) idea of documentality provides valuable insight into the nature of this complex social environment. Ferraris argues that "the boom of writing is one of the most significant proofs of the relevance of what I call 'documentality,' that is, the environment in which social objects are generated" (p. 63). Writing can actualize the inner thought and consciousness in the various forms of texts. Now people can rely on their smartphone to accomplish many tasks, for example, making comments on social media, sending instant messages and taking notes. From this point of view, Ferraris points out three incalculable advantages of writing. First, possibilities of public accessibility. Second, continuous presence. Third, a form of repetition or instantiation (Ferraris, 2015, p. 63-64). These three characteristics of writing can help us to understand the essence of the smartphone. In other words, it is these characteristics that make smartphones unique compared to other technological devices. If we apply the concept to everyday practices, the social movements have presented dynamic agencies that have transformed the political and social landscape nowadays.

The popularity of mobile devices may be seen as a new turn of the mobile network. Throughout the evolution of mobile communication, people are now experiencing a world where everything can be in the relation of digitalization. Serres (2014) used the idea of “Thumbelina” as a modern metaphor to explore a new cultural and technological phenomenon. Thumbelina implies that individuals who use smartphones by their fingers have experienced new types of lifestyles. This idea means that smartphones (as the most common mobile devices) have changed the ways we perceive our societal circumstances. Serres (2014) claimed that “our intelligent head has been externalized outside our skeletal and neuronal head” (p. 19). Now that people rely on modern devices to process and collect a bunch of information, replacing some of the functions of our brains and affecting our reasonable judgments. As a result, the body is one of the crucial factors to perform ourselves in the mobile network, since people usually carry their mobile devices with them wherever they go. Thus, the mobile network should be seen as the practice of contemporary digital culture.

2.1.1 Media as practices

Can we regard mobile communication promoted by mobile devices as a new field of media? (Campbell, 2013). This study follows Couldry (2004), who explored “the possibility of a new paradigm of media research that understands media, not as texts or structures of production, but as practice” (p. 115). Couldry was concerned that people had been affected and penetrated by the media unconsciously that would produce various ways of practice. According to him, these practices are not confined to the audience practices, but how the rules of media affect practice in the social world. The interaction between human and the media is a complicated process of social construction. When people actively use mobile applications to share various contents, they participate in the shared space of collective discussion or debate online. For example, the citizen can comment on specific public policies on the Facebook page for the government or politicians. Another typical example is the use of the “meme” that can virally

spread concepts and ideas. Thus, the core of the practices is to better understand the life experiences and cultural values of the ordinary people in social networks.

Moreover, Couldry (2012) noted that “practice points to things that we do because they relate to human *needs*” (p. 34). Thus, media practices can help us understand concert issues in a mediated society. For example, individuals can use the customized application of social media on their smartphones to complete many tasks in specific situations. The concept of practices thus is applicable to look into the practical relation between people and media:

[W]hat types of things do people do in relation to media? And what types of things do people say (think, believe) in relation to media? ...we must look closely at what people are doing, saying and thinking in relation to media. (Couldry, 2012, p. 40)

Through this approach, this thesis considers the mobile media whole concept, focusing on the variability of mobile devices in media practice and analyze the interaction between mobile media, body and space. Furthermore, this study explores the direct connection between people and the mobile media (for example, the formation of the Internet generation), or the conspiracy between government agencies and technology (for example, monitoring mechanisms). From this point of view of practice, this study attempts to demonstrate how the subtle communication between society, humans, media and space will alter the power-knowledge relation in a societal context.

2.1.2 The mutual transformation of space and place

Explaining the creative places extended by mobile media, it is necessary to define the connection and distinction between space and location. Lefebvre (1991) suggested that space is the social product that embodies meanings into people by the practices of social power. Cresswell (2009) pointed out that a place is a combination of materiality, meaning and

practice. In fact, materiality, meaning and practice are inextricably linked, but the symbolic meaning of practice is a more critical factor that constitutes places. “The sense we get of a place is very dependent on practice ... Space becomes a place when it is used and lived” (Cresswell, 2009, p. 2). Thus, the individual’s experience can change the structure of power in a given space and contact the boundaries between space and place. Furthermore, de Certeau (1984) suggested that “space is a practiced place” (p. 117). For places, space is operational and flexible. The formation of behavior and actions we create in any place will affect the stability of space. The spatial practices established by the meaningful place, or the changes of the spatial order, expose the power game between places and space.

With the development of mobile networks (or we can claim that the media has been re-invented/re-interpreted.), numerous places are activated consciously or unconsciously. How these places are involved in a fixed pattern of space? As Harvey (1993) interprets that “The only interesting question that can be asked is, by what social process(es) is place constructed?” (p. 5). The significance of the place is to understand the process of social construction. The practices of places also imply the possibility of resistance, exposing how people participate in the reproduction of knowledge and culture. It is noteworthy that, to some extent, the so-called reproduction does not have the agency to subvert the social structure completely, but it can circumvent the “suppressed” space system through obscure and subtle actions.

2.1.3 Spatial practices

The use of mobile devices has changed human perception and sensation. Fixed places no longer constrain people. Particularly, the advent of smartphones and the development of cellular technology have impacted on all aspects of life. People use smartphones to meet personal and social needs. According to Campbell (2008), the relationship between the body and the communication process can be seen as an integral concept. Mobile devices provide

people with limitless opportunities for connection to the space of the Internet. Modern technological communication extends our bodies beyond the scope of fixed locations. Nowadays, people bring mobile phones with them whenever going to work, walking on the street or sitting in a classroom. This phenomenon echoes the idea of “pedestrian movement” which de Certeau (1984) proposed. The pedestrian movements can actualize possibilities and interdictions in spatial order. Pedestrians find a few possibilities and constraints fixed by the constructed order in the urban space. They take alternative actions to actualize the spatial practices, for example, crossing the street, creating shortcuts or detours. Space thus becomes an operational entity. Individuals or group’s micro-practice activities can escape the supervisory mechanism to create “tactics” and penetrate them into the social network. Nevertheless, “a few of these multiform, resistance, tricky and stubborn procedures that elude discipline without being outside the field it is exercised, and which should lead us to a theory of everyday practices, of lived space...” (de Certeau, 1984, p. 96). The pedestrians do not have the power to change or replace the specific space and institutions, but they grasp the various “opportunities” to express the “art of the weak” (de Certeau, 1984).

Based on de Certeau’s spatial practices, individuals are involved in the mobile network to actualize the acts of reorganizing, creating and transforming the spatial order. The connection between the body and media creates countless continuous places to immerse in “space of flows” (Castells, 2009). The mobile communication redefines the concepts of space and time. The progress of communication technologies has transformed the power relationship of social structure. That is, social movements gain momentum through the various applications of mobile devices. As a result, the collective consciousness has formed different nodes and networks to destabilizes the operation of power everywhere (Rheingold, 2003). To some extent, people in distant places can share the same feeling for an event at the same time, even if they occupy different spaces and places.

2.2 Foucault's power-knowledge relation

Drawn from Foucault's concept of power-knowledge (1990), there is no knowledge outside the sphere of power. Knowledge can be considered as different creations of power. On the other hand, knowledge impacts the operation of power in specific institutions, organizations and fields. Foucault (1990) argued that "relations of power-knowledge are not static forms of distribution, they are 'matrices of transformations'" (p. 99). Thus, power is multiple combinations of forces that provide any possibility to be involved in knowledge. For the mobile network, it is important to see power-knowledge relations are expanded to a great extent at any time. Because, for example, the popularity of social media makes more people connect unnoticeable(hidden) information in different ways. Thus, individuals can gain their own power to reproduce or create systems of knowledge. Foucault (1990) emphasized that "power is everywhere; not because it embraces everything, but because it comes from everywhere" (p. 93). With the rapid development of the mobile network, power can produce knowledge without the permission of experts. In other words, although power and knowledge still directly affect one another, normal people are able to apply their established ideas to disturb the power-knowledge systems. The production of knowledge not only refers to the opinions of majorities but also the disagreements of minorities. The "local centers" of power increases rapidly via mobile communication in a particular society. The structures and constitutions of knowledge are supposed to be analyzed from the perspective of strategical domination.

The development of the Internet and mobile technology have provided the public with various ways of processing information. The interaction of the interpersonal network forms a closer boundary between virtuality and reality. The imaginary groups gathering on the Internet have been strong enough to influence the occurrence of events in the real society. The inseparable relationship between power and knowledge is not only constructed by professors,

experts, or politicians, but the general public is also involved in the penetration of the Internet. Therefore, today, the transmission of “knowledge” cannot be limited to the operation of a single traditional medium. All individuals can become a communicator and recipient of knowledge.

2.3 Culture, memory and resistance

Broadly speaking, “culture” can be seen as a way of understanding the country and self-identity, which distinguishes us from the other. As Barth (1998) said that “some cultural features are used by the actors as signals and emblems of differences, others are ignored, and in some relationships radical differences are played down and denied” (p. 14). Anderson (2006) reminded us that the concepts of nation, nation-ness and nationality are “cultural artefacts of particular kind” (p. 4). A nation is an imagined political community, representing a complex cultural phenomenon. When we talk about Taiwanese culture, the culture never leads to an accurate way of recognizing oneself. It contains the possibilities of various practices. As Said (2003) stated, “[A]ll cultures are involved in one another; none is single and pure, all are hybrid, heterogeneous, extraordinarily differentiated, and unmonolithic” (xxix). Anyone who attempts to embody a cultural discourse in the concept of a single nation or ethnicity will take the risk of shaping “cultural hegemony” (Said 1994). Said (1994) also reminded us that “there is another dimension of cultural discourse—the power to analyze, to get past cliché and straight out-and-out lies from authority, the questioning of authority, the search for alternatives” (p. 159). Therefore, culture may be conceptualized as a form of creative resistance that develops in response to changes in society and culture. Culture is not only the communication and interaction of life experiences between individuals and others but also the construction of dynamic processes. Its power can be liberated in words, pointing to the core of the problems, giving the public the ability to reinterpret their own living conditions. That is to say, when culture is free from concrete forms such as rituals, traditional

customs, celebrations, it produces a symbolic, abstract and emotional attachment to challenge the intrinsic ideology. Said (2003) claimed that “memory is a powerful collective instrument for preserving identity. And it’s something that can be carried not only through official narratives and books but also through informal memory. It is one of the main bulwarks against historical erasure. It is a means of resistance” (p. 182-183). Thus, the core issue of culture may lie in how to awaken and utilize people’s collective memories to resist the established order of society and politics. For Taiwanese, these memories have stemmed from the memories of authoritarian era and the doubts about self-identity.

Regarding the connection between culture and memory, Jan Assmann’s concept of cultural memory provides a framework that is useful for this study (2011). Generally speaking, memory is one of human’s instinctive reactions. Some things are easy to forget, and some things can be “stored” forever. He suggests that cultural memory, as a critical idea, discovers how the symbolic meaning in memory inherits the collective identity and shapes contemporary society and culture. According to J. Assmann (2011), “Cultural memory, then, focuses on fixed points in the past, but again it is unable to preserve the past as it was. This tends to be condensed into symbolic figures to which memory attaches itself” (p. 37). Thus, although memory cannot be restored for the whole picture of the past, the various symbolic meanings implied in past events can provide the experience of others to think and understand the current situation. Memories also serve as a strategy of resistance, helping us to look at how the real world and past imaginations are intertwined at a particular moment and trigger the power of change. Jan Assmann (2011) pointed out the importance of the medium in which memory is stored. For example, the invention of written language (text) is closely related to the functions of cultural memory. Texts have quickly improved the human’s ability to absorb a large amount of information that fosters the spread of memories in the past. Thus, the development of the media endowed human with new forms of society and culture, and also

influenced the communication system between individual's practices.

Focusing on the use of modern technological tools, Aleida Assmann (2011) illustrated how the evolving media forms act on the types of memory, and the interaction between media, memory, and humans. In contemporary society, the rapid transformation of media implies an inevitable turning point. The new media not only allows information to flow in ever-changing communication but also expands the scope of imagination in the communication network. People can connect with close friends and distant others in unexpected ways. Although digital text should be regarded as one of the forms of writing, its form of transmission has broken the boundaries of cultural memory in subtle ways. Digital texts have more potential to carry specific ideas. By faster and more convenient ways, these ideas can remind us that there still exists fragmented collective consciousness in our society. The advent of new media forms an increasingly dense communication network that allows information to flow quickly by unexpected strategy. Digital texts also mean that new information technology has partly replaced the functions of printing. As a result, mobile media significantly enhances the complexity of the collective imagination.

Aleida Assmann (2011) suggested that "there is the path of electronic information technology, which facilitates increasingly simple and comprehensive techniques of recording, while at the same time sharpens perception of whatever cannot be stored and will be lost forever" (p. 205). With the development of mobile media, memorial forms should be regarded as the production of continuous transformation in the interaction with the current society. The new media can reveal complex ideas, or emphasize the role of ideology. When groups can create new intellectual power through the media, any possible reforms may happen. Recently, some studies have used the concept of cultural memory to deal with issues related to political change and globalization (A. Assmann & Conrad, 2010; A. Assmann & Shortt, 2012). The dynamic connection of culture and memory can not only focus on the constructive

relationship between a group and memory but also analyze the vital role of memory in the democratic system. In the context of the era of globalization, memory theory provides an approach to re-explore the field of media, culture and communication.

As mentioned above, with the rapid development of networking and technology tools, significant changes have taken place in the storage and retrieval of memory. Digital media and mobile devices have become an indispensable element in modern life. The advancement of mobile media has promoted the application of the so-called Web 2.0 platforms, such as Facebook, Twitter and YouTube. What is the transformation of the perception of memory in the mobile age? Hoskins (2009) introduced the notion of digital network memory to argue the relationship between media and memory: “The very use of these systems contributes to a new memory—an emergent digital network memory—in that communications in themselves dynamically add to, alter, and erase, a kind of living archival memory” (p. 92). Nowadays, the reproduction of the past can rely on the accessibility of mobile technologies and the reproducibility of contents to spread texts and images. This new phenomenon that reconstructs the power relations between the public affects the emotions and value judgments of the individuals, authorities and the government.

This research suggests that the Sunflower Student Movement can be seen as an abrupt social event that has changed the self-cognition of the general public at the social and cultural level. Undoubtedly, the new media played an important role in affecting the direction of public opinion. Everyone could have an opportunity to become a journalist to deliver diverse information about specific events. In particular, the young generation has used mobile technologies to challenge the power of the ruling government. They expressed and shared their knowledge to form unpredictable power. In this thesis, this process of being involved in the space of mobile network should be considered spatial practices. As Rheingold (2003) suggests that “just as existing notions of community were challenged by the emergence of

social networks in cyberspace, traditional idea about the nature of place are being challenged as computing and communication devices begin to saturate the environment” (p. xxii).

Furthermore, people’s sensory experience has no doubt combined with their mobile devices.

Thus, the concept of “media place” can be constituted in terms of human mobility. That is, the places that individuals create contain dynamic meanings in the concept of the mobile network.

Individuals can not only own their private communities but also create collective consciousness to participate in social relations.

3 METHODOLOGY

3.1 Framework and methods

3.1.1 Genealogical approach—discourse, knowledge and power

Foucault's genealogical method demonstrates the interconnected relationship between power, knowledge and discourse. In *Discipline and punish* (Foucault, 1991), Foucault examined the discourse of historical documents to trace the emergence of prison. He uses the concept of discipline to explain how the body is “domesticated” in the network of power. In *The history of sexuality* (Foucault, 1990), Foucault explored how the operation of power constitutes people's cognitive consciousness from the discourse of sexuality in a given history. Based on Foucault's approach, the main point of genealogy is power-knowledge relations. By analyzing the functions of power from modern historical views, we can discover the origins and statement of specific issues (Kendall & Wickham, 1999). According to Carabine (2001), Foucault saw discourses as “on the one hand, being infused with power/knowledge and, on the other hand as playing the role in producing power/knowledge network” (p. 268). Specifically, through the power-knowledge relation, Foucault's genealogy provides us with an approach to investigate the implications within and behind discourse in a specific period. Furthermore, the world is a “profusion of entangled events” (Foucault, 1971, p. 89). That is, discourses will be constituted subtly based on social and cultural change. They construct “true knowledge” and create “social reality” in particular moments. Thus, we need to focus on the factors and impact of a sudden event in our society.

Foucault's concept of *episteme* (1994) can be used to explain the limitations of knowledge in a certain period of history (p. 168). In other words, knowledge defines the framework in which knowledge becomes possible and the functions of knowledge in society. Taking the classification method of an encyclopedia as an example, Foucault pointed out that there is no same classification standard in the world. A specific standard is determined

according to the life experience of different ethnic groups. Knowledge becomes an object that can be changed and modified. It will be classified and developed into an independent discipline. Therefore, knowledge does not directly refer to the long-lasting truth. In the process of distributing knowledge to others, there may be misinterpretation, reinforcement, and omission of specific ideas to achieve a certain purpose. A possible example is that some governments dominate the right to interpret policies and establish the rationality of their policies in specific knowledge systems (such as an authoritative economic data), but the opposition also questions these situations. Knowledge is closely related to the power mechanism. Different knowledge has a mutual transformation effect in the power structure. Foucault's later work expanded the framework of power-knowledge relations, claiming that the new humanities knowledge is a system of control and management formed by a group of experts. Doctors, psychiatrists, social workers, and other professionals can legalize certified knowledge and impose power on target audiences. Dennis Wrong (1988) took the notion of "competent authority" to explain how power works in this relation: "Competent authority is a power relation in which the subject obeys the directives of the authority out of belief in the authority's superior competence or expertise to decide which actions will best serve the subject's interests and goals" (p. 52). Thus, the government, authoritative units and upper-level elites have the ability to control the right to speak and guide significant issues. Such power relations control/limit the actions of the vast majority of people.

3.1.2 Critical discourse analysis

Critical discourse analysis (CDA) is an interdisciplinary approach to research the power relations between language and social practice. Researchers have been dedicated to studying how discourses are shaped in a specific social context, and how language strengthens societal power relations. Based on the theory of linguistics and sociology, critical discourse analysis has developed a sophisticated theoretical framework to study the process of ideology and

power involved in “social wrong” (Chouliaraki & Fairclough, 1999). To a large extent, this study of critical discourse analysis aims at dealing with the issue of social problems: political movements, ethnic minorities, economic inequality and so on. Critical discourse analysis has combined with classical sociological theories, for example, the important contributions from Michel Foucault and Pierre Bourdieu that urge scholars to continually revise the theoretical framework to fit the contexts of contemporary society.

This thesis uses Norman Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis (2006). The main reasons are as follows. First, Fairclough is a prolific scholar who focuses on the process of language involved in social practice, exposing the dialectical relationship between discourse and social structure. In other words, the discourses are limited by the constraints of the social structure, but also constructs the various aspects of the social structure (Fairclough, 1992). The discourses can be seen as a reproduction of social practice, giving the event a specific meaning. Second, Fairclough’s theoretical framework is relational and continuous. The concepts of the three-dimensional analysis are not static. The theoretical framework will be revised according to different social problems. This thesis agrees that Fairclough’s analytical framework emphasizes the role of “intermediary.” As indicated above (Fairclough, 1992), the three-dimensional method of discourse analysis is divided into three concepts: text, discourse practice (text production and text interpretation), sociocultural practice. According to Fairclough, discourse practices are the medium between text and sociocultural practices. Directly speaking, a text which can be presented as written or spoken language that is embodied in the discourse process of production. The production and interpretation of a text is discourse practice. Discourse practice is explained by the nature of the sociocultural practice that embodied in different levels of society, such as institutions and organizations. From this point of view, although this analytical structure implies a progressive relationship,

discourse practices as a medium enable the subtle connection between text and sociocultural practice to emerge.

Following the three-dimensional method of discourse analysis, Fairclough further revised the theoretical model in the book *Language and Globalization* (2006) and introduced the theory of cultural political economy. He distinguished the analytical framework of critical discourse analysis between concrete and abstract levels. The three levels include social events, social practices and social structures which are suitable for analysis in the context of globalization and social change. At the most concrete level, social events refer to all the events and behaviors that can be seen as the term “text.” Discourse belongs to a moment of social events that are dialectically interconnected with different moments. Fairclough (2006) suggested that “social events are what actually is done or happens” (p. 30). At the most abstract level, social structures imply the relative general and enduring systems, structures and ideologies in societies. The social events and social structures can be seen as the opposite levels which define the possibility and actuality of various elements. There are no direct relations between social events and social structures. The connection between social structures and social events are mediated by social practices. “Social practices are habitual, ritual or institutionalized ways of ‘going on’, which are associated with..., at a more concrete level, particular organizations (such as a school or a business)” (Fairclough, 2006, p. 30). According to Fairclough, the three dimensions have semiotic moments respectively. There is a dialectical relationship between a moment and other moments. The critical discourse analysis provides a relational approach to research how new discourses have constructed existing discourses. Following this idea, this paper will regard the construction of discourses as the establishment of knowledge. By analyzing the subtle relations between the semiotic moments of social events, this study demonstrates the possibilities of resistance evoked by mobile media.

This study will mainly appropriate and borrow Fairclough's (2006) three-dimensional approaches to analyze text (p. 8-9). These three approaches are hierarchical and mutually compatible. First, CDA includes analysis of instances of language use. This concept implies how the language is used to describe the mode of scattered texts. For example, the concept of democracy is interpreted in the historical and social context of Taiwan. Or, in what way is the concept of new media described? Second, CDA also focuses on the relationship between discourse and categories, and is involved in "intertextual" relations in a larger text. For example, we can discover the characteristics of democracy in a particular text, but such a discourse can only appear and present stability in a variety of texts. For example, the discourse of "citizen participation in protests" and "government's right to exclude protesters" are part of democratic politics, but the practice of individuals and governments is divided into different categories of democratic discourse. Finally, CDA is also involved in relations between discourse. The other elements of social events and social practices that are discussed in daily life will shape different outcomes. For example, democratic discourse and democratic strategies can make democracy itself ambiguous. In other words, the implementation of democratic discourse may lead to different ways of action and interaction. As mentioned above, this thesis will explore the construction and composition of texts in an illustrative, parallel, and comparative manner.

Based on the power-knowledge relations, this research discusses the specific knowledge systems formed during a certain period. The discourse should be regarded as reproductions of knowledge. It is impossible to draw the whole picture of knowledge because knowledge is the performance of collective consciousness in the complex society. In other words, knowledge, in a given cultural and social context, will construct a convincing system. These systems, from the perspective of media and communication, are composed of specific messages transmitted by experts in various fields. The core of this study is to discuss

constructive models in the Sunflower Student Movement through the points of society, culture, history and politics. This thesis is centered on the topic of spatial practice and personal power, analyzing the text of the newspaper to deal with the phenomenon of Taiwan's social and cultural changes. Therefore, the three-level analytical model is highly operable to explore the complicated relationship between cultural memory, media change and spatial practice. As Foucault (1994) repeatedly stated, the social and cultural environment in which we live is composed of various discourses. The discourse is a process in which social groups follow specific cognitions to communicate its connotation to society and interact with other groups. It can be said that discourse refers to the phenomenon of the transmission and construction of various messages of knowledge in human society, such as concepts, attitudes and beliefs. Since different levels of society have their specific formations of discourse, the complex changes during this period are at the heart of the discussion. Discourse analysis provides us with a path to gaze at the relationship between the subject and their world. The type of discourse can be small like an electronic message at a moment, or large as a knowledge system at a period. To put it simply, discourse refers to the ideological system that the public is accustomed to, but these ideas are constructive cognitive systems. The relationship between the initiator and the recipient of discourse is a dynamic process that promotes a specific cultural and social system.

Practically speaking, the research framework includes three elements: first, media and space. The mobile media have changed the forms of communication between individuals and others. Mobile devices and the Internet provide more effective ways for protesters to break through possible space constraints and create various communication strategies. Second, the relationship between power and knowledge. The deliberations on the economic, cultural, and social issues of the Sunflower Student Movement can be regarded as the reproduction of knowledge. Discourses themselves are the reinterpretation of knowledge. Through discourse

analysis, power relations are revealed. Third, cultural memory and resistance. The underlying factors of this movement can be attributed to the debates of Taiwan's national and cultural identity. The concept of cultural memory helps clarify the conflict between politics and generations. These above three elements connect different internet issues. They mutually involved the process of the Sunflower Student Movement, showing Taiwan's unique political and economic and historical background.

Fairclough's critical discourse analysis (2006) is a practical tool to look at social problems. The structure of this thesis follows Fairclough's three-dimensions framework—social events, social practices, and social structures—to analyze the newspaper reports. In chapter four, section 4.1 examines the causes of the Sunflower Student Movement and the deep connection between Taiwan society and culture. This section also discusses Taiwan's identity, political tendencies and generational differences from the trauma of Taiwan's historical events. The section 4.2 construct new forms of mobile networks, human bodies, and resistance. With mobile devices, especially smartphones, it has been more accessible for people to gather in physical and virtual spaces via the Internet. This phenomenon gives the body multiple characteristics of mobility. By the combination of mobile phones and the Internet, protesters can reach anyone and spread messages simultaneously in different spaces and places. Section 4.3 focuses on the possible implications of Taiwan's democratic system under the impact of the Sunflower Student Movement. For example, people are more willing to participate in politics and even set up new political parties to demand social change. In this context, the changes in individual power symbolize the complex and pluralistic dynamic relationship between the public and the government.

Therefore, borrowing Fairclough's method, this paper uses newspapers as the data source to make the following discussions in order. First, the Sunflower Student Movement was a social event. This event was composed of specific social, cultural and political

elements. Second, the mobile network is a universal social practice. When people can exchange information through mobile devices in motion, they also change the organization and mobilization model of the protest. Third, Taiwan's social institution and individual power can be seen as part of the social structure. Interactions, resistances, and compromises between individuals and governments are all kinds of power relations. Following the theoretical framework of Fairclough, this thesis suggests that the mobile network as the medium of the Sunflower Student Movement and the power relations. In other words, the mobile network actualized the possibility of the movement and transformed the disciplinary power in society. Therefore, this study analyzes the discourses to explore the connection between various critical elements and demonstrate the dynamic relationship between the mobile network and space in power relations. The knowledge-power relation and discourse are intertwined. Everyone with "knowledge" can shape one thing and speak out what the thing is. Thus, this thesis requests that how discourse creates the subjects (Taiwanese) and how the subjects perform themselves. The subjects present a productive, uncertain, plural, fluid, and open construction process.

3.2 Data collection

This thesis mainly uses the relevant reports of the three major newspaper groups—China Times” (中國時報), “United Daily News” (聯合報) and “Liberty Times” (自由時報)—as the data for the analysis of the Sunflower Student Movement in Taiwan. This movement has had a profound impact on Taiwan's long-term social and political environment, directly causing the defeat of the ruling party in national mayoral elections at the end of 2014 (Hsieh, 2015; Clark & Tan, 2016). Even in 2016, Taiwan's second party alternation was closely related to this movement, marking the increase in Taiwanese national identity and major shift toward the political and economic cooperation with China (Hsiao, 2016). This paper collects the newspaper articles about the Sunflower Student Movement from 2014 to 2018 to clearly

explain its causes and subsequent impact. The source of data also includes editorials and letters to the editor. All original newspaper articles in this thesis were published in Traditional Chinese. The author of this thesis translated the data into English by literal and free translation. The process of translation would inevitably lead to the changes and destruction of the original text. Thus, all original titles of newspaper articles for analysis are included in the appendix for reference to demonstrate the function of the discourse analysis thoroughly. Readers can easily find the original articles which they are interested in studying. Besides, some important Chinese concepts, proper nouns, and Internet terms are placed in parentheses after the English name to indicate the social and cultural context of Taiwan. In this way, readers can avoid the possible mistakes and limitations of translated texts.

This thesis uses the database —Taiwan News Smart Web (台灣新聞智慧網), and the original newspapers kept by the National Central Library (國家圖書館) to find out the targeted data. First, to accurately collect news reports about this movement, this study uses the keywords to search for news reports which are consistent with this study, setting the time frame from 2014 to 2018. This period covers the scope from the occurrence of the Sunflower Student Movement to the outcomes of the court trial. The selected keywords include free trade agreement (服貿), Sunflower Student Movement (太陽花運動), the Internet (網路), new media (新媒體), Legislative Yuan (立法院), democracy (民主) and national identity (國家認同). This step was that we could quickly grasp the title and outline of newspaper articles. The original texts provided by the database is beneficial to filter information and analysis. Second, based on the data from the Taiwan News Smart Web, I carefully studied, compared and analyzed the original newspaper at the National Central Library. The texts of newspaper collected in this study include 80 newspaper articles of the United Daily News, 43 newspaper articles of the Liberty Times and 68 newspaper articles of the China Times. The total number

of newspaper articles is 191 in which 42 reports, letters to the editor and editorials are deeply analyzed.

Why is the chosen newspaper of importance? According to Hsiao Yi-Ching (2006), the demographic structure and political attitudes of newspaper readers have shown that the reports of the China Times, the United Daily News and the Liberty Times present a “political bias” of varying degrees. The distribution of political spectrum shows that the contents of China Times and United Daily News tend to be “pan-blue (泛藍)” parties (headed by the Kuomintang, 國民黨) and the content of the Liberty Times tends to be “pan-green” (泛綠) parties (led by Democratic Progressive Party, 民進黨). Therefore, from the perspective of the public’s cognition, cultural identity and party politics are becoming more competitive and antagonistic with the changes in Taiwan’s society. People choose a specific newspaper in different positions that reflect the reader’s ideology and cultural identity. By seeing the differences between written language and reporting perspectives, we can find out how the three major newspapers convey designated messages to audiences. Therefore, the contents of these three newspapers may present extremely different dimensions, providing readers with multiple views. Based on the positions of printed newspapers, the number of circulation and the habits of reading, this study selects the China Times, the United Daily News and the Liberty Times as research data are reasonable and applicable.

When the traditional newspaper industry is facing the impact of new media, does it mean that the public is no longer concerned about the content conveyed by the newspaper? Or can it be said that the reader’s point of view is no longer easily subject to the contents of the newspaper? Lin Chao-Chen (2015) attempts to clarify the role of traditional newspapers in the era of new media from the perspective of “media aggregation.” This study suggests that Taiwan’s traditional newspaper industry has mainly focused on gaining commercial value and maintaining “survival,” ignoring the quality of reports. Moreover, large-scale consortia have

taken part in the operation of specific media, which makes the relationship between news stories and the public becomes a unilateral production and consumption behavior. This viewpoint describes how traditional newspapers respond to the rise of new media and its problems. Therefore, studying the Taiwanese newspaper's discourse can declare how issues can be interpreted and manipulated in the complicated relationship of politics, society and economy.

This thesis regards the contents of the newspaper as a fundamental source of discourse. These discourses are based on the context of power-knowledge relations. Their purpose is to interpret the tension between knowledge and power. Knowledge not only shapes the patterns of human society, but also complicates the facts or state of something. It can be said that expertise creates specific established experiences and orders that may be used for serving a particular purpose. Power is always related to knowledge. With the evolution of technology products and solutions, the symbolic meaning of space and place needs to be redefined. When the presence of people is no longer important in somewhere, the technological power has established and maintained order in a much subtle way. Although electronic media has changed people's means to receive news, the long-standing use of text which can be seen as the most important medium for carrying knowledge and memory has not left us. The content of traditional newspapers still has its importance to help the public understand the contradiction between public opinion and public interest. These inevitable contradictions effectively expose the variations between society, culture and value, even the gap between generations.

4 RESEARCH RESULTS

4.1 Collective and connective action: revisiting the Sunflower Student Movement

Students' occupation of the Legislative Yuan unveiled the prelude to the Sunflower Student Movement. The biggest public protest in Taiwan in the past decade was an opposition to the government's Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement with China. Opponents claimed that the government mobilized legislators to review the trade pact under-the-table (黑箱). They also expressed that "China factors" (中國因素) may have an impact on Taiwan's politics, economy, and media environment in an undemocratic manner (Rowen, 2015; Beckershoff, 2017). Because of this perceived failure of government administration to protect public interests, the student movement called for people from all walks of life to join this political movement.

Due to the innovation of digital technology, the forms of organization and communication in social movements have become more complicated. Participants in the protests may have different background factors that motivate them to fight against the government's established policies. In other words, the substantive connotation of social movements has been far more diverse than the propaganda and political discourses presented on the surface. One of the roles of the immediacy of digital media in social movements is how it incorporates individualized thoughts into the actions of the group. With the sharing characteristics of social media, personalized behaviors increase the willingness of participants and the intensity of issues in group actions (Bennett & Segerberg, 2011). Therefore, the public is not limited to common elements to be involved in collective action and consciousness. That is, ordinary people mainly project their interests into the publics' issues. They measure the close relationship between themselves, society and culture. Following this, the Sunflower Student Movement must be discussed in a complex, diverse and changing social context. Moreover, if people always regard the information they know as personal

cognition, the imaginary group will also be the production of social construction at the same time (Anderson, 2006). Based on the involved agency of this movement, this chapter traces the inextricable contradictions between Taiwanese society and politics, focusing on how the young generation enthusiastically participates in politics. In short, this chapter hopes to delve into the important symbolic codes and political motives in this movement.

4.1.1 Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement and the social movement

Political implication and the free economy at the globalization perspective

The Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement was an agreement based on Article 4 of the Economic Cooperation Framework Agreement (ECFA) signed by Taiwan and China in 2010. Taiwan's president at the time, Ma Ying-jeou (馬英九), believed that this service agreement would be beneficial to Taiwan's economic development (Ku & Chang, 2017, p. 903-905). There was the hope that Taiwan's service industry could enter China's vast market, and that this would normalize and institutionalize cross-strait economic relations. Article 1 of this service agreement pointed out that the agreement was aimed at achieving three objectives: First, gradually reducing or eliminating restrictive measures of service trade including many government departments between the two sides, and promote further liberalization and facilitation of service trade. Second, continuing to expand the breadth and depth of trade in services. Third, enhancing cooperation between the two sides in the field of service trade (Strait Exchange Foundation, 2012, p. 1). Considering the special political relationship between China and Taiwan, it could be seen that the service trade agreement was mainly a cooperation model based on the global economic environment. Globalization has brought the mobility of people, the flow of goods, and the delivery of information into an intricate network. The phenomenon of deterritorialization has blur the boundaries of sovereign states, leading to the integration of political and economic activities (Appadurai, 1996).

However, Harvey (2005) stressed the theoretical concept of space to explore the economic inequality caused by the development of neoliberalism. Wang (2017) has argued that this movement can be seen as the resistance of dual factors in the neoliberal economy and Chinese capital. As a result, Taiwanese politicians were faced with how to deal with controversial political issues with China through specific consultation mechanisms, and then join the process of economic integration on a global scale (Armstrong, 2013; Tien & Tung 2011). Therefore, President Ma's strategy was considered to be a trade policy of "From China to the world" (從中國走向世界). Furthermore, the government seemed to want to keep economic policies separate from political discussions. The following two news reports are examples to understand this trade agreement under the perspective of free trade:

President Ma said that the most important task at present is to accelerate the pace of liberalization and open market. ...The delay in the service agreement has caused doubts among trading partners. They believed that Taiwan is not easy to build consensus, which affecting their willingness to sign a free trade agreement and expand investment in Taiwan. (Ma, 2014, United Daily News)

President Ma expressed that after Taiwan signed the ECFA with China in 2011, Taiwan subsequently signed similar agreements with Japan, Singapore and New Zealand. The United States also resumed TIFA negotiations. "This is a very correct path," said Ma. (Qian & Wang, 2014, United Daily News)

These two reports illustrate how president Ma proposed to convey the two dimensions of the government's economic policy. First, the government attempted to dilute the political impact of the trade agreement by introducing the concept of globalization and focus on expressing

positive benefits. President Ma emphasized the relationship between trade and market liberalization. If the agreement could be smoothly legislated, it would help Taiwan's trade relations with other countries as well. In other words, the necessity of this agreement was not only to enable Taiwan to seize China's vast market, but also to take opportunities to join the global economic system. Second, the government argued that Taiwan's foreign trade policy must be based on economic and trade relations with China. As indicated in the second news report, the premise of Taiwan's trade agreements with other countries was to maintain unique economic and political relations with China. This perspective shows that there is no economic relationship without the political discussion in the complex political context of Taiwan. The following views stated by a Chinese official echo the above arguments:

The president of the Association for Relations Across the Taiwan Straits (海峽兩岸關係協會), Chen Deming, said that "If Taiwan does not further open its market, it will be marginalized in global competition!". ... The two sides should jointly create opportunities in the process of global integration and profound adjustment of the economic structure at the global level. ... When promoting cross-strait economic cooperation, ... the Association for Relations Across the Taiwan Straits will, under the framework of the "92 Consensus" (92共識) and the "One China policy," respect the social system and way of life chosen by the Taiwan compatriots. Mainland will also wish to first share the development opportunities with Taiwan compatriots. (Bai, 2014, China Times)

The expression of globalization and cross-strait economic cooperation conveys a dialectical relationship. Looking at the discourse, it becomes apparent that the symbolic significance of globalization is that Taiwan must rely on China's consumer market. The other side of the

argument was that if Taiwan were not integrated into China's economic system, it would be isolated itself from the global trade structure. Furthermore, it was made clear that any cross-strait economic negotiations should be based on the political framework that China adheres to (the 1992 Consensus, the One China Policy). Indeed, in the process of growing consumer markets in China, large multinational companies are sometimes forced to become involved in cross-strait political controversy. These certain controversial events have repeatedly illustrated the extraordinary complex and entangled relationship between politics and the economy of Taiwan. It can be said that Taiwan's foreign economic and trade policies must consider Chinese factors. Therefore, the social movement triggered by the service trade agreement can be regarded as the political effect triggered by economic policy. It also shows that the general public does not trust the government's ability to maintain Taiwan's political and economic autonomy.

When the government wanted to dominate the process of reviewing the service agreement, many experts and scholars expressed their worries. They saw economic and political issues as inseparable dynamic relationships. Especially in the face of the political pressure exerted by China, how Taiwan maintains its own autonomy will be an inevitable aspect. For example, the Liberty Times quoted the American cross-strait expert as saying:

ECFA and the subsequent service trade agreement will not help Taiwan's economy and regional integration. But if we think about China's long-term political intentions toward Taiwan, we can find that the service trade agreement will be a perfect agreement to promote Taiwan's integration into China. ...He observed that most of the industries of China mentioned in the service agreement were over-restricted. Many areas where Taiwanese industries could be located were also restricted to Fujian

Province, making him feel that China only regards Taiwan as part of “Fujian.” (Cao, 2014, Liberty Times)

This news report focused on the political shocks that Taiwan could face, which was different from the government’s view that suggested that the service agreement would be helpful to Taiwan’s economic integration. According to the experts and scholars of the time, economic issues were entangled with Taiwan’s national position in the long term. More importantly, they argued that under the restrictions of the agreement, Taiwan could increase its dependence on China’s economy and cater to China’s political intentions.

As mentioned above, the factors of the outbreak of the Sunflower Student Movement have presented very different ways of discussion in their respective positions. If discourse is regarded as an important component of knowledge construction, various interpretations of the service trade in the newspaper articles convey a fragment of knowledge. In other words, the statements in the newspaper articles provide not only relevant content of national policies but also controversial issues. The news reports as the narrative and reappearance of social issue illustrate the essential elements and implications of the Sunflower Student Movement. Moreover, by tracing the social conditions of a specific period, specific symbolic concepts will be presented under the interaction between politics and economy. Economic issues have always been closely related to the situation of the working class. However, data, samples and statistics cannot be strictly linked to people’s experiences in everyday life. Therefore, the economic debate on service trade will eventually shape the discourse on national security and people’s livelihood issues. Such the direction of discussion will bring the individual’s survival into the interests of the country as a whole.

Social security and everyday life

The disputes over the service trade agreement implied an ideological battle in the Taiwanese society. In addition to the issue of national orientation, there was also political competition between the ruling and opposition parties. Of course, the main crux of the matter was whether the deeper economic integration between cross-strait relations would benefit the current lifestyles and values of Taiwanese society in general. Would cross-strait economic and trade cooperation be a “silent threat” to Taiwan’s political and economic environment? The following letter to the editorial conveyed such concerns:

In addition to the enormous impact of the general public’s livelihood, we have unilaterally opened up advertising, printing, book wholesale, retail, telecommunications, transportation, and other projects to China, which will also affect our freedom of speech and national security, even endanger the democratic freedom that we rely on to survive. (Zheng, 2014, United Daily News)

This comment emphasized how the opening of different industries could impact Taiwan’s freedom of speech and national security. For example, the Chinese government would affect Taiwan’s freedom of speech through a unilateral censor mechanism for the publications of books. The opening of telecommunications and transportation would be a matter of national security. China’s technological innovations are likely to grasp Taiwan’s transportation resources, communications, and even dominate Taiwan’s political situation (Beckershoff, 2017). These discourses ignored the positive benefits that service trade may bring, directly pointing out the industry openness will affect existing lifestyles. Democracy and freedom are the core value of a country’s survival. Therefore, cross-strait economic issues were no longer just the inevitable result of globalization, but the daily miniature of ordinary people.

Furthermore, emphasizing the universal value of “we” also conveyed the fundamental differences between the cross-strait political systems. The economic and trade negotiations should be conducted without prejudice against the Taiwanese political and social system. The following report was another example:

The situation is severe. Chinese people have overstayed after coming to Taiwan, ... If the government of Ma enforces the service agreement in the Legislative Yuan, the issue will not under control. ...If the government cannot propose more effective control measures, then the problem will become worse. (Luo, 2014, Liberty Times)

In this case, the description of national security and social security like synonymous refers to the inseparable relationship between individuals and nations. Once again, the overall economic problems were ignored temporarily. The possible outcomes of social issues under the trade policy became the main issue.

The controversial review procedure of the service trade agreement triggered the Sunflower Student Movement. The dynamic connection between economic and political issues has influenced policy promotion in a long period. Generally speaking, political issues often imply an ideological battle. Taiwan’s ideological conflicts and national identity are intertwined in cross-strait communication complicating the implementation of various policies. What was the political implication of the concept of “Taiwanese identity” (台灣認同) in the Sunflower Student Movement? What kind of dialogue space was constructed between the imagined community and Taiwanese society?

4.1.2 The meaning of “Taiwan”: imagining Taiwanese people

Taiwan in the cross-strait relations

Lin Fei-fan (林飛帆, student leader) believes that everyone has started a new page that can never be erased in Taiwan’s history. We profoundly reflected on the constitutional system and the democratic system. We also defined a new relationship between Taiwan and China. That is, the future of Taiwan belongs to and depends on all Taiwanese people. (Ceng & Wang, 2014, Liberty Times)

The service agreement was not a purely domestic issue or economic issue. It involved the peaceful development of cross-strait economic and trade relations, even the stability in East Asia. ...The so-called “civil version” for cross-strait service trade supervision regulations supported by students who oppose CSSTA in an attempt to change Taiwan’s national position and identity. (“Who is an external force”, 2014, United Daily News)

The comparison between the meanings of “Taiwan” in these two texts illustrates the subtle connection between political conflict and the Sunflower Student Movement. The former news report quoted the student leader’s statement which not only defined the Sunflower Student Movement as a historical moment of civil resistance but also explicitly advocated that this movement redefined the relationship between “Taiwan” and “China.” This statement shows the dispute between the ideology and political ideas in this movement. The statement of “Taiwan’s constitutional system” and “democratic rule of law” raised the central axis of this movement regarding the deficit of the national political system. This movement called for

Taiwan's independence and tried to tell the people that the Taiwanese have the right to decide their future. It can be said that such a discussion implicitly combines "Taiwan" and "China" into a reciprocal state relationship. However, the latter editorial conveyed another opposite view: the subjectivity of "Taiwan" must be discussed in the framework of cross-strait relations and the stability in East Asia. That is, Taiwan's government cannot ignore the political framework set by China. Therefore, the service trade agreement itself was not a purely economic or internal issue but also a highly sensitive cross-strait sovereignty issue. The so-called "civil version" for the "cross-strait supervision regulations" (not yet passed to the date of writing this thesis) has caused some people to question the political intentions of the protesters.

The discourse of the time demonstrated the ambiguity of Taiwan as a political entity in cross-strait economic and trade relations. Precisely speaking, the struggle of national position citations referred to the possibilities and limitations of Taiwan within its society and in international relations. In addition to showing the surface phenomenon of Taiwan's economy, the movement can be seen as revealing the ideological conflict hidden within society (Chen & Yen, 2017). "Taiwan" here not only describes the concept of a country (although it is highly controversial) but also implies the different social and cultural construction of ethnicity and sovereignty with China.

It is worth mentioning that the different issues in this social movement, indeed, reminds the public of Taiwan's national imagination (Pan, 2015; Chen & Yen, 2017; Au, 2017). Protesters built a field of action by launching this movement. They further imagined "Taiwan" in the context of economy, politics and culture. Many groups consciously followed the identity suited to their own beliefs to mobilize the group, especially when they perceived that the government intentionally covered a particular political language into a fixed cultural category where the individual could only passively accept their situation. Identity relates to

the power struggle of the concept of state and nation. In the context of collective imagination, imagination can create fear and face threats. For example, President Ma responded to questions about China' intention to unify Taiwan:

President Ma said that some people posted the label of “Closing to China and selling Taiwan” (傾中賣台) to him, but the policies he promoted after he took office was based on Taiwan and Taiwanese people. “I not only did not sell Taiwan but helped Taiwan.” ...not only lowered the tension between cross-strait but promoted peace and prosperity, ...it is really beneficial to Taiwan. (Chen & Wang, 2014, United Daily News)

According to President Ma, the economic policies promoted by the government were beneficial to the development of people's livelihood in Taiwan. The tension between cross-strait had also become stabilized. He criticized some groups for stigmatizing his economic policies by saying that he is “selling Taiwan.” The saying of “selling Taiwan” was a production of collective anxiety. “Taiwan” would be transformed into an object in this situation. This object would be filled with various symbolic codes, which might be exchanged for the benefit of the economy. Therefore, sovereignty and economic interests overlapped in political interests. Correspondingly, the emergence of “Taiwan independence” issues had also been criticized. For example:

In the name of the Sunflower Student Movement, the “Black Shirts” (黑衫軍) mobilized the general public against CSSTA in Ketagalan Boulevard (凱達格蘭大道). ...A group issued an “anti-nuclear power plant” petition of referendums to the

public. Some people who supported “Taiwan independence” drove propaganda vehicles to express their opposition to China. (Zhu, Xu & Shu, 2014, China Times)

Although the Sunflower Student Movement called for the public to take to the streets due to the legislative process under the table, it also drew various interest groups’ attention to take the opportunity to express their opinions. The groups that supported Taiwan’s independence represented some kind of radical nationalism, as the national imagination previously stated. Therefore, some people considered the appeal for anti-trade service a political language to acquire the interests of parties. It can be seen that this movement also contains the critical thinking of “Taiwanese people.” The shaping of identity often depends on the social environment and historical background. Identity has multiple natures. Individuals can make choices consciously or unconsciously under specific realistic considerations, revealing the difference in identity. For example, different genders, occupations, religions, party tendencies are associated with personal characteristics. The political stance is an important factor leading to the separation of a collective identity.

The images of Taiwan repeatedly strengthened the collision of politics and ideology during the Sunflower Student Movement. The redefinition of Taiwan-China relations was a state-level discourse, while Taiwanese identity belonged to an individual level. Taiwanese identity has been inextricably linked to the government’s national policy. In the long run, in Taiwan’s political and economic environment, the self-identity of specific groups is changeable and conditional. This movement can undoubtedly provide us with a historical perspective to look at the construction of identity.

Chinese or Taiwanese: who belongs to who

Taiwanese or Chinese identity has been controversial issues at the cultural and historical level in Taiwan. Some people also think that they are “Taiwanese and Chinese” (double identity)

(Li, 2003). Because of the sovereignty dispute between China and Taiwan, identity is a complex political choice process. In other words, national identity may be divergent from the concept of the state and also related to the different parties. As mentioned earlier, the controversy over the service trade agreement came from the anxiety of the collective identity in the face of China's economic and political challenges. Therefore, the Sunflower Student Movement catalyzed the supporters' sense of identity. They bravely expressed their position that reflected the overall trend of society. This section takes the public polls as the most important aspect of observation and explores the relationship between identity and social change.

According to the Election Study Center of National Chengchi University (2019), since 1992, the trend of Taiwanese people's political attitudes has changed significantly. Overall, the Taiwanese people's recognition of "Taiwanese identity" has increased year by year. Taiwanese identity reached its highest point in 2014, and about 60% of the people think they were Taiwanese. This figure did not include the choice of "Taiwanese and Chinese identity". In the following years, after the Sunflower Student Movement, the percentage of "Taiwanese identity" declined slightly. This public poll showed that the Sunflower Student Movement did affect the people who agreed with the Taiwanese identity. Due to the possible trade agreement, people were concerned about the opportunities and threats brought by the "Chinese factors." For example, China's unequal economic volume and the influence of international politics could be seen as limiting Taiwan's "living space." Therefore, people actively participated in the discussion of public affairs and used the identity of "Taiwanese people" as a strategy of resistance. Furthermore, the government's economic policy focusing on developing the Chinese market had raised many questions. This result reflected in recognition of the Taiwanese identity, which had grown substantially.

The public polls of Taiwanese identity, to a certain extent, presents changes in public attitudes toward social and political issues, and truly reflects the views of people at all levels on national policies. It is worth noting that the newspaper reports also quote the results of the polls of different institutions. Their discursive strategies can be seen as a reinterpretation of the text. Newspaper reports' discourses convey specific knowledge, recreating the message and giving new perspectives. For example, the Liberty Times quoted the Taiwan Brain Trust (新台灣國策智庫) to illustrate the public poll of Taiwanese identity during the student movement:

According to the latest poll released by the Taiwan Brain Trust yesterday, Taiwanese people who think they are “Chinese” reached the lowest point in March this year, only 2.3%, compared with 4.5% in October last year and 3.0% in January this year. It shows that Taiwanese people have almost no intention of “being Chinese.” ...For the national identity, 58.2% of the people think they are “Taiwanese,” and 37% of the people think they are “both Taiwanese and Chinese.” Only 2.3% of the population think they are “Chinese”. If people can choose between “Taiwanese” and “Chinese”, then up to 88.4% of the people think they are Taiwanese, and 7.7% think they are Chinese. (Chen, 2014, Liberty Times)

These fluctuating figures conveyed at least two aspects of the results. First, the data on Chinese identity showed that the Chinese identity in Taiwan was almost negligible. Second, although Taiwanese identity presented the consciousness of an absolute majority, 37% of people think they were both Taiwanese and Chinese. It can be seen that although such a report covers a variety of survey results, it also shapes a single preference. Interestingly, most people would choose a Taiwanese identity if they need to make a single choice. Such findings are

similar to the results of the Election Study Center of National Chengchi University. However, the statement of “the Taiwanese people have almost no intention to ‘be a Chinese’” was entirely concerned about the subjectivity of Taiwanese identity and conveyed the (assumed and apparent) collective consciousness of resisting China.

Another example was the Taiwanese people’s identity survey conducted by the Taiwan Competitiveness Forum (台灣競爭力論壇) after the student movement:

The Sunflower Student Movement has ended in April this year. Yesterday, Taiwan Competitiveness Forum announced the public poll. It pointed out that, after the student movement, the population of 46.8% Taiwanese people agreed with “I am Chinese” which stood at the historically low level, but after the news and events faded, the figure rose back to 53%. People who identified themselves as Chinese ethnicity also returned to 87%. (Tang, 2014, China Times)

Although the information was far different from the data of other institutions, its data could serve as a control group to demonstrate the relationship between discourse, knowledge, and even political power. First, the survey focuses on changes in Chinese identity. The analysis found that the percentage of Chinese identity reached a historical low in the 2014 student movement. This result showed that the occurrence of the movement had indeed stimulated the sense of identity and national consciousness of the Taiwanese people. Second, the survey claimed that the increase in Chinese identity was attributed to the dilution of news events. Thus, it seems that the media will affect the public’s perception. However, did this statement refers to another form of media effect? The third and most important is that the notion of “Chinese ethnicity” replaced “double identity” (Taiwanese and Chinese). This discursive forms and investigative method deliberately downplay the national identity of the Taiwanese

and emphasizes the concept of the same race in cross-strait relations. Therefore, in addition to the possible institutional effects, this report enhanced the operability of media messages in communication.

This above analysis mainly illustrates the complexity of the identity of the Taiwanese people through long-term polls and specific reports. According to the comparative analysis, the Sunflower Student Movement promoted Taiwanese identity and declined Chinese identity. Besides, although different reports presented similar trends, they chose different ways of representations. Therefore, the media also shaped a certain political position. More precisely, the media power and political power seemed to conspire in a self-interested form of communication that conveys some knowledge about identity. The Taiwanese identity has risen year by year, which means that with the process of Taiwan's democratization, people of the new generation are paying more and more attention to Taiwan's political and international situation. What did the unique formations present by the so-called sunflower generation in this social movement? And what kind of interaction between cultural memory and generations was in this movement?

4.1.3 Cultural memory and the “sunflower generation”

Cultural memory of Taiwan—the 228 Incident

Memory is a production of the individual and the people. People trace major historical events in a particular society to form a contemporary collective memory. Collective memory can constitute the images of the past (Halbwachs, 1992). In other words, memory can be used as a symbolic means to connect the past and the present shaping contemporary social formation and ideology. Urry (1996) pointed out that “Indeed forgetting is as socially structured as is the process of remembering” (p. 50). Memory can be reshaped in the overall social structure. For example, in the political field, the governors are able to strengthen their perspectives by

controlling the mass media to control the production of memory and maintain the stability of the authority. Therefore, the actual historical events may be forgotten in the fragments of memory. A. Assaman and J. Assaman (2011) has developed the concept of the cultural memory, focusing on how the symbolic meanings in memory constitute a collective identity and shape a specific social structure, which further creates national identity.

The 228 Incident has been recognized as a significant turning point that changed Taiwan's modern history and society. This incident has nurtured the consciousness of Taiwan's identity and the beginning of the independence movement (Fleischauer, 2007; Chen, 2008). Over 40 years after the incident, the Taiwanese government banned the public from commenting on this incident and tried to eliminate collective memory (Chen, 2008). Today, the 228 Incident has become an important social and political symbol of modern Taiwan. As Smith (2008) says, "The construction of the symbolic mythology of the 228 Incident has made the uprising an important historical event and a divisive tool in the political and ethnic turmoil of contemporary Taiwan" (p. 145). Due to its importance to Taiwanese identity in general, it is pertinent to ask what kind of social context that the cultural memory of the 228 Incident represented in the Sunflower Student Movement?

For example, the following news report quoted Time magazine's article to describe the government's action of suppressing protests who occupied the Executive Yuan:

The scenes of violence seemed out of place for the social movements and modern day of Taiwan. ...The bloody scene in Taipei harks back to a different, darker era. On February 28, 1947, the nationalist Kuomintang, violently suppressed anti-government protests, killing over 10,000 people. (Guan & Zhang, 2014, Liberty Times)

This news report made a comparison between the Sunflower Student Movement and the 228 Incident by pointing out the essence of national power. Although the 228 Incident and the Sunflower Student Movement were two completely different historical events, there was an intersection between the boundaries of autocracy and democracy. In other words, this argument seemed to strengthen the inappropriateness of the Kuomintang's governance by reviewing the national trauma of Taiwan's modern history. From this perspective, the 228 Incident involves various discourses that have been intertwined with historical narrative, memory and forgetting. Therefore, until today, the symbolic meaning of the 228 Incident—ethnic conflict and national identity—still plagues the collective consciousness of the public, constructs cultural memories at a specific moment, and points to a formation of resistance.

Memory is also closely related to the production of places. The establishment of 228 Peace Memorial Park and Memorial Hall is an example of placing memories in places (Chen, 2007). Places obviously can endow the history of past with contemporary features promoting the production and reproduction of public memory: "An alert and alive memory connects spontaneously with place, finding in it features that favor and parallel its own activities. We might even say that memory is naturally place-oriented or at least place-supported" (Casey 1987, p. 186-187). The following letter to the editor reflected on the interaction between memory and a specific place.

On March 23, the bloody suppression of the Executive Yuan reminded the people of an incident at the same place in 1947: The military and police fired at protests, which led to the 228 Incident. Over 67 years, Taiwan has gone from totalitarian to democratic country. Whether it is called the Chief Executive's Office or the Executive Yuan, the nature of state violence has remained unchanged. (Lu, 2014, Liberty Times)

This critical comment arguably considered the Executive Yuan a place to carry the past and the present representing the political issue of memory and state power. The 228 Incident and the Sunflower Student Movement jointly demonstrated the tension between governmental power and public interest. Thus, the place has the potential to shape the material existence of memory and constantly reminds people of the painful memories hidden at the bottom of society. The Executive Yuan is a place where “the politics of memory and politics of place converge” (Cresswell, 2004, p. 93). Thus, the representation of the 228 Incident in the Sunflower Student Movement not only highlighted the issue of Taiwanese identity but also showed the political conflicts in the process of democratization. Following this idea, the 228 Incident can be interpreted as an important watershed moment to understand Taiwan’s generational differences and cultural identity (Lee & Yang, 2016). What kind of features did the so-called “sunflower generations” shown in this student movement?

From Wild Lily Movement to Sunflower Student Movement

The Wild Lily Movement in 1990 was often discussed alongside the Sunflower Student Movement in 2014. The most significant commonality between the two movements was that they were initiated by university students, but the Wild Lily Movement was based on structural reforms within the government system, and the Sunflower Student Movement appealed for open and transparent legislative procedures. Furthermore, the Wild Lily Movement laid the foundation for Taiwan’s democratization, while the Sunflower Student Movement promoted the development of Taiwan’s democracy (Fell, 2012; Smith & Yu, 2014). These two movements achieved desired goals and promoted the political environment. To date, many members of the Wild Lily Movement have been active in Taiwan’s political field. However, as mentioned earlier, the Sunflower Student Movement involved a broader range of economic, social, and global issues. Therefore, comparing the similarities and differences between these two movements, we can analyze the dynamic changes to Taiwan’s

generation in different periods.

The following news report was a perfect example to look at the conflicting points from the perspective of power holders:

President Ma Ying-jeou said yesterday that Taiwan's democratic system is now full-fledged. Compared with the Wild Lily era, there may be a considerable gap between time and generation. ...During the Wild Lily Movement, the members of National Assembly (國民大會) and the Legislative Yuan had not been elected by direct popular vote, and the democratic system had not been on track. ...However, now the situation is different, ..., the Legislative Yuan is a parliament that has full power to lead various bills. (Wang & Chen, 2014, United Daily News)

Through the opinion of President Ma, we can easily find out that he emphasized the background of the generation of Sunflower and Wild Lily movements focusing on the changes in Taiwan's "democratic system." In the era of Wild Lily, the legislators were not directly elected by the citizen. This was an incompleteness of the democratic system. Today, Taiwan's legislative system is complete with the essential characteristics of a democratic country. The legislative system is the manifestation of the democratic mechanism. Therefore, under the premise of Taiwan's democratic system, president Ma declared the government's right to exercise power and promote the policy. In other words, the Legislative Yuan has been an extension of the will of majority citizens, so the legislators have full right to pass the bills. According to Ma, Taiwan's contemporary democratic values should lie in respecting the regulation and seeking changes within the current political system.

However, the mistrust of the legislative system was one of the primary reasons that students stormed to the street and occupied administration buildings. The Sunflower Student

Movement showed that ordinary people believed some politicians violated the democratic procedure. The following letter to the editor partly reflected on the motivations of the young generation to protest against the government's policies:

They do not understand that we are the students who were born in a democratic society and born in the era of the Internet. We didn't experience the period of martial law. We were born with freedom of speech. We were born to think the direct presidential election as a matter of course. We were born to know that democracy means not only the election but also the citizen discussion afterward. ... at least understand us—a generation that grew up with democracy and the Internet. (Chien, 2014, United Daily News)

This comment repeatedly used the word “be born” to explain the young generation who do not live in the era of martial law is a particular group with the Internet in the democratic society of Taiwan. Young people have not merely believed that democracy was the process of the election but also paid more attention to coordination and compromise between government and citizens.

As a result, the significance of the Wild Lily Movement and Sunflower Student Movement, in the context of democratic development, presents diverse perspectives. These two cross-generational student movements mainly implied two contemporary meanings. First, defects and resistance of a democratic society. Second, the improvement and inheritance of democratic values. The so-called sunflower generation has reflected the new values in the democratic system. They are eager to participate in the operation of politics, rather than to rely entirely on the existing system. By the mobile media and communication, the organization and scale of their protests are also different from the Wild Lily Movement. Fast

and efficient communication has changed the form and composition of social movements. Through a variety of strategies in the cyberspace, the protesters continue to challenge the existing power structure. Therefore, the pattern of actions exhibited by young people of the sunflower generation points to the emergence of the Internet generation.

Internet generation

In recent years, Taiwan's political protesters have increasingly relied on social media to raise complex issues. Although the Sunflower Student Movement was not the first practice of new media, the rare energy it released has been indeed massive. The phenomenon of the interactive application of traditional media and innovative media has kept the public's attention and become a new landscape for protests (Liu & Su, 2017). Mass media and authorities have been unable to monopolize the production and dissemination of information, and protestors can form new media ecosystems through diverse applications and strategies. When individuals can build collective awareness and action, they can influence government decisions (Dutton, 2009). This is the transformation of the power structure between the government and citizens. According to this, what kind of formation did the Internet generation show in this movement? Chen Fang-Ming (陳芳明) annotated the Internet generation with the title "Birth of the student movement generation," he wrote:

If we accuse them of being flank of the Democratic Progressive Party or deprecate them as marginalized people, it is obviously a distortion and a serious misunderstanding of this generation. They should be defined as a generation after martial law, or summarized as the Internet generation. (Chen, 2014, United Daily News)

This movement, to some extent, witnessed the controversy and problems of representative politics. The citizens of the Internet era have played a major role in the given social environment:

This student-movement generation gradually accumulated momentum, ...Several social movements all mobilized in the shortest time, but they successfully connected in different cities. Using the vehicle of the Internet, they can not only collect accurate information but also quickly find the same ideas. They share common human rights and human values, and also share the price that must be paid to challenge public power. ...Their form of movement is different from Wild Lily....now they are demanding social justice. (Chen, 2014, United Daily News)

This argument pointed out that the citizens of the Internet generation have formed a new force in the cyberspace to focus on the structural problems of society. They can respond quickly, share the collective consciousness, and challenge the flaw of the democratic system. Thus, the appearance of the Internet generation means that cultural memory should be reconsidered in the context of technological advancement. Aleida Assmann (2011) argued that “the dominant metaphor of memory for the last twenty-five hundred years—gives way to the metaphor of the electronic net or Web. Writing is developing more and more in the direction of linkages” (A. Assmann, p. 11). People can share their values and ideologies with potential groups based on networked connections. With the help of new technology, the collective knowledge of the past possibly strengthens their cultural identity in the present. For example, the symbolic meaning of the 228 Incident seems to reconstruct national identity in the Internet generation. It is that the social space based on technology and freedom promotes the activity of the civic

movement. However, people cannot forget that there are still many places in the world where the flow of information online is restricted. In view of this idea, the significance of the Internet generation in the Sunflower Student Movement was based on the existing democratic system and the use of advanced technology to seek changes in the fixed social and political structures.

4.2 Mobile media and political space in the networked society

In response to a KMT legislator who hastily completed the second reading of CSSTA with China in only 30 seconds without case-by-case-review (the so-called 30-second incident), the protesters' occupation of the Legislative Yuan led to the beginning of the Sunflower Student Movement on March 18, 2014 (Ho, 2015, p. 79-91). Ho (2015) pointed out the role of the Internet in this occupation: "The news that congress was being occupied was immediately broadcast via Internet, attracting supports to the area. ...Bottles water (sic), food, first aid, medicine, and other materials were quickly sent inside by supporters to sustain a potentially prolonged protest" (p. 92). Due to the Internet, the radical action of occupying governmental buildings successfully drew the public's attention and students grasped the opportunity for the long-term protest at the beginning of the Sunflower Student Movement. Occupying a public place or space has not been a new idea. The "Occupy Movement" can be traced back to Occupy Wall Street, in the basis of social media, this occupation called for many people to share the same concept of "we are the 99 %" around the world (Costanza-Chock, 2012).

Many scholars have focused on the relationship between social media and the Occupy Movements. For example, Juris (2012) argued that the most significant utility of social media is that they can effectively integrate individuals into protests and places. Thus, the use of social networking tools facilitates interpersonal communication and form what he calls "crowd of individuals" (p. 267). Kavada (2015) suggested that social media play an important role in the process of creating collective action emphasizing the communicative function for

distinctive actors in a collective voice.

As of the Sunflower Student Movement, some researches also explore how social media had a direct impact on the public's mobilization and communication (Chen, Chang & Huang 2016; Tsatsou, 2018). Some studies regard social media as part of the field of new media and suggest media practices in this movement. For instance, Liu and Su (2017) proposed the concept of "hybrid media network" to shed light on the interactive use of innovative and traditional media that form new landscapes for contemporary political protest in Taiwan. Furthermore, Lin and Su (2015) found that the usage of mobile phones with the Internet can positively promote political activism. In this sense, the environment of the mobile network can be considered a necessary condition for the Sunflower Student Movement. In other words, mobile media implies a variety of media practices in the lens of bodily mobility. Thus, the interactive relationship between mobile media and the occupation of a place should be explored.

4.2.1 Mobile media as the mobile communication—formation of mobile network

The role of digital media in the Sunflower Student Movement

Studies have found that digital media positively promote social movement and trigger political transformation (Castells, 2012; Sandoval-Almazan & Gil-Garcia, 2014; van de Donk, Loader, Nixon & Rucht, 2004). Similarly, the Sunflower Student Movement demonstrated the critical role and practices of digital media in contemporary social movements (Hung, 2015). For example, the following news report juxtaposed the Wild Lily Movement with the Sunflower Student Movement depicting how the development of technology change ways that people can use to communicate and mobilize:

Traditional student movements were mainly based on “face to face” interpersonal communication. For example, the 1990 Wild Lily Movement, ... With the development of technology, the 318 Sunflower Movement has subverted the traditional methods for mobilization. Through Facebook that most people use in Taiwan, university students shared and live-streamed messages to touch students who have never been to streets. (Xu, 2014, China Times)

This news report speaks of two crucial social evolutions in the field of communication. First, modern technology is seen as completely subverting the mobilization of traditional student movements in Taiwan. Online communication appears to have replaced face to face communication as the primary method of communication. Second, combined with the various practical functions of social media and mainstream media, students can spread the messages to different individuals and groups to inspire potential participants (Tsatsou, 2018).

Undoubtedly, the nature of the Internet and virtual communities has changed the speed and effectiveness of delivering information and has called for students who have never participated in political activities. On the one hand, the causes of the Sunflower Student Movement contained complicated political, social and cultural factors and involved people who cared about different issues. On the other hand, electronic media provides new knowledge and resources that influence the collective consciousness of the public, and contributes to the participation of individuals and groups in public affairs. As Appadurai (1996) said “the transformation of everyday subjectivities through electronic mediation and the work of the imagination is not only a cultural fact. It is deeply connected to politics, ...” (p. 10). Electronic media expands the imaginary community of the subject in virtual space. The constant evolution of new media technologies has made new forms of social movement possible, transforming the interaction between citizens and the government. Relying on the

diversity of electronic media, protesters can provide information and images to broader audiences, regardless of the hurdles of time and space. Therefore, the circulation, pause and interaction in cyberspace and physical space affect the interaction experience between individuals and society. Lessig (1996) illustrated the interaction effect of cyberspace with real spaces and places:

Cyberspace is a place. People live there. They experience all the sorts of things that they experience in real space, there. For some, they experience more. They experience this not as isolated individuals, ...they experience it in groups, in communities, among strangers, among people they come to know, and sometimes like. (p. 1403)

Following this, with the popularity of smartphones, mobile media has redefined the sensory and physical experience of space (Fortunati, Manganelli & de Luca, 2015; Lemos, 2008). Participants in the Sunflower Student Movement applied the plasticity of mobile media to create enormous organizational energy and bring new spatial dimensions together.

Body, place and space—the occupation of Executive Yuan

The mobility of the body is an essential element in understanding the relationship between place and space. Meyrowitz (1985) said that “all experience is local. ...We are always in place, and place is always with us” (p. 326). Seamon (1980) explained how mobility in everyday life creates the practical experience of places: “the phenomenon of everyday movement in space, by which is meant ant spatial displacement of the body or bodily part initiated by the person himself” (p.148). Individuals can create any everyday activities in relation to the body in physical space. Seamon (1980) further proposed the concept of “time-space routine” to discuss the fixed behavior patterns that individuals follow in day-to-day life. These behavioral patterns are derived from fixed-mobile habits. Therefore, the nature of the

mobile media can be understood by the mobility and the practice of the place. A typical example is that people carry mobile devices (especially smartphones) all the time, move to different places, and perform various daily tasks, such as going to work, shopping, and traveling.

Today, the communication network initiated by mobile media fully echoes the structure of the “network society” proposed by Castells (1996). Further, the rise of mobile media has created a new social structure that affects the power and practice of individuals and groups in society. According to Bourdieu (1977), the composition of habits is the production of social structure. He argued that habits point to creative orientations for actors rather than habitual unconscious behaviors: “It is just as true and just as untrue to say that collective actions produce the event or that they are its produce. ...a habitus, understood as a system of lasting, transposable dispositions ...” (p. 82-83). The mobile media can be said to combine the mobility of the body with the creativity of the Internet in people’s daily performances. This argument relates to de Certeau (1984), who showed that pedestrians can walk in planned urban spaces in an infinite variety of ways. The possibility of contemporary communicative exchanges in protests is created by the bodies creating places and transforming the space. Therefore, the protesters of the Sunflower Student Movement not only moved to a specific place (such as the Legislative Yuan) but also shared the message and spoke to the public through the mobile media (devices). The body combined with mobile devices can be seen as the essential element of mobile communication.

The following news report described an abrupt conflict as the embodiment of mobile communication:

A large number of students poured in the Executive Yuan instantly who seemingly came prepared to take out the quilt and towel to cover the barricades, and stepped in.

They used the mobile phone to inform the companions to help out. The polices could only watch the barricades being pushed down and squashed. The Executive Yuan was stormed in less than five minutes, and the students who entered the Executive Yuan rapidly increased from one hundred to thousands. (Wang & Yang, 2014, United Daily News)

This news report vividly depicts how students used a series of strategies to break through the government blockade and occupy the Executive Yuan. First, students used simple daily necessities (such as towels) to shield their companions and remove obstacles to enter the interior of the Executive Yuan. Second, students who entered the Executive Yuan used mobile phones (smartphones) to contact students outside the executive field to join the occupation. After that, the number of students in the occupied areas continuously increased thousands. It follows that bodily mobility, mobile devices and space demonstrate the mobile communication could combine physical space and cyberspace in this action. The lightness of modern mobile devices can be connected to individuals at all times (Bauman, 2000). When the protesters move from one place to another, the essence of the space has been reshaped. Take this case as an example. Students who were outside the building of the Executive Yuan seized the opportunity to occupy the Executive Yuan. The inside and outside of the Executive Yuan can be regarded as two places, which represent “forbidden” and “allowed,” respectively. In fact, these two places exist in the same space. Government buildings give a sense of space and transform a part of it into a place. An important question emerges, how did students communicate with each other in these two isolated places?

Tuan Yi-Fu (1997) has explored the transformation and interaction between mobility, space and place:

What begins as undifferentiated space becomes place as we get to know it better and endow it with value. ...The ideas “space” and “place” require each other for definition. ...Furthermore, if we think of space as that which allows movement, then place is pause; each pause in movement makes it possible for location to be transformed into place. (p. 6)

If the movement of the student’s body was temporarily suspended in the Executive Yuan, the cyberspace gave the restricted individuals new mobility. This mobility was the result of the connectivity by mobile media, which moved with the body but did not depend on the body. In other words, cyberspace does not appear or disappear as the place changes. Through the appropriate mobile media, this space will connect individuals under different conditions. Therefore, when people use mobile devices to connect to cyberspace that can be considered a variety of online places. They represent a variety of ways of practice. This process of occupation can be seen as “a hybrid networked movement that links cyberspace and urban space in multiple forms of communication” (Castells, 2012, p. 177). Whether students were inside or outside of the Executive Yuan, they can exchange messages and formulate strategies without restrictions. The interrelationship between cyberspace and physical space prompts a pause between the two places (Tuan, 1997) to generate mutual mobility, releasing tremendous dynamism. The result was that the administrative officers were unable to intervene effectively in the space of mobile communication leading to more and more students entering the Executive Yuan.

Bodily movement with mobile devices has become a cultural and social phenomenon. Through mobile communication, the limitations of the body in space can be liberated that make the protests present unique political landscapes. As mentioned above, mobile media connect the subtleties of the body, space and place. This occupation of the Executive Yuan

illustrates how the various actors can effectively share information and create spatial practices. However, how did the protesters spread information to the general public in the Legislative Yuan? How to define the meaning of internal space and external space?

4.2.2 Mobile media and political space

Inside the Legislative Yuan—flip flops, iPad and live streaming

In the previous section, the example of the occupation of the Executive Yuan showed the process of constructing the body and the mobile media in space. Such a behavioral pattern shows the meaning that actors actualized the place with the use of mobile devices and promoted the communication patterns of internal members. How do the protesters use the characteristics of the mobile media to share information with the public anywhere? The following example illustrates the use of viable mobile devices, platform and objects to expose the chaotic situation immediately after the protesters occupied the Legislative Yuan:

After entering the Legislative Yuan on the 18th, I thought that Ustream would be easy to use, ...I took the lead, ...to tie up the slippers as an iPad rack, to take pictures of the Legislative Yuan, and continuously updated through the Ustream platform. ...The live streamer immediately responded to netizen through the platform. This functional medium allows the connection between protests and netizen to be unimpeded, and cleverly bypassed some of the anti-protest Taiwanese media. (Zhan, 2014, Liberty Times)

The combination of iPad and slippers formed a mobile carrier that has become an iconic symbol of this movement (as shown in Figure 1). The iPad, like a smartphone, not only marks the application of modern technology in the Sunflower Student Movement but also

demonstrates the actions of improvisation (Ho, 2017). Mobile media help the protesters to instantly interact with the outside world in the form of sound, images and videos. Thompson (1990) said that “the deployment of technical media separates social interaction from physical locale, so that individuals can interact with one another even though they do not share a common spatial-temporal setting” (p. 16). Therefore, the function of the live stream links the space of protests, Internet groups and individuals. In other words, when watching the content of the live stream, the individual can also play the role of a network citizen to instantly share or comment on the information conveyed by the delivers. Thus, the space of the Legislative Yuan, the cyberspace, and the physical space of the individuals would simultaneously experience a certain moment. This type of interaction weakened the importance of the place, because people could simultaneously view images of the Legislative Yuan in various ways and in different places.



Figure 1. An iPad and slippers established the temporary mobile medium

Note: Liberty Times Net. (2014). Relying on iPad and slippers to broadcast?

netizens: totally beating SNG vehicles (靠iPad拖鞋轉播? 網友: 打趴SNG

車). Retrieved from <https://news.ltn.com.tw/news/politics/breakingnews/970619>

The characteristics of the spatial practice discussed demonstrate the lightness of mobile communication and the bulkiness of traditional media. For example, the following

editorial titled “When iPad beats SNG” described this phenomenon:

At the beginning of the chaos of the Legislative Yuan, ... The scene of the live stream was shot by an “iPad”! ... the mobility of the iPad has defeated the satellite news gathering outside the Legislative Yuan. The scene of the Executive Yuan was even more so! Almost all of the vital conflict images were shot by the public’s “mobile phone” and then quickly flowed out through the social networking sites. (Wang, 2014, China Times)

This argument uncovered that traditional news media could not play an immediate role at the beginning of the Sunflower Student Movement. Instead, the cyberspace triggered by mobile media forms “fifth estate” challenging authoritative organizations and governments (Dutton, 2009). The mobility of mobile media has reshaped the sense of place in the public and political places. The ubiquitous mobile phone gives us the ability to record images and spread the story and background of photos through a social networking site. The formation of the public opinions pressure on the government and officials and reshape the structure of power.

Outside the Legislative Yuan— politics and mobile marketing

The interaction between cyberspace and political space, through the “synchronization” mechanism of the mobile media, makes it easier for citizens to participate in and discuss the protests in various ways. The speed and immediacy of the mobile network also provide relatively accurate images and information, avoiding the delay of traditional media. For example, the following news report presents the slowness of traditional media:

The “old” news that appeared in the printed media on the next day was not a single source in this occupation. The Internet is “synchronized,” ...because of the different

communication vehicles, the one-sided images deliver multi-faceted presentations.
(Xu, 2014, China Times)

This news report compared the “old” news with the “news” and pointed out how the use of various vehicles to facilitate the mobile communication that is conducive to shaping the positive public image of the protesters and breaking the time gap. Therefore, the multiple channels of communication can immediately convey the opinions of the protesters and influence the personal ideas of the other. Politicians, political parties and government have used contemporary mobile media to galvanize supports into political participation. Mobile marketing is an innovative strategy and a powerful tool to mobilize the general public for political purposes (Cook, 2010). Furthermore, the mobile media provides more open and autonomous platforms to spread information. However, how the issues drew the attention of the public and stimulated people’s willingness to participate in a concise manner is also one of the success factors of the Sunflower Student Movement. For example, the following news report shows that the government failed to defend its own political views compared to netizens who were familiar with the propaganda model of the Internet:

When the children asked about what is the CSSTA, whether or not to counter the CSSTA, many parents could not answer it. They sighed that the government’s marketing for CSSTA failed. The government took hundreds of millions of dollars to promote, but lost to the “lazy pack” online...What are the advantages and disadvantages of CCSTA for people and enterprises? The government should give an in-depth but straightforward announcement to everyone. (Zhang, 2014, United Daily News)

Literally speaking, a “lazy pack” (懶人包) means that people convey specific concepts in simple, short, and intuitive texts for those who do not have time to read on the Internet. This example shows once again that the slowness of bureaucracy in the Internet age and they cannot cope with the immediacy and connectivity of mobile communications.

Therefore, the Sunflower Student Movement combined the strategies of mobile media and online marketing to translate complex political and social ideas into actual actions. In addition to making many citizens more convinced of online information, this result further enhances citizens’ willingness to participate in politics. The following news report illustrates the decisive role of mobile media in civil politics:

Yesterday, ASUS’s chairman Jonney Shih (施崇棠) said that this student movement was a manifestation of online marketing. The development of a mobile network makes citizen politics more likely to be realized. ...He pointed out that this student movement reflected the anxiety of the Y generation. Because of the Internet age, citizen politics has become complete and it has brought new challenges to the government, the ruling party and the opposition party. (Jiang, 2014, United Daily News)

Participants in the Sunflower Student Movement successfully spread their ideas to potential supporters in cyberspace and touched people who did not care about political activities. Scammell (2014) suggested the concept of “consumer democracy” that implies that “politics are sold like commercial products, and that citizens judge, and are invited to judge, politics are commercial products” (p. 1). Political marketing can be understood as a relationship of consumption, and the roles of producers and consumers coincide because of the progress of the mobile media. In other words, citizens can spontaneously play the role of

producers and consumers to replace the functions of traditional media. Therefore, political marketing is an indispensable part of modern politics, and the public has greater power to influence public opinion and increase the energy of protest. Governments and officials are inevitably necessary to adjust administrative organizations to keep up with the wave of the media revolution.

4.2.3 Governmental response to the impact of new media

Internet democracy: public knowledge and professional knowledge

When citizens use the flexibility of the Internet to participate in the discussion of national policies, they challenge the professionalism and political judgment of bureaucrats in government agencies. In an era when individual power was not yet widely available, Lyotard (1984) wrote about how digital technology affects the production and delivery of knowledge:

The proliferation of information-processing machines is having, and will continue to have, as much of an effect on the circulation of learning as did advancements in human circulation (transportation systems) and later, in the circulation of sounds and visual images (the media). (p. 4)

The rise of mobile media and social media has made it impossible for governments around the world to effectively grasp the political discourse power, which means a decline of traditional power structures. Through digital tools, individuals can gradually acquire some power and reshape the mutual relationship between citizens and the government. People also have more channels of communication to focus on their own interests and form various interest groups. The use of new media has influenced the ways the government implemented policies for a long time. The Sunflower Student Movement reconstructed the acquisition of political

knowledge (Elwood & Leszczynski, 2013). This phenomenon has affected the social, political and cultural structure of Taiwan in varying degrees. For example, the following news report explains the tension between the administrative agencies and citizens in the Internet age:

In the Internet era, the decline of the threshold for citizen participation has weakened the professional monopoly of the administrative department in public affairs. The gap between bureaucrats and Internet citizens has continued to expand. The government's series of financial policies have been disturbed this year and have been "encircled" by the "lazy pack" online. (Liu, 2014, United Daily News)

According to Liu (2018), political knowledge disseminated through new media has only a significant impact on people with a high level of education. In other words, those with higher education levels are more interested in debating political and public affairs on the Internet platform than those with lower levels. Today's younger generation is familiar with the operation of digital tools, highlighting the rigidity of the government. For example, the following editorial points to the importance of government ignoring online democracy in the Internet age:

In the Internet age, the formation and exchange of public opinion have undergone tremendous changes. The ruling team's successive defeats in the battles of the Sunflower Movement and the "Nine in One Election" (九合一大選) highlighted the gap between them and the Internet generation. These political effects were actually just the tip of the iceberg, ...how to implement online democracy is worthy of paying attention. ...including e-government, online discussion of public policy. ("It is the Internet democracy", 2015, China Times)

Online democracy means that the Internet creates more opportunities for citizens to participate in political issues and organize groups. The diverse groups formed by cyberspace are different from face-to-face communication which leads to the more complicated circulation of information. The flow of information on the Internet can continuously change the knowledge and cognition of citizens and transform the social and political relations between citizens and the government (Margolis & Moreno-Riaño, 2009). Thus, the government has tried to reform the administrative organization and respond to the ways of communication in the Internet age.

How mobile communication contributes to the “open government”

As discussed in the previous section, the base of the mobile network set up by the iPad marks the mobility of the Internet age and allows people to pay attention to the real-time interaction of live stream. Therefore, the government has tried to strengthen the communication channels between citizens and administrative agencies through live stream:

Executive Dean pointed out that young people good at using online tools to supervise and criticize the government. ...He had no virtual experience in combination with physical interaction, so he was inquisitive. He specially asked the Minister without Portfolio to put two laptops on his table, so that he could keep paying attention of the netizens' responses at any time. (Huang, 2014, United Daily News)

This news report not only shows that the government attempted to learn digital tools but also highlights the idea often presented in the media that administration officials had totally different thinking from the younger generation. For example, the Executive Dean admitted that “he had no virtual experience in combination with physical interaction”. This statement once again proves that the government did not realize the significant effect of technological

innovation at the beginning of the protest. However, the success of the Sunflower Student Movement has inspired the government to recognize that the new media can promote the public's political participation. For example, the following statement from the Minister of National Development Council showed how the government realized the impact of virtual communication:

He has decided to strengthen communication with the public early through the media, including the online community before the policy is formed, and receive feedback through communication. Policies are no longer just the notifications afterward. "Our group is digital immigrants, but communicating online is the trend and the best place to listen to public opinion," he said. (Yu, 2014, United Daily News)

The main demand of the Sunflower Student Movement was to oppose the legislative process that the government did not fully discuss. In the Internet age, governments are gradually committed to improving the transparency of policies and inviting citizens to participate in the formation and formulation of policies:

In response to the "open government" concept in the Internet age, the Executive Yuan has launched the online regulatory discussion platform (vTaiwan) of the "Virtual World Development Regulations Adjustment Plan (虛擬世界發展法規調適規劃方案)," and the "Public Policy Participation Network Platform(公共政策網路參與平台)." Major press conferences also begin to live stream. ...The CEO of LIVEhiuse.in said that people could grasp more information than the government in the Internet age. The government should make good use of the Internet to collect public opinions. (Lin, 2015, United Daily News)

During the Sunflower Student Movement, participants used a variety of technology tools that successfully forced the government to make concessions. Accordingly, the government also realized that groups in cyberspace could transform into a real public force. Thus, the executive authorities have implemented various measures to facilitate the promotion of policies. The rise of new media has constantly changed the power relationship between citizens and the government.

4.3 Individual power and civil participation

The political and social agency of the Sunflower Student Movement arguably triggered the pros and cons of debates. In particular, the legitimacy of the occupation has become the heated controversy of this movement on the political level (Chang, 2017). The Legislative Yuan is one of the highest organs of government to exercise power. The general public is not allowed to launch movements in the Legislative Yuan, let alone occupy important political space without permission. The unexpected occupation partially meant that the protesters could not follow the effective channels to influence the legislative process of the trade agreement. However, the legitimacy of government administration is vested in the relative majority of citizens. Therefore, with the concept of civil disobedience, the leaders of the Sunflower Student Movement drew the public's attention to the governmental policies and the procedural injustice. As Roth (2017) noted that "civil disobedience is an attempt, not to exercise power directly, but to challenge authority in a way as to arouse the conscience of the community" (p. 194). According to Ho (2013), since 2008, various social movements have been the concrete manifestations of civil disobedience. Sunflower Student Movement can be said to extend and expand the energy of previous social movements. Correspondingly, the opponents of this movement believed that the occupation of the Legislative Yuan was the act of undermining the constitutional system. That is to say, the members of this movement took full advantage of the democratic system's rights to implement anti-democratic actions to

achieve specific political goals. For example, Tsai and Chen (2015) show that the “Chinese factor” was a primary factor affecting the participants’ willingness compared to civil disobedience.

In this context, there was a dynamic tension between the supporters, opponents and the government in this movement. Taiwan’s electoral system demonstrates the value of democracy and ensures the peaceful transfer of political power to a large extent. Therefore, the ruling party has the right to implement public policies that are in the interests of some people. However, as Jones and Su (2015) said, the essence of this protest is that “decisively challenged the Ma administration and the KMT’s version of a ‘winner-take-all’ democracy, providing a competing vision based around deliberation, participation and Taiwan’s sovereignty” (p, 193). This chapter explores the relationship between politics and individual power, including the meaning of democracy, the participation of the public sphere, and the transformation of political power.

4.3.1 The boundary of democracy and freedom

Is the Sunflower Student Movement democratic?

The Legislative Yuan is a space occupied by the structural system and governmental power. The Legislature Yuan represents the authority of different power holders to struggle against oppression. The ruling party and the opposition party’s wrestling in the parliament highlight the differences and uniqueness of a democratic society. The occurrence of the Sunflower Student Movement brought together the power of many citizens. Hung (2016) pointed out that the complexity and comprehensiveness of this student movement and its subsequent impact on Taiwanese society have made this event impossible to be reduced to the result of a single factor. Social movement groups, students, and the general public formed a different imaginary group in both physical and virtual spaces (Anderson, 2006), participating in the debates of

diverse issues and ideological disputes. Therefore, various possible factors (such as China factors, anti-globalization, Taiwan independence, etc.) are intertwined, presenting the overall formation of the Sunflower Student Movement.

Since the Sunflower Student Movement contains multiple faces, the return to the occupation itself in the normalized society can explain the connection between the actors and the political system. For example, the following news reports state the importance of government institutions in democratic politics. The occupation of Legislative Yuan meant that the protestors crossed the boundary of “democracy”:

The legislative chamber has been occupied, which has a significant impact on Taiwan’s democracy. ...the “parliamentary procedure” in parliament is the foundation of democratic politics. ...the malfunction of the parliament and the risk of losing control of the mass movement show the current crisis of democracy. (Yang, 2014, China Times)

The anti-service trade protest has gradually become fierce, and the situation has been out of control. The students who occupied Legislative Yuan launched a “night attack” abruptly last night. Nearly a thousand people furiously attacked the Executive Yuan, ...Both the Legislative Yuan and Executive Yuan have fallen unprecedentedly and become the biggest constitutional crisis in history. (Shu & Yang, 2014, China Times)

The first news report above proposes that the occupation of the Legislative Yuan impacted the stability of the democratic system. The media paints a picture where the Legislative Yuan is a crucial component of a democratic society, and which therefore indirectly conveys the public

opinion of the majority. The protesters' occupation of the Legislative Yuan not only led to the suspension of the operation of the political activities but also raised questions about infringement of the political system. The second news report further highlights the impact of this movement on constitutionalism under the situation of a brief occupation of the Executive Yuan. The paradox is that the protesters used the core concept of "return the service trade pact, defend democracy" to rationalize the occupation. It seems that the protest was a proof of the democracy. Therefore, the concept of democracy in this movement would emerge on the views and actions of minority groups compared with the existing rule of law as democratic principles. As Rancière (1999) said "there is democracy if there is a specific sphere where the people appear. There is democracy if there are specific political performers who are neither agents of the state apparatus nor parts of society" (p. 100). Following Rancière (1999), the Sunflower Student Movement should be understood as one of the practical forms of democracy. The significance of democracy is not to consolidate the political structure or to strengthen the existing system by the power holders, but to provide opportunities for the hidden things to represent. Even the people who are recognized in society are incapable of claiming the true meaning of democracy. Because they follow established norms in the disciplined system. This movement can be said to resist the government's use of a series of democratic norms as a framework to exclude multiple demands. In the idea of de Certeau (1984), the resistance of this movement was the manifestation of the "art of weakness."

In addition, this student movement can be seen as a demonstration of the will to pursue a "real" democracy. From the standpoint of different groups and government, this movement showed the multiple facets of democratic values in the social movement (Jones & Su, 2015). However, considering the process of occupation, regardless of the debates of defending democracy or infringing democracy, they all reflect the ambiguity of democracy itself. The following editorial, in the context of democratic politics, regards the Sunflower

Student Movement as an extension and projection of the chaos of parliament:

Much political chaos has been actually the “street version” of parliament in recent years. The Legislative Yuan has initially been a democratic place of “majority rule.” However, it has gradually become a colosseum that always plays a boycott, conflict, and disorderly drama. ...The first principle of democratic politics—majority rule— has gone. ...When this mode of operation is projected on society, it is the collective distrust of democracy. (“The democratic lesson”, 2014, United Daily News)

This comment makes a connection between the occupation of parliament and the political issues in parliament. The public resistance is the extension of the long-term political competition in democratic politics. The public was dissatisfied with the “chaos” of the Legislative Yuan, accumulating the momentum of the Sunflower Student Movement. This movement not only reflected the defects and advantages under the democratic system but also presented the political construction of democracy as a collective will. This movement demonstrated the democratic nature of the “minority rules,” which successfully subvert the procedures and norms of the parliament.

Two results of the judgment in the occupation of Legislative Yuan and Executive Yuan

Legally speaking, the occupation of government agencies by the public is an unacceptable action under any circumstances. Therefore, it was not surprising that the main initiator of the Sunflower Student Movement faced judicial trials after the end of the student movement. After two years, the Taiwan High Court delivered a verdict of not guilty for occupying the Legislative Yuan:

In the case of the Sunflower Movement, ...The Taipei District Court has acquitted the participants of this movement on the grounds of “civil disobedience.” The prosecution appealed this case. The Taiwan High Court has acknowledged the case to be political freedom of speech. Occupying the Legislative Yuan to stop the trade service agreement from reviewing was a “last resort.” (Wang, 2018, United Daily News)

From the above result, on the one hand, although the Sunflower Student Movement was acknowledgedly illegal, it was in line with the requirements of “civil disobedience.” On the other hand, regarding the form of this occupation, this movement fell into the category of freedom of speech. Based on this, the Sunflower Student Movement was a resistant action allowed under the rule of democracy, and it declared the government’s undemocratic decision and procedural injustice in handling the review of the trade agreement. Therefore, this movement represented a unique historical moment: the scope of freedom of speech in a democratic system seems to expand and extend to some social actors in Taiwan.

A week after the occupation of the Legislative Yuan, radical protestors accidentally broke into the Executive Yuan, causing the Ma administration to use the police force to oppress the protestors. Ho (2015) described the event as “excessive use of force against a peaceful rally” (p. 85) and “the government was criticized for ‘state violence’” (p. 86). It can be seen that the government no longer tolerated the occupation of government agencies and chose to escalate the confrontation between the government and the protestors. Moreover, because of this unexpected occupation, the occupiers of the Executive Yuan and the protestors in the Legislative Yuan divided into two different groups. According to the concept of Hung (2016), the actors of the Executive Yuan were the actual subjects. They were the unknown anonymous (p. 29). Because they were different from the decision-making group of the Sunflower Student Movement, they refused to be included in the network of existing power.

These unnamed people were the subjects outside the movement system, but they exposed the essence of state violence. The following two news reports illustrate the conflict between politics and the rule of law in this incident:

Lin Chuan (林全) stressed that the “Sunflower Movement was a political event, not a simple legal event.” It was such a political decision for the new government to set the tone for the Sunflower Movement and withdrew the lawsuit against participants. However, can politics be above the law? (Lu, 2016, China Times)

The Executive Dean, Lin Chuan, has withdrawn the lawsuit against the public who had been charged. Lin Chuan’s withdrawal sacrificed the dignity of the administrative department and the value of educating the people to abide by the law. It opened the back door of “violent petition.” The maintenance of the national order will be unpredictable in the future. (Wang, 2016, United Daily News)

After the era of Ma administration, the new head of Executive Yuan withdrew the lawsuit. Considering the position of the Sunflower Student Movement which questioned the government’s violation of the democratic spirit, this result seems to prove the legitimacy of this movement again. However, under the democratic framework, the boundaries between politics and the rule of law are still tangled. The administrative strategies adopted by different governments have affected the subsequent development of the incident. It is challenging for the ruling party and the opposition party to balance their interests. Therefore, by observing the political effects of this student movement, Taiwan’s democratic politics needs to establish a sustainable and healthy party system (Bush, 2016). In short, this movement demonstrates the power of the citizens which have a positive effect on politics and the rule of law. It also

unveiled the issues of national governance and encouraged the citizens to discuss public issues. Further, this social movement not only shows the interaction between the institutional power and the general public but also creates a public space for citizens to argue with each other.

4.3.2 Political participation in private and public space

Democratic classroom of public space: the formation of the public sphere

The public sphere is a space in which people are capable of publicly expressing their ideas and opinions regarding public issues that are closely related to their everyday lives. Based on Habermas's classic theory, the public sphere is formed by private people communicating with each and engaging in debates to influence the political institutions or national policies in a democratic society (Habermas, 1989). Habermas (1996) suggested that the public sphere is "a network for communicating information and points of view" (p. 360). He further argued that the public sphere could be seen as an "intersubjectively shared space of a speech situation in concrete locals where an audience is a physical concentration" (p. 361). The following two news reports show that a public space that was similar to the public sphere was formed in the Sunflower Student Movement, called the "democratic classroom":

Young students have occupied the chamber in Legislative Yuan. Students have come forward to support the anti-service trade from all places in Taiwan. ... Scholars have launched the "democratic classroom" on the street. ... They have planed the schedules and keynote speakers for each period and welcomed students and social citizens at all levels to attend classes. (Chen, Peng, Lin, Xie & Tu, 2014, Liberty Times)

In the scene of “democratic classroom,” the courses include jurisprudence “The crisis of constitutional government,” sociology “Services trade agreement, migration, labor and social welfare,” economics “Neo-liberalism behind services trade agreement” and journalism “The influence on freedom of speech.” (Huang & Hu, 2014, United Daily News)

The democratic classroom was launched by professors from several universities. During the occupation, they discussed the relationship and influence of the service trade agreement on various issues. Therefore, the significance of the democratic classroom was to provide a space for free debate that enabled citizens to explore the feasibility of public policy. Moreover, such space was not limited to students and professors. Anyone who cared about trade agreement could participate in discussions and form collective opinions. It can be argued that here, the Sunflower Student Movement successfully provided an alternative channel to unite the consensus of the public and form a communication network to influence the authority (government agencies, political parties, or specific media).

As mentioned above, the public sphere presents a traditional communication mechanism: through face-to-face communication to explore specific social issues in physical space. Because of the Internet and advanced technology, today’s public spheres are different from Habermas’s concepts. Thompson (2000) argued that the media had been involved in the constitution of the public sphere. Virtual communication and new cyberspaces have made the public sphere more complex and dynamic (Castells, 2008; Dean, 2003; Gordon, 2007; Rasmussen, 2014). In many ways, private space and public space are gradually becoming inseparable. Therefore, the public spheres shaped by the cyberspace have prompted countless ideas to emerge at the same time and develop consensus in the process. Politics can be interpreted as one of the practices of citizens’ daily lives. For example, the following letter to

editorial named “direct civil rights may be possible due to technology” as title, provides a futuristic argument:

There may be no need for political parties in the future. Instead, they are “virtual” political groups that combine at any time. You don’t know where is the establishment of parties, but they can formulate policies instantly. (Chen, 2014, Liberty Times)

The Sunflower Student Movement has reshaped the public sphere of modern society on the streets and constructed the possible public sphere of the online society in the future. The malfunction of the Legislative Yuan also made the public concern about the feasibility of deliberative democracy. During this movement, people had questioned the appropriateness of direct elections of the political system. The participants thus tried to explore how civic publics can be involved in the decision-making process of public issues to reach consensus.

Democratic salon in parliamentary chamber

Citizens formed a temporary public sphere in the street, while the main groups of social movement within the Legislative Yuan constituted the public sphere of the “Democratic Salon,” simulating the forms and elements of deliberative democracy:

On the fourth day of the occupation, students simulated the process of “deliberative democracy”! The groups of the student movement launched the “democratic salon” yesterday. It was divided into 22 groups to sit in a small circle, simulating the situation in which the medical profession and the beauty industry may encounter. The ruling and opposition legislators could only be excluded behind the door of the chamber. It was particularly ironic. (Tang & Gu, 2014, China Times)

In the 18th century, Parisian salons functioned as one of the crucial components of the public sphere. Habermas (1989) suggested that a bourgeois public sphere embodied the fundamental idea of a public sphere that was different from private individuals and public authorities. In this regard, the democratic salon seems to represent the core value of salon inside Legislative Yuan: a free place for social communication and public debates.

As stated early, due to the relative majority of the ruling party in Legislative Yuan, they could pass most laws without sufficient debates. Deliberative democracy is based on discussion and negotiation. It emphasizes that citizens form a set of mutually acceptable consensus through debate, deduction, and mutual communication to facilitate the implementation of national policies (Cohen, 1989; Habermas, 1996). Therefore, the Sunflower Student Movement created functionally similar public spheres, both in the street and inside the Legislature Yuan. The “democratic classroom” uses academic theories to think about the contemporary issues of the trade agreement. The “democratic salon” demonstrates the practices of deliberative democracy. Through simulating the decision-making process of public policies, participants of this movement have demonstrated the creativity and diversity of Taiwan’s democratic society.

Although we are not sure whether the public spheres formed by this movement will deepen democratic governance or transform government institutions in the long run, such attempts surely push the government to make changes. The following news report describes how the government applied the concept of a “World Café” to construct a public sphere within government agencies:

The Executive Yuan opens the “World Café” today! World Café is the popular concept of deliberative democracy in the modern era. Its characteristics are informed discussion, active listening, rational dialogue, and respect for tolerance. After being

struck by the 318 Student Movement, the Ma administration has been trying to find a way to be close with students. Now, for the first time in the hall of the Executive Yuan, the “World Café” was launched. (Gu & Yang, 2014, China Times)

The World Café embodied the concept of deliberative democracy. The government’s initiative intended to bridge the gap between citizens and officials to demonstrate that the government was able to integrate and combine public opinions. However, the public sphere initiated by the government was no longer a sphere of the public that kept a distance from government agencies. That is to say, the government, under democratic systems, must abide by established administrative and legislative rules. Voters give the government the right to implement policies of the majority, but the government also restricts the freedom of the minority to participate in public affairs. Therefore, there is no public sphere composed of government agencies because the government cannot meet the collective consensus of different positions. The positive role of the World Café seems to remind citizens that the end of the election is the beginning of political participation. Furthermore, the public sphere shaped by the Internet has touched on the concept of deliberative democracy. The debates of cyberspace and the formation of a sense of identity have influenced political and social relationships (Gimmler, 2001). The public sphere has been transformed into a field where individuals and groups can quickly combine or separate that has the potential to influence citizens’ collective consciousness in real life. For example, after the Sunflower Student Movement, regional and presidential elections showed that ordinary people desired to participate in politics and reform society (Hsiao, 2016; Hsieh 2015). This new cultural, social and political phenomenon shows the different forms of individual power in everyday resistance.

4.3.3 Individual power

Civil society, media and power

The Sunflower Student Movement accumulated the experience and energy of social movements during the Ma's government and deepened the depth, durability and breadth of Taiwan's civil society (Fell, 2017). In recent years, Taiwan's civic movement has reflected China's growing political and economic power, which has affected the development and tendencies of Taiwan's civil society (Schubert, 2016). Although the Sunflower Student Movement embodied the effect of joint mobilization with the "China Factor," the general public also focused on contemporary issues such as globalization, neoliberalism and free trade. As Ho (2018) noted, "Sunflower Movement was solidly based on Taiwan's civil society" (p. 86). Therefore, the Sunflower Student Movement has promoted a dynamic political structure in Taiwan's society. For example, after this movement, some participants were devoted to local elections and hoped to transform the rigid political environment.

The link between the connectivity of the Internet and the actions of citizens received widespread attention during the Sunflower Student Movement. This student movement reflected the immediacy of network mobilization from multiple platforms. Jenkins (2006) has used the notion of "media convergence" and "convergence culture" to describe people's actions in a digital era where media that can be used to connect with others is ubiquitous. The pattern of political participation in the collective mobilization of physical space has been replaced by the space of the online community (Chen, H.T., Ping, S. & Chen, G., 2015). More precisely, online media has innovated the production of Taiwan's political space. Individuals, citizens and the government have formed or constructed a multi-level relationship. This process of construction subtly transforms the power relationship between people and government agencies. For example, the following news report illustrated that the Sunflower

Student Movement promoted the organizational transformation of parliament:

Last year, the Sunflower Movement triggered the “black shirt army” (黑衫軍) on the streets. To let the new parliament “have no black box (黑箱) and no secret room,” the new speaker of the Legislative Yuan, Su Jia-chyuan (蘇嘉全), announced yesterday that he would promote an online petition that can be used to propose major bills, and allow citizen reporters to enter the parliament chamber to the utmost degree. (Liu & Ceng, 2016, China Times)

This news report describes how the collective consciousness of individuals gathering in the online community or online space has extended not only to the citizens’ protests on the street but also to the changes in the political structure. Citizens can influence the implementation of government policies broadly. Furthermore, this report also pointed out that the Legislative Yuan responded to one of the basic demands of the Sunflower Student Movement after the political party rotation: “transparent parliament and open government.” Therefore, individual power showed the collective will in the civil society and transformed the fixed structure of the government. As Foucault (2008) analyzed one of the characteristics of civil society:

It is a permanent matrix of political power. ... There is a spontaneous formation of power. How does this come about? It is brought about quite simply by a de facto bond which links different concrete individuals to each other. (p. 303-304)

It can be said that the networked society mainly constituted by mobile media has rapidly strengthened the intensity and breadth of “a fact.” Take the function of smartphones as an example. Within the physical screen, the flowing text, photos and images constantly form the

composition of any given concepts. These constructive concepts shape a possible fact under appropriate social conditions that can be widely spread to a large number of people.

Therefore, the power relationship here is no longer a disciplinary mechanism between government agencies and individuals, but the collective form of resistance through the construction of a series of ideologies and individual consciousness. This type of individual power possibly has changed the public's formation of assembly: through the combination of cyberspace and physical space, citizens are more capable of autonomously forming protest groups and exerting pressure on the government.

However, the government is also likely to grasp the protestors' trace and intention through private information online. For example, the following report explains the applications of big data analysis:

When it was expected that students might rush to the Legislative Yuan, the term "Legislative Yuan" suddenly skyrocketed across the community based on the analysis of online keywords, and then the students occupied the parliament chamber. (Yang, Guo & Zhou, 2016, United Daily News)

Therefore, borrowing the concept of Foucault (1990), power must be understood as a multiplicity of force relations. "They operate and which constitute their own organization; as the process which, through ceaseless struggles and confrontation, transforms, strengthens, or reverses them" (p. 92). Following this idea, the achievement of the Sunflower Student Movement has, to some extent, expanded the participation of individual power in the political field and completed the short-term goals. However, the government, as the centralized form of state power, can acquire strategic advantage at any time again.

Mobile technology and surveillance

The circulation of power between individuals (or groups) and the government has deepened the practice and participation of civil society. However, communities formed through cyberspace may have to face a ubiquitous surveillance mechanism. For example, Lee (2015) proposes a two-way relationship between transparency and surveillance in media communication. In the case of the Sunflower Student Movement, the occupiers of the Legislative Yuan delivered the “truth” through the live stream. He noted that “the live stream not only enabled the protests to speak, but also imprisoned them under the surveillance of the invisible gaze. . . . these cameras turned the Legislative Yuan into a panopticon” (Lee, 2015, p. 38). Based on Lee’s notion, on the one hand, the images and videos transmitted through the camera lens instantly recorded the actions and demands of the protesters. On the other hand, the people, as the audiences, could watch the situation in the Legislative Yuan outside the camera at all times. This concept echoes the mechanism of Foucault’s reference to the panopticon of Bentham. The space of the Legislative Yuan was like a panopticon where watchers can watch the prisoner’s every move with an invisible gaze. Panopticon’s disciplinary mechanism reflects the surveillance mechanism of modern society (Foucault, 1991). However, this example has two different dimensions in the digital age. If a classic panopticon mechanism (like Bentham’s panopticon) means that one person watches the “screen,” then what kind of social mechanism can be seen when many people watch the actors within the “screen” at the same time?

The innovation of mobile networks and the Internet has changed the traditional forms and practices of surveillance. Today, the surveillance in our society should reflect the so-called “viewer society” (Mathiesen, 1997). Mathiesen thought that the institutional relationship between the synopticon (many see the few) and the panopticon (few see the many) forms a viewer society. He argued that “today it is technologically entirely possible to

have a large number of consumers synoptically watch television and pay for the commodities advertised, ...while the producers of the commodities panoptically survey everyone, controlling the consumers' ability to pay, ..." (Mathiesen, 1997, p. 223-224). From this perspective, the use of mobile media during the Sunflower Student Movement provided an omnipresent platform for actors to watch the situation in the Legislative Yuan and initiated corresponding actions. But the government can also use its own power mechanism to grasp the intention of the actors and curb possible riots. Furthermore, we are now in the social structure of "ubiquitous" or "liquid" surveillance (Bauman & Lyon, 2013). Individuals, groups and governments complicate and blur the function of surveillance mechanisms. For example, although social media can facilitate the process of movement, it also allows the government to use the characteristics of the Internet to track down protesters.

In fact, after the Sunflower Student Movement, the government was aware that the online community was a powerful tool for mass organizations and mobilization. For example, the following news report mentions the issues of network security and data collection:

During the movement, the information and intelligence of the policing system were insufficient, leading to an upper officer mistakenly judged and dealing with the situation. Therefore, how to effectively carry out "network surveillance" and understand the action of protest through the Internet in advance has been the critical work at this stage. (Peng, 2014, Liberty Times)

This news report uses the term "network surveillance" to describe how the government can use the Internet to collect information about the protest and protesters in the future. It seems that this student movement effectively took advantage of the government's neglect of the media power to successfully organized people to try to resist government policies. However,

when the state, as a concentrated form of power, adjusts its operational strategies, we can predict that the government's security mechanism will trigger the recurrence of the old panopticon in cyberspace.

Castells (2011) has suggested that there are power and counterpower exercised in the network society. These configurations of power relations construct human behaviors on the basis of dynamic interaction. Similarly, in the case of the Sunflower Student Movement, the mobile network constructed two dynamic power structures in this social movement and the modern social framework. First, the general public can efficiently assemble dispersed individuals through various practical experiences of digital technology. Political power is more easily challenged by individual power. Take the Sunflower Student Movement as a typical example. National laws and regulations clearly regulated the scope and time of the protest, limiting the movement of the body and reduced possible abnormal behavior. However, the combination of the mobile media and the body provided more strategic techniques for the subject, changing the control and effect of power (Campbell & Kwak, 2010; Green, 2002a). As a result, the protesters could gain opportunities to overcome the layers of protection in the institutional system and further challenge the rule of law in democratic societies. It seems that the mobile media and the body showed new techniques of the self. In Foucault's words, by ourselves or with the help of others, techniques of the self are a variety of "operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being, so as to transform I themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection, or immortality" (Foucault 1988, p. 18). Here, we can acknowledge that protesters with the "portable" knowledge, information and messages have constructed themselves as active subjectivity. Active subjectivity in this regard indicates that individuals are actively involved in achieving and actualizing possible social change. Second, digital technology will also expand the country's disciplinary powers.

Foucault (1988) said that technologies of power “which determine the conduct of individuals and submit them to certain ends or domination, an objectivizing of the subject” (p. 18). This technology of domination makes the management of individuals more possible in the mobile network. As stated early, the government can track the roamer’s private “footprint” through a national security system. Especially today, the Internet not only spread all over the city, but also moves with the body. It is conceivable that individuals are possibly exposed to the surveillance of government security mechanisms all the time.

In short, the boundaries between the public and private spheres in power structure are blurring, involving constant changes in ideology and knowledge systems. From an individual perspective, everyone is the subject of power and the object of power. Power relations will be increasingly complicated structures between creativity (resistance) and repression (monitoring) at political and social levels.

5 CONCLUSION

5.1 Mobile network, spatial practice and power relation

This thesis explores the functions and outcomes of the mobile network in a specific spatial, cultural, and social context through the case of the Sunflower Student Movement. By the method of critical discourse analysis, this study demonstrates the positive effects of the various mobile communication, promoting the social interaction between discourse and the real world. In this sense, the relationship between power and knowledge production is deeply discussed at the abstract level. The following three dimensions of critical discourse analysis (social events, social practices, and social structures) are used to illustrate the characteristics and preliminary results of this research.

First, the dispute over the Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement (CSSTA) was the epitome of Taiwan's economic, political and social conflicts. The so-called "China factor" in that time triggered the Taiwan people's doubts about globalization and regional economic integration. Therefore, many of the arguments focused on how China's growing political and economic power would affect Taiwan's autonomy. In particular, Taiwan is currently a unique political entity. At some level, cultural identity and generational differences became one of the leading causes of the Sunflower Student Movement. In this context, this movement not only reflected the long-standing economic problems in Taiwan, but also showed a high degree of uncertainty in political issues. It is worth mentioning that the concept of cultural memory is used as a historical aspect to trace Taiwan's complex social and cultural structure. The Kuomintang (KMT) and the authorities have indeed shaped the symbolic political symbols in the process of democratization in Taiwan, affecting the nationality and cultural awareness of Taiwanese. Taiwan's complex and diverse political, social, economic and cultural construction processes accumulated the energy and sustainability of the Sunflower Student Movement.

Second, the mobile network (mobile media) has constructed a new type of civic movement in Taiwan. This study shows that the abrupt occupation of the Legislative Yuan in the Sunflower Student Movement was mainly due to the use and application of mobile media. Although it was not a new idea for the public to occupy buildings or public space, the use of mobile media has transformed the virtual and physical space, constituting conditions beyond the geographical boundary. Therefore, the mobile network has become a habitual communication model related to the technological industry. The mobile devices and the mobility of human can be regarded as a sociocultural phenomenon which has been composed of a series of practical experiences. The various practices of using mobile media in social movements have indirectly affected political and social fields. For example, this study analyzes the forms of lives stream in the Legislative Yuan and the role of smartphones in the occupation of the Executive Yuan to explore the dual changes in space/place and the interaction of virtual/physical space. Therefore, the mobile media constitutes a widespread mobile network, blurring the imagination of the space, and transforming electronic messages into concrete actions of physical space. Furthermore, the understanding of media as a practical concept helps us to clarify the nature of the media. With the development of mobile media, the social mobilization of the Internet generation is totally different from the traditional protests.

Third, the social meanings and power relations in the Sunflower Student Movement. The protesters' occupation of the Legislative Yuan declared Taiwan's long-term conflicts of party politics and constitutional issues under the democratic system. This paper explores the core problems of judicial judgment and democratic values to shed light on the pitfalls and possibilities of Taiwan's political system. For instance, the public sphere formed within the Legislative Yuan experimentally discussed the feasibility of deliberative democracy. The democratic classroom on the street showed the modern public space of social movement. The

Sunflower Student Movement has reflected the structural problems of Taiwan's society and urged the government to focus on the reforms of administration. As mentioned above, this study emphasizes how individual power formed collective consciousness in this movement and influenced the decision-making of the authority. However, because people heavily rely on mobile media for everyday practice, the government can develop strong monitoring mechanisms to find out any potential resistance. Therefore, power must be understood as something continuously flows embodied in the institutions, norms, and cultures of modern society. Since the power is no longer the stable structure, Taiwanese people are calling for in-depth social and political reforms.

Overall, this thesis conducts a three-dimension analysis as following: the social background of the Sunflower Student Movement as a social event, mobile networks as social practice, and individual power as social structure. The spatial practices within the mobile network acted as a medium to transform various ideas and arguments into actual social movement. The essential elements of the occupation were related to Taiwan's social and democratic systems and constituted a new power relationship. This study demonstrates that participants in the Sunflower Student Movement have successfully used mobile media to reshape the relationship between the public and the government in the framework of a democratic society. More broadly, this movement can be regarded as a particular moment in Taiwan's history, showing the relationship between power and knowledge.

5.2 Two formations of discourse—power and knowledge

The structures of the discourse can be divided into two types in this thesis. First, the language that politicians, scholars, experts, general public used. These discourses composed of specific languages structure pointed out the formation of Taiwan's politics, culture and society at a given time. Second, the texts presented in different kinds of newspapers. Therefore, we can note that various possible knowledge systems are built in an infinite combination of

discourses, such as, globalization, political economy and democratic institutions. Following this context, the discourse itself does not refer to a normative truth, but functions on the objects through various practices of knowledge. We should focus on the fragmentation of the knowledge system of discourse in a specific historical period. In other words, the knowledge system can be seen as a communication process that points to the behavioral norms, institutional structures, and dissemination of our historical culture at a certain moment.

This thesis thus analyzes the social, economic, cultural, and historical discursive operations during the Sunflower Student Movement. This study finds that this movement reproduces an ideology and consolidates a specific type of knowledge. For example, the economic agreement between Taiwan and China contained the entanglements of society and culture in contemporary Taiwan. The subjective consciousness of the Taiwanese continuously enhanced through different discourse mechanisms in this movement. It can be said that the issues of Taiwanese identity have been the process of continuous shaping of knowledge and discourse. The government, politicians, and individuals thus played a “game of power” in their respective positions, describing the meaning of knowledge during a period. It is worth noting that the mobile network (mobile media) involved in the production of knowledge has dramatically changed the political and social landscape. A visible example was the “lazy pack” phenomenon which emphasized the rapid dissemination of information in an easy-to-understand way. This new type of tactic has rendered any government propaganda ineffective and has demonstrated that digital gaps could lead to vast differences in knowledge access.

Furthermore, this study shows that the interactive mechanism between the body and the mobile device has been a new form of resistance in the power relation. To a certain extent, the connection between modern technology and the connectivity of human reflects the “docile body” of the discipline mechanism (Foucault, 1991). People go to anywhere with their mobile devices to complete various tasks in daily life have been the construction of social and

cultural structures. Indeed, the Sunflower Student Movement demonstrated the functions and effects of mobile media. However, people now live on the various applications and digital information of mobile media. We may imagine that the government can collect information on the Internet and accurately grasp the individual's whereabouts. The human bodies are in the discipline system created by panoptic technology. Resistance and practice, thus, in the discipline mechanism, demonstrate the fluidity of power relations between the power holders and the individuals.

By analyzing the case of the Sunflower Student Movement, this thesis also finds that news producers have their own political perspectives and ideological views. For example, the China Times focused on reporting the economic benefits of the trade agreement, while the Liberty Times emphasized political risks. Although the aim of this study is not to compare the political positions of different newspapers, the discourse analysis revealed the ambiguity of the Sunflower Student Movement. In other words, people choose to read certain kinds of newspapers, that is, accept the operation of certain ideologies. Therefore, this study discovers the formation of discourse and analyze the transformation of social structure. In Taiwan's specific social, political, and economic contexts, the spatial practices of the mobile network have promoted the strength of individual power in the disciplined system. Media innovation has not only changed the forms of resistance, but also deeply faltered the institutional society.

To conclude, this thesis depicts the uniqueness of the Sunflower Student Movement in the Internet generation, marking the entanglement of Taiwan's society, politics and cultural identity. This study considers that cultural identity which presented as a form of resistance was one of the most important symbolic tools of the Sunflower Student Movement. Hall (1996) suggested that "precisely because identities are constructed within, not outside, discourse, we need to understand them as produced in specific historical and institutional sites within specific discursive formations and practices, by specific enunciative strategies" (p. 4).

In this sense, identities are changeable, dynamic and interruptive concepts in our society. The case of the Sunflower Student Movement clearly showed that Taiwanese identity was strengthened due to the political issues between China and Taiwan. The discourse of Taiwanese nationality and subjectivity caused heated controversy during the protest. Politicians, protesters and citizens have their own comprehension of identity based on the culture and social conditions of Taiwan. When we consider an identity truth, we also ignore the possibilities of other groups/individuals. Thus, as shown in the Sunflower Student Movement, the so-called “Taiwanese identity” can be interpreted in different ways to achieve specific goals in the political field. The generation gap was also reflected in the development of mobile networks. More importantly, the spatial practice of mobile media has successfully subverted traditional mobilization and organizational forms. However, culture itself cannot produce the effect of communication, while individuals can represent the culture in the various discourse, media or platforms. Therefore, all communication should be interpersonal communication. Nowadays, whether in physical space or virtual space, people can use technological gadgets to actualize timely communication with others. Humans can be said to be an extension of media and technology products, rather than being attached to it. Thus, mobile communication is a faster and more effective interpersonal communication that changes the boundaries between the real world and cyberspace. The concept of spatial practice and power-knowledge relations can be extended to the daily practice of society, culture, and politics in future research.

5.3 Limitation

This research uses critical discourse analysis as the research method to study the various forms of power, knowledge, and discourse in the mobile space. This thesis explains the complexity of the power-knowledge relation in the mobile network, providing a new way to interpret the perspectives on the human body between communication, political resistance and

technology. However, there are some limitations to use critical discourse analysis to explore the societal, cultural and political issues in this ever-changing everyday life.

First, the three-dimensions analysis of critical discourse seems to presuppose a social and political framework (Fairclough, 2006). The newspapers selected, as the primary data of discourse, may be biased in a mainstream social context, ignoring other viewpoints and opinions.

Second, this study selected three local newspapers in Taiwan to show the functions and effects of the mobile network in the Sunflower Student Movement, which may not fully demonstrate the global visions. Furthermore, these newspapers were all published in Chinese, to some extent, which will restrict non-Chinese readers from directly understanding the complex political and economic environment of contemporary Taiwanese society.

Third, whether the use of critical discourse analysis and Foucault's discursive methods could adequately shed light on the relationship between power, knowledge, and discourse? The framework of critical discourse analysis provided a specific research approach, while Foucault's research did not systematically propose methods. Therefore, the data studied in this thesis may not provide concrete empirical results as a whole. In addition, parts of the observation were inclined to philosophical thinking that may only mention possible ideas in the abstract.

Fourth, this study claims that the development of mobile networks has affected the strategies and processes of protests. However, the inevitability of the relationship between the Sunflower Student Movement and the mobile network should be looked at in more detail, since the selected data provided less practical experience. For example, the various functions of social media and the applications of smartphones.

Fifth, this study considers mobile communication a feature of modern culture in power relations. However, the discussion of culture seems to be limited to the issues of personal

identity, generational conflicts, and political opinions derived from long-term social structures. On the whole, interpersonal communication can be seen as intercultural communication. Thus, for further research, we can focus on the practices of different groups using technology to interact with physical and virtual space.

5.4 Origin, implication and future research

An article from Time magazine inspired this study. This article described how refugees relied on smartphone apps such as Google Maps, Facebook messenger, and WhatsApp to help them overcome the dangers and emergencies of long journeys in the Syrian war (Witty, 2015). This example showed the interaction between mobile communication and human mobility in physical space and virtual space. In some ways, smartphones have not only become lifeline but also tools of resistance in the international power structure, providing mobile users with more approaches to cross borders/boundaries. Following this context, this thesis re-evaluates the various factors of the Sunflower Student Movement and attempts to outline the interactive relationship between space, power, and knowledge in the generation of mobile communication by analyzing discourse.

This study finds that mobile media played an essential role in the Sunflower Student Movement. The diversified applications of mobile communications have promoted the spread of information between groups. This case study may provide a new perspective on the theoretical framework and empirical analysis to explore the tension between mobility and power in space. Although this thesis mostly discusses the sense of place and space created by mobile communication, it also reflects on the capital flowing in different geographical spaces and borders from the perspective of globalization which leads to economic and political consequences.

In addition, this thesis argues that democratic politics has taken on a multifaceted appearance after this protest in Taiwan, such as the idea of an open government, live-

streaming of the Legislative Yuan, and the establishment of new political parties. However, the government can also use various new technologies to trace and grasp the personal information of the citizens in the digital age. Therefore, it is foreseeable that the power relations between the government and citizens may be more complicated.

The practical experience of knowledge, power, and mobile communications in daily life can be important issues for future research. The mobile media have provided “pedestrians” with thousands of strategies to change the existing order (de Certeau, 1984). Individuals can receive and disseminate specific information at all times, affecting the cognitive awareness of others. Quite a few factors are affecting social and political issues. For example, social media and instant messages have the force to incite people to gather quickly. In this sense, potential research topics can redefine the structural changes between space, place and power. Due to the popularity of mobile devices, protests now may be leaning towards a decentralized model. There are no true leaders in some cases. The process and results of protests have been unpredictable recently. Obviously, human movement and information flow have become intertwined in communication networks. Therefore, from a certain point of view, the mobile media have become an extension of the body, or even the part of the body, flowing in the network-like power structure.

Comparative research can also be a feasible research direction in the fields of mobile communication and intercultural communication. Mobile communications can be said to be an international phenomenon that crosses territorial and national borders. The comparative study of mobile communication in different regions can develop the field of mobile media, and construct the functions and strategies of spatial practice in intercultural communication. The various forms of power structure and knowledge articulation can provide us with multiple perspectives to understand the interactive formations between the sense of place and space. The globalized world and mobile technology now are interwoven with social networks to

reshape the power relations between people and governments. These potential influences have not only contributed to meaningful progress but also caused vast differences. For example, the Brexit in the UK, the anti-extradition bill protests in Hong Kong and the Sunflower Student Movement in Taiwan may have reflected the core reality of our time—the differences between generations. This thesis implies that the most changeable element in our society has not been the fast flow of goods, services, and information, but individuals in the complicated network of power. Thus, in the future, communication research can develop various frameworks to help us understand the dynamic relation of power and knowledge in the context of media and human.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, B. (2006). *Imagined communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London, UK: Verso.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: cultural dimensions of globalization*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Armstrong, S. P. (2013). Taiwan's Asia Pacific economic strategies after the Economic Cooperation Framework Agreement. *Journal of the Asia Pacific Economy*, 18(1), 98-114. doi: 10.1080/13547860.2012.742668
- Assmann, A. (2011). *Cultural memory and western civilization: functions, media, archives*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Assmann, A. & Conrad, S. (Eds.). (2010). *Memory in a global age: discourses, practices and trajectories*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Assmann, A. & Shortt, L. (Eds.). (2012). *Memory and political change*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Assmann, J. (2011). *Cultural memory and early civilization: writing, remembrance and political imagination*. UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Au, A. (2017). The Sunflower Movement and the Taiwanese national identity: building an anti-sinoist civic nationalism. *Berkeley Journal of Sociology*. Retrieved from <http://berkeleyjournal.org/2017/04/the-sunflower-movement-and-the-taiwanese-national-identity-building-an-anti-sinoist-civic-nationalism/>
- Barth, F. (1998). Introduction. In F. Barth (Ed.), *Ethnic groups and boundaries: the social organization of culture difference* (pp. 9-38). Illinois: Waveland Press.
- Bauman, Z. (2000). *Liquid modernity*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Bauman, Z. & Lyon, D. (2013). *Liquid surveillance: a conversation*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

- Beckershoff, A. (2017). The Sunflower Movement: origins, structures, and strategies of Taiwan's resistance against the 'black box.' In D. Fell (Ed.), *Taiwan's Social Movements under Ma Ying- Jeou* (pp. 113-133). London and New York: Routledge.
- Bennett, W. L. & Segerberg, A. (2011). Digital media and the personalization of collective action: social technology and the organization of protests against the global economic crisis. *Information, Communication & Society*, 14, 770-799.
doi: 10.1080/1369118X.2011.579141
- Berry, M. & Schleser, M. (Eds.). (2014). *Mobile media making in an age of smartphone*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a theory of practice*. (R. Nice, Trans.). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Bush, R. C. (2016). The 2016 election and prospects of Taiwan's democracy. *Orbis*, 60, 473-487. doi: 10.1016/j.orbis.2016.08.001
- Campbell, S. W. (2008). Mobile technology and the body: apparatgeist, fashion, and function. In J.E. Katz (Ed.), *Handbook of mobile communication studies* (pp. 153-164). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Campbell, S. W. (2013). Mobile media and communication: a new field, or just a new journal? *Mobile Media & Communication*, 1, 8-13. doi: 10.1177/2050157912459495
- Campbell, S. W. & Kwak, N. (2010). Mobile communication and civic life: linking patterns of use to civic and political engagement. *Journal of Communication*, 60, 536-555. doi: 10.1111/j.1460-2466.2010.01496.x
- Campbell, S. W. & Park, Y. J. (2008). Social implications of social telephony: the rise of social communication society. *Sociology Compass*, 2(2), 371-387. doi: 10.1111/j.1751-9020.2007.00080.x
- Campbell, S. W. & Russo, T. C. (2003). The social construction of mobile telephony: an

- application of the social influence model to perceptions and uses of mobile phones within personal communication networks. *Communication Monographs*, 70, 317-334.
doi: 10.1080/0363775032000179124
- Carabine, J. (2001). Unmarried motherhood 1830-1990: a genealogical analysis. In M. Wetherell, S. Taylor & S. J. Yates (Eds.), *Discourse as data: a guide for analysis* (pp, 267-310). London, UK: Sage & Open University Press.
- Casey, E. S. (1987). *Remembering: a phenomenological study*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Castells, M. (1996). *The rise of the network society*. Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishers.
- Castells, M. (2008). The new public sphere: global civil society, communication networks, and global governance. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 616(1), 79-93.
- Castells, M. (2009). *Communication power*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Castells, M. (2011). A network theory of power. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 773-787.
- Castells, M. (2012). *Networks of outrage and hope: social movements in the Internet age*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Chang, W. C. (2017). The right to free assembly and the Sunflower Movement. In B. C. Jones (Ed.), *Law and politics of the Taiwan Sunflower and Hong Kong Umbrella Movement*. (pp. 30-48). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Chen, C. L. (2007). Trauma, museums and the formation of collective memory. *A Radical Quarterly in Social Studies*, 66, 105-143. doi:10.29816/TARQSS.200706.0003
- Chen, F. Y. & Yen, W. T. (2017). Who supports the Sunflower Movement? an examination of nationalist sentiments. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 52, 1193-1212.
doi: 10.1177/0021909616645372

- Chen, H. T., Ping, S., & Chen, G. (2015). Far from reach but near at hand: the role of social media for cross-national mobilization. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 53, 443-451.
doi: 10.1016/j.chb.2015.05.052
- Chen, T. L. (2008). The predicament of historical justice: ethnic issues and the discourses on the 228 uprising. *Bulletin of Academia Historica*, 16, p.179-222.
doi:10.7058/BAH.200806.0179
- Chen, W. C., Chang, H. H. & Huang, S. J. (2016). The coming of networked social movements? social ties and social media in the Sunflower Movement. *Journal of Social Sciences and Philosophy*, 28, 467-501.
- Chouliaraki, L. & Fairclough, N. (1999). *Discourse in late modernity*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Clark, C. & Tan, A. C. (2016). Identity and integration as conflicting forces stimulating the Sunflower Movement and the Kuomintang's loss in the 2014 elections. *Contemporary Chinese Political Economy and Strategic Relations: An International Journal*, 2, 313-349.
- Cohen, J. (1989). Deliberation and democratic legitimacy. In A. Hamlin & P. Pettit (Eds.), *The good polity: normative analysis of the state* (pp. 17-34). Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Cook, C. (2010). Mobile marketing and political activities. *International Journal of Mobile Marketing*, 5(1), 154-163.
- Costanza-Chock, S. (2012). Mic check! Media cultures and the occupy movement. *Social Movement Studies*, 11, 375-385. doi: 10.1080/14742837.2012.710746
- Couldry, N. (2004). Theorizing media as practice. *Social Semiotics*, 14, 115-132.
doi: 10.1080/1035033042000238295.
- Couldry, N. (2012). *Media, society, world: social theory and digital media practice*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

- Cresswell, T. (2004). *Place: a short introduction*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing.
- Cresswell, T. (2009). Place. In N, Thrift. & R, Kitchen. (Eds.), *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography* (Vol. 8, pp. 169-177). Oxford, UK: Elsevier.
- De Certeau, M. (1984). *The practice of everyday life* (S. Rendall, Trans.). Berkeley: University of California Press. (Original work published 1980)
- De Souza e Silva, A. (2006). From cyber to hybrid: mobile technologies as interfaces of hybrid spaces. *Space and Culture*, 9, 261-278. doi: 10.1177/1206331206289022
- Dean, J. (2003). Why the net is not a public sphere. *Constellations*, 10, 95-112.
doi: 10.1016/j.orbis.2016.08.001
- Dutton, W. H. (2009). The fifth estate emerging through the network of networks. *Prometheus*, 27, 1-15. doi: 10.1080/08109020802657453
- Election Study Center, National Chengchi University. (2019). *Changes in the Taiwanese/Chinese identity of Taiwanese as tracked in survey by the Election Study Center, NCCU (1992-2019)*. Retrieved from <https://esc.nccu.edu.tw/app/news.php?Sn=166>
- Elwood, S. & Leszczynski, A. (2013). New spatial media, new knowledge politics. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 38, 544-559.
doi: 10.1111/j.1475-5661.2012.00543.x
- Fairclough, N. (1992). *Discourse and social change*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Fairclough, N. (2006). *Language and globalization*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Fell, D. (2012). *Government and politics in Taiwan*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Fell, D. (Ed.). (2017). *Taiwan's social movements under Ma Ying-jeou: from the Wild Strawberries to the Sunflowers*. Abingdon, UK: Routledge.
- Ferraris, M. (2015). *Introduction to new realism*. London, UK: Bloomsbury.
- Fleischauer, S. (2007). The 228 Incident and the Taiwan independence movement's

construction of a Taiwanese identity. *China Information*, 21, 373-401.

doi: 10.1177/0920203X07083320

Fortunati, L. (2002). The mobile phone: towards new categories and social relations, information. *Communication and Society*, 5(4), 513-529.

doi: 10.1080/13691180208538803

Fortunati, L., Manganelli, A. M., & de Luca, F. (2015). Is mobile phone use associated with spatial dimensions? a comparative study on mobile phone use in five European countries. *Information, Communication & Society*, 18, 1057-1075.

doi: 10.1080/1369118X.2015.1015592

Foucault, M. (1971). Nietzsche, Genealogy, History. In J. D. Faubion (Ed.). *Aesthetics, method, and epistemology* (pp. 369-391). New York, NY: New Press.

Foucault, M. (1980). Tow lectures. In C. Gordon (Ed.), *Power/knowledge: selected interviews and other writings: 1972-1977*. New York, NY: Pantheon Books.

Foucault, M. (1986). *The history of sexuality, Vol 3: care of the self* (R. Hurley, Trans.). New York, NY: Pantheon Books. (Original work published 1984).

Foucault, M. (1988). Technologies of the self. In L. H. Martin, H. Gutman, & P. H. Hutton (Eds.), *Technologies of the self: a seminar with Michel Foucault* (pp 16-49). Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.

Foucault, M. (1990). *The history of sexuality, Vol 1: an introduction* (R. Hurley, Trans.). New York, NY: Vintage Books. (Original work published 1976).

Foucault, M. (1991). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison* (A. Sheridan, Trans.). UK, London: Penguin Books. (Original work published 1975).

Foucault, M. (1994). *The order of things: an archaeology of the human science*. New York, NY: Vintage Books. (Original work published 1966).

Foucault, M. (2008). *The birth of biopolitics: lectures at the Collège de France, 1978-79*.

- (G.Burchell, Trans., M. Senellart, Ed.). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Foucault, M. (2010). *The archaeology of knowledge and the discourse on language* (A. M. Sheridan Smith, Trans.). New York, NY: Vintage Books. (Original work published 1971).
- Gimmler, A. (2001). Deliberative democracy, the public sphere and the Internet. *Philosophy & Social Criticism*, 27, 21-39. doi: 10.1177/019145370102700402
- Gordon, J. (2007). The mobile phone and the public sphere: mobile phone usage in three critical situations. *Convergence*, 13, 307-319. doi: 10.1177/1354856507079181
- Green, N. (2002a). On the move: technology, mobility, and the mediation of social time and space. *The Information Society*, 18, 281-292. doi: 10.1080/01972240290075129
- Green, N. (2002b). Who's watching whom? monitoring and accountability in mobile relations. In B. Brown, N. Green, & R. Harper (Eds.), *Wireless world: social and interactional aspects of the mobile age* (pp. 19-31). Stockholm: Springer.
- Habermas, J. (1989). *The structural transformation of the public sphere: an inquiry into a category of bourgeois society* (T. Burger, Trans., with the assistance of F. Lawrence.). Cambridge, UK: Polity Press. (Original work published 1962).
- Habermas, J. (1996). *Between facts and norms: contributions to a discourse theory of law and democracy* (W. Rehg, Trans.). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. (Original work published 1992).
- Halbwachs, M. (1992). *On collective memory* (L. A. Coser, Ed., trans., intro.). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Hall, S. (1996). Introduction: who needs "identity" ? In S. Hall, & P. de Gay (Eds.), *Question of cultural identity* (pp. 1-17). London, UK: Sage.
- Harvey, D. (1990). *The condition of postmodernity: an enquiry into the origins of cultural change*. Cambridge, UK: Blackwell Publishers Inc.

- Harvey, D. (1993). From space to place and back again. In J. Bird, B. Curtis, T. Curtis, G. Robertson, & L. Tickner (Eds.), *Mapping the Futures* (pp. 3-29). London, UK: Routledge.
- Harvey, D. (2005). *Spaces of neoliberalization: towards a theory of uneven geographical development*. Stuttgart, Germany: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Hjorth, L., Burgess, J. & Richardson, I. (2012). *Studying mobile media: cultural technologies, mobile communication, and the iPhone*. New York, NY: Routledge
- Ho, M. S. (2013). *Gongmin yundong yu gongmin bu fucong: liang tiao wan jin Taiwan shehui yundong de luxian* [Civil movement and civil disobedience: two recent routes of Taiwan's social movement]. *New Society for Taiwan*, 30, 19-22.
- Ho, M. S. (2015). Occupy congress in Taiwan: political opportunity, threat and Sunflower Movement. *Journal of East Asian Studies*, 15, 69-97. doi: 10.1017/S1598240800004173
- Ho, M. S. (2017). From mobilization to improvisation: the lessons from Taiwan's 2014 sunflower movement, *Social Movement Studies*, 17, 189-202.
doi: 10.1080/14742837.2017.1377603
- Ho, M. S. (2018). From protest to electioneering: electoral and party politics after the Sunflower Movement. In J. Sullivan, & C-Y. Lee (Eds.), *A new era in democratic Taiwan: trajectories and turning points in politics and cross-strait relations* (pp.83-103). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Ho, M. S. (2019). The road to mainstream politics: how Taiwan's Sunflower Movement activists became politicians. In R. Youngs, (Ed.), *After protest: pathways beyond mass mobilization* (pp. 61-68). Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. Retrieved from <https://carnegieendowment.org>
- Hoskins, A. (2009). Digital network memory. In A. Erll & A. Rigney (Eds.), *Mediation, remediation and the dynamics of cultural memory* (pp.91-108). New York, NY: Walter

de Gruyter.

Hsiao, H. H. M. (2016). 2016 Taiwan elections: significance and implications. *Orbis*, 60(4), 504-514. doi: 10.1016/j.orbis.2016.08.006

Hsiao, Y. C. (2006). Changes in demographic characteristics and political attitudes of newspaper readers in Taiwan: 1992-2004. *Taiwan Democracy Quarterly*, 3(4), 37-70. doi: 10.6448/TDQ.200612.0037

Hsieh, J. (2015). Taiwan in 2014: a besieged president amid political turmoil. *Asian Survey*, 55, 142-147. doi: 10.1525/AS.2015.55.1.142

Huang, H. M. & Tsao, C. R. (2015). "Mobile" phones: the time/space and society/individual in the liquid modernity. *Mass Communication Research*, 124, 39-81.

Hung, C. L. (Ed.). (2015). *Sunflower Movement, new citizenry, and new media*. Taipei, TW: Net and Books.

Hung, S. C. (2016). The concepts of 3/18. *Router: A Journal of Cultural Studies*, 23, 9-32. doi: 10.6752/JCS.201609_(23).0002

International Telecommunication Union. (2019). *Measuring digital development, facts and figures 2019*. Geneva: ITU. Retrieved from <https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Documents/facts/FactsFigures2019.pdf>

Ito, M. (2008). Introduction. In K. Varnelis (Ed.), *Networked publics* (pp.1-14). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Jenkins, H. (2006). *Convergence culture: where old and new media collide*. New York, NY: New York University Press.

Jones, B. C. & Su, Y. T. (2015). Confrontational contestation and democratic compromise: the Sunflower Movement and its aftermath. *Hong Kong Law Journal*, 45, 193-210.

Juris, J. S. (2012). Reflections on #Occupy everywhere: Social media, public space, and emerging logics of aggregation. *American Ethnologist*, 39, 259-279.

- doi: 10.1111/j.1548-1425.2012.01362.x
- Kalin, J. & Frith, J. (2016). Wearing the city: memory p(a)laces, smartphones, and the rhetorical invention of embodied space. *Rhetoric Society Quarterly*, 46, 222-235.
doi: 10.1080/02773945.2016.1171692
- Kavada, A. (2015). Creating the collective: social media, the Occupy Movement and its constitution as a collective actor. *Information, Communication & Society*, 18, 872-886.
doi: 10.1080/1369118X.2015.1043318
- Kendall, G., & Wickham, G. (1999). *Using Foucault's methods*. London, UK: SAGE.
- Ku, Y. W. & Chang, Y. F. (2017). To be or not to be part of greater China: social development in the post-Ma Taiwan. *Social Policy & Administration*, 51, 898-915.
doi: 10.1111/spol.12338
- Lai, J. H. (1994). *228 Shi jian yan jiu bao gao [Research Report on the 228 Incident]*. Taipei: Reading Times Publishers.
- Lee, C. K. & Yang, W. Y. (2016). Old Taiwanese vs. new Taiwanese: exploring the generational difference of Taiwanese identity. *Taiwan Political Science Review*, 20(2), 125-186. doi:10.6683/TPSR.201612.20(2)
- Lee, M. C. (2015). Occupy on air: transparency and surveillance in Taiwan's Sunflower Movement. *Anthropology Now*, 7(3), 32-41. doi: 10.1080/19428200.2015.1103611
- Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The production of space* (D. Nicholson-Smith, Trans.). Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Lemos, A. (2008). Mobile communication and new sense of places: a critique of spatialization in cyberculture. *Revista Galáxia*, 16, 91-108. Retrieved from <https://www.redalyc.org/pdf/3996/399641242008.pdf>
- Lessig, L. (1996). The zones of cyberplace. *Stanford Law Review*, 48, 1403-1411.
doi: 10.2307/1229391

- Li, M. C. (2003). Explicit and implicit consciousness of Taiwanese ethnic and national identity. *Indigenous Psychological Research in Chinese Societies*, 20, 39-71.
doi: 10.6254/2003.20.39
- Lin, C. C. (2015). The analysis and critique on the role of newspapers through convergence: a case study of 4 mainstream newspapers in Taiwan. *Chinese Journal of Communication Research*, 28, 3-34. doi: 10.6195/cjcr.2015.28.01
- Lin, M. N. (1990). *Fen nu de ye bai he: san yi liu zhong zheng tang xue sheng jing zuo kang yi ji shi* [Angry Wild Lily: documentary of the protest on 16 March]. Taipei: Qianwei Publishing.
- Lin, T. M. & Su, Y. P. (2015). Flash-mob politics in Taiwan: new media, political parties, and social movements. *Taiwan Democracy Quarterly*, 12(2), 123-159.
- Ling, R. S. (2004). *Mobile connection: the cell phone's impact on society*. San Francisco, CA: Morgan Kaufmann.
- Liu, J. W. (2018). Sources of political knowledge: socioeconomic status, media use, and new media use. *Chinese Political Science Review*, 66, 29-63.
doi:10.6229/CPSR.201812_66.0002
- Liu, S. C. & Su, H. (2017). Mediating the sunflower movement: hybrid media networks in a digital age. *Journal of Cyber Culture and Information Society*, 33, 147-188.
doi:10.29843/JCCIS.201707_(33).0005
- Lyotard, J. F. (1984). *The postmodern condition: a report on knowledge* (G. Bennington & B. Massumi, Trans.). Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Margolis, M & Moreno-Riaño, G. (2009). *The prospect of Internet democracy*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Massey, D. (1993). Power-geometry and a progressive sense of place. In J. Bird, B. Curtis, T. Putnam, G. Robertson, & L. Tickner (Eds.), *Mapping the Futures* (p.59-69). London:

Routledge.

Mathiesen, T. (1997). The viewer society: Michel Foucault's 'panopticon' revisited.

Theoretical Criminology, 1, 215-234. doi: 10.1177/1362480610396645

Meyrowitz, J. (1985). *No sense of place: the impact of electronic media on social behavior*.

New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

McLuhan, M. (1964). *Understanding media: the extensions of man*. London: Routledge.

National Communications Commission. (2019). *Telecommunication figures in 2018*.

Retrieved from

https://www.ncc.gov.tw/english/news_detail.aspx?site_content_sn=621&is_history=0&pages=0&sn_f=3668.

National Development Council. (2014). *2014 digital opportunity survey for individuals and households: report summary*. Retrieved from

<https://ws.ndc.gov.tw/Download.ashx?u=LzAwMS9hZG1pbmlzdHJhdG9yLzExL3JlbGZpbGUvNTgxMy82ODkzLzAwNjE4NzQucGRm&n=MjAxNCBjbmRpdmlkdWFsSG91c2Vob2xkIERpZ210YWwgT3Bwb3J0dW5pdHkgU3VydmV5IGluIFRhaXdhbi5wZGY%3d&icon=..pdf>.

Pan, S. R. (2015). Changing civil society and national identity after the Sunflower Movement.

Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 202, 456-461.

doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.08.200

Rancière, J. (1999). *Dis-agreement: politics and philosophy* (J. Rose, Trans.). Minneapolis:

University of Minnesota Press. (Original work published 1995).

Rasmussen, T. (2014). Internet and the political public sphere. *Sociology Compass*, 8, 1315-

1329. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12228>

Rheingold, H. (2003). *Smart mobs: the next social revolution*. Cambridge, MA: Perseus

Publishing.

- Roth, B. R. (2017). Democratic political obligation with Chinese characteristics: civil defiance in Taiwan and Hong Kong. In B. C. Jones (Ed.), *Law and politics of the Taiwan Sunflower and Hong Kong Umbrella Movement* (pp. 191-204). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Rowen, I. (2015). Inside Taiwan's sunflower movement: twenty-four days in a student-occupied parliament, and the future of the region. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 74, 5-21. doi:10.1017/S0021911814002174
- Said, E. (1994). *Orientalism*. New York, NY: Vintage Books.
- Said, E. & Barsamian, D. (2003). *Culture and resistance: conversations with Edward W. Said*. Cambridge, MA: South End Press.
- Sandoval-Almazan, R. & Gil-Garcia, J. R. (2014). Towards cyberactivism 2.0? understanding the use of social media and other information technologies for political activism and social movements. *Government Information Quarterly*, 31, 365-378. doi:10.1016/j.giq.2013.10.016
- Scammell, M. (2014). *Consumer democracy: the marketing of politics*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Schubert, G. (Ed.) (2016). *Taiwan and the "China Impact": challenges and opportunities*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Seamon, D. (1980). Body-subject, time-space routines, and place-ballets. In A. Buttimer & D. Seamon (Eds.), *The human experience of space and place* (pp.148-165). London: Groom Helm.
- Serres, M. (2014). *Thumbelina: the culture and technology of millennials*. (D.W. Smith, Trans.). New York, NY: Rowman & Littlefield International. (Original work published 2012).
- Smith, A. C. (2008). Taiwan's 228 Incident and the politics of placing Blame. *Past Imperfect*,

- 14, p.143-163. doi: 10.21971/P7XK5F
- Smith, S. & Yu, C. (2014). *Wild Lilies and Sunflowers: political actors' responses to student movements in Taiwan*. [Online forum comment]. Retrieved from <https://aacs.cuny.cuny.edu/2014conference/Papers/Stephen%20Smith.pdf>
- Strait Exchange Foundation. (2012). *Haixia liangan fuwu maoyi xieyi* [Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement]. Retrieved from <http://www.ecfa.org.tw/EcfaAttachment/海峽兩岸服務貿易協議文本.pdf>
- Taiwan Network Information Center. (2018). *Taiwan Internet report 2018*. Retrieved from <https://www.twnic.net.tw/doc/twrp/201812d.pdf>.
- Thompson, J. B. (1990). *Ideology and modern culture: critical social theory in the era of mass communication*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Thompson, J. B. (2000). *Political scandal: power and visibility in the media age*. Cambridge, UK: Polity.
- Tien, H. M. & Tung, C. Y. (2011). Taiwan in 2011: mapping for a new political landscape and economic outlook. *Asian Survey*, 51, 76-84. doi: 10.1525/as.2011.51.1.76
- Toffler, A. (1980). *The third wave*. New York, NY: Bantam Books.
- Tsai, C. H. & Chen, L. H. (2015). China factor or civic disobedience? explaining support for the Sunflower Movement with panel data. *Journal of Social Sciences and Philosophy*, 27, 573-603.
- Tsatsou, P. (2018). Social media and informal organisation of citizen activism: lessons from the use of Facebook in the Sunflower Movement. *Social Media + Society*, 4(1), 1-12. doi: 10.1177/2056305117751384
- Tuan, Y. F. (1997). *Space and place: the perspective of experience*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Urry, J. (1996). How societies remember the past. In S. Macdonald & G. Fyfe (Eds.),

Theorizing museums: representing identity and diversity in a changing world (pp.45-65).

Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Van De Donk, W., Loader, B. D., Nixon, P. G., & Rucht, D. (Eds.). (2004). *Cyberprotest: new media, citizens, and social movements*. London: Routledge.

Wang, C. M. (2017). 'The future that belongs to us': affective politics, neoliberalism and the Sunflower Movement. *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 20, 177-192.

doi: 10.1177/1367877916683824

Wellman, B. (2001). Physical place and cyberplace: the rise of personalized networking.

International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, 25, 227-252.

doi: 10.1111/1468-2427.00309

Witty, P. (2015, October). See how smartphones have become a lifeline for refugees. *Time*.

Retrieved from <https://time.com>

Wrong, D. H. (1988). *Power: its forms, bases, and uses*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

REFERENCES FROM DATA

Newspaper reports

Bai, D. H. (2014, March 9). *Chen Deming: tai bu kaifang, jiang bian yuan hua* [If Taiwan dose not open its market, Taiwan will be marginalized]. *China Times*, p. A12.

Cao, B. Y. (2014, March 16). Tan Shenge: fumao, zhong bing tai wanmei zhengzhi xieyi [Service Trade Agreement is a perfect political agreement for China to annex Taiwan].

Liberty Times, p. A1

Ceng, W. Z & Wang, Y. Z. (2014, March 31). "Taiwan de weilai, you taiwan renmin ziji jue ding": Lin Fei-fan yu Ma jieshou renmin zhihui [‘The future of Taiwan is

determined by Taiwanese people’: Lin Fei-fan calls for President Ma to accept people’s

- command]. *Liberty Times*, p. A1.
- Chen, H. P. (2014, April 3). Guozu rentong diaocha, taiwan jin 2.3% ziren shi zhongguo ren [Survey of national identity, only 2.3 % Taiwanese recognized themselves as Chinese]. *Liberty Times*, p. A10
- Chen, R. W. & Wang, G. C. (2014, March 30). Ma: fumao bu zou hui tou lu, fumao na mai tai? [President Ma: how can the Service Trade Agreement “sell” Taiwan]. *United Daily News*, p. A3.
- Chen, Y. J., Peng, X. J., Lin X. Y., Xie, W. H. & Tu, J. M. (2014, March 21). Jietou minzhu jiaoshi, jiaoshou lunliu kaijiang [Democratic classroom in the street: professors began lecturing in turn]. *Liberty Times*, p. A4.
- Gu, J. X. & Yang, S. M. (2014, July 20). Lingting qingnian, zhengyuan jin kai shijie kafei guan [Executive Yuan opens World Café to listen the voice of youth]. *China Times*, p. A2.
- Guan, S. P. & Zhang, L. Z. (2014, March 25). Shi dai: ma xuexing zhenya rang ren xiangqi 228 [Time magazine: President Ma’s bloody oppression reminded people of the 228 Incident]. *Liberty Times*, p. A6.
- Huang, S. K. (2014, July 29). Wangyou yijian, jiang kui: dakai yanjie [Netizens’ opinions were eye-openers for Executive Dean Jiang]. *United Daily News*, p. A3.
- Huang, Y. Y. & Hu, Y. X. (2014, March 21). Jin wan xuesheng yongru, jiaoshou dajie kaijiang [Professors began lecturing for ten thousand students in the street]. *United Daily News*, p. A4.
- Jiang, S. H. (2014, April 9). Jonney Shih: zheci xueyun shi wanglu xingxiao de zhanxian [Jonney Shih: this student movement is a demonstration of online marketing]. *United Daily News*, p. A5.
- Lin, S. Z. (2015, May 11). LIVEhouse. in, xianshang zhibo, miao zhun wanglu shidai [Online

- streaming LIVEhouse. in is targeting at Internet generation]. *United Daily News*, p. AA3.
- Liu, K. Y. & Ceng, Z. Y. (2016, February 2). Su jiang tui gongmin jizhe, wanglu ti an [Legislative Speaker Su will encourage citizen journalists to enter Legislative Yuan and promote online petition]. *China Times*, p. A3.
- Liu, L. S. (2014, May 29). Jiegui wanglu shidai, zhengfu xiang tong le [Connecting with the Internet age. The government has figured it out]. *United Daily News*, p. A5.
- Lu, X. H. (2016, May 24). Yi ju zhengzhi shijian, jiu ke kua fazhi hongxian [Can the political event cross the red line of rule of law]. *China Times*, p. A2.
- Luo, T. B. (2014, March 3). Fumao da kai fang bian men, zhongguo ren feifa zhi tai jiang ehua [Service trade agreement will worsen the situation of illegal staying for Chinese people]. *Liberty Times*, p. A2.
- Ma, G. C. (2014, January 2). Xiang liyuan hanhua, kuai tongguo fumao-Ma: Taiwan chenggong gushi, xuji kong buzai [Calling Legislative Yuan to pass the Service Trade Agreement, president Ma: there may be no more sequel for Taiwan's successful stories]. *United Daily News*, p. A3.
- Peng, X. J. (2014, May 19). Jiankong wanglu, jinding "kangzheng" qingzi [Monitoring the Internet to keep eye on information about 'protest']. *Liberty Times*, p. A5.
- Qian, Z. Y. & Wang, G. C. (2014, January 23). Ma: fumao yandang, shanghai Taiwan [President Ma: delaying Service Trade Agreement is hurting Taiwan]. *United Daily News*, p. A8.
- Shu, Z. R. & Yang, Y. (2014, March 24). Zhan guohui gong zhengyuan, xianzheng zui da weiiji [Occupying Legislative Yuan and attacking Executive Yuan are the constitutional crisis]. *China Times*, p. A3.
- Tang, X. T. (2014, August 30). Xueyun tuishao, zhongguo ren rentong bilv huisheng [The

- student movement have faded away. Chinese identity is rebounding]. *China Times*, p. A18.
- Tang, X. T. & Gu, J. X. (2014, March 22). Xuesheng minzhu shalong, jiao liwei shen fumao [Students' democratic salon taught Legislators how to review Service Trade Agreement]. *China Times*, p. A4.
- Wang, G. C. & Chen, R. W. (2014, March 30). Ma: xianzai Taiwan minzhu zhidu canran dabei [President Ma: now Taiwan's democratic system is full-fledged]. *United Daily News*, p. A3.
- Wang, H. S. (2018, March 14). Tai yang hua xueyun, er shen weichi wuzui [Protesters of Sunflower Student Movement were acquitted in the second trial]. *United Daily News*, p. A5.
- Wang, S. L. (2016, May 25). Zhengzhi guashuai, Taiwan mei falv le [Politics take the lead. There is no law in Taiwan]. *United Daily News*, p. A4.
- Wang, X. J. & Yang, X. J. (2014, March 24). Mianbei gai juma, shouji haozhao tongban fanyue [Covering the barricades with comforter. Protesters used mobile phone to call for companion to climb over the wall]. *United Daily News*, p. A3.
- Xu, Z. Q. (2014, March 21). Wanglu shidai 'xueyun 2.0' chengxing [The Internet generation has made "student movement 2.0" take shape]. *China Times*, p. A3.
- Yang, S. M. (2014, March 20). Su kaiqi duihua, wu rang naoju bian beiju [Start conversation in a short time. Don't let the farce become tragedy]. *China Times*, p. A2.
- Yang, X. J., Guo, Q. L. & Zhou, Z. H. (2016, March 6). Tai yang hua xueyun, da shuju zao shijing [Big data already warned the Sunflower Student Movement]. *United Daily News*, p. A5.
- Yu, J. Y. (2014, September 29). Kuan Chong-Ming: shanyong wanglu yu nianqing ren goutong [Kuan Chung-Ming: making good use of Internet to communicate with young

people]. *United Daily News*, p. A7.

Zhan, L. Q. (2014, March 29). Wanglu zhibo, tai yang hua fangsong quan shijie [Online streaming: Sunflower has live streamed all over the world]. *Liberty Times*, p. A10.

Zhang, J. H. (2014, March 27). Haizi wen “gai bu gai qu fan fu mao” jia zhang hao weinan [Children asked ‘should they go to protest against the service trade agreement?’ Parents were in a dilemma about how to answer]. *United Daily News*, p. A6.

Zhu, Z. K., Xu, Z. Q. & Shu, Z. R. (2014, March 31). Du pai chahua, tai yang hua xueyun ran lv [Sunflower Student Movement was dyed in ‘green’ because the group of Taiwan independence showed up]. *China Times*, p. A3.

Editorials

Ben dan! zhongdian bu zai wanjun zai wanglu minzhu [It’s the Internet democracy, not netizens, stupid!]. (2015, February 3). *China Times*, p. A15

Shui shi waili? [Who is external force?]. (2014, April 5). *United Daily News*, p. A2.

Zhe tang minzhu ke jiao women de shi. [The democratic lesson taught us something]. (2014, March 29). *United Daily News*, p. A2.

Letters to the editor

Chen, F. M. (2014, May 14). Xueyun shidai de dansheng [Birth of the student movement generation]. *United Daily News*, p. A15.

Chen, X. P. (2014, April 5). Zhijie minquan, yin keji er keneng [Technology makes direct democracy possible]. *United Daily News*, p. A17.

Chien, Y. C. (2014, March 23). Dang quan zhe, qing liaojie minzhu, wanglu shidai [Power holders, please understand democracy and Internet generation]. *United Daily News*, p. A14.

Lu, S. X. (2014, March 30). Tai yang hua xuezi ganzhao le taiwan ren [Sunflower’s students

inspire Taiwanese people]. *Liberty Times*, p. A14.

Wang, S. Z. (2014, March 27). Dang iPad dabai SNG [When iPad beats SNG]. *China Times*, p. A16.

Zheng, X. L. (2014, April 6). Xi du fumao, you guan shengji, wu guan lan lv [Service Trade Agreement is closely related to livelihood, nothing to do with ruling or opposition parties]. *United Daily News*, p. A14.

APPENDIX

The list of original newspaper in Chinese

News Reports				
Publication Date	Author	Title of Newspaper	Title of Article	Page
09.03.2014	白德華	中國時報	陳德銘：台不開放，將邊緣化	A12
16.03.2014	曹伯晏	自由時報	譚慎格：服貿 中併台完美政治協議	A1
31.03.2014	曾韋禎&王寓中	自由時報	「台灣的未來，由台灣人民自己決定」 林飛帆籲馬 接受人民指揮	A1
03.04.2014	陳慧萍	自由時報	國族認同調查 台灣僅2.3%自認是中國人	A10
30.03.2014	陳若薇&王光慈	聯合報	馬：服貿不走回頭路 服貿哪賣台？	A3
21.03.2014	陳怡靜、彭顯鈞、林曉雲、謝文華 & 涂鉅旻	自由時報	街頭民主教室 教授輪流開講	A4
20.07.2014	顧佳欣&楊舒媚	中國時報	聆聽青年 政院今開世界咖啡館	A2
25.03.2014	管淑平&張伶銖	自由時報	時代：馬血腥鎮壓 讓人想起228	A6
29.07.2014	黃詩凱	聯合報	網友意見 江揆：大開眼界	A3
21.03.2014	黃驛淵&胡宥心	聯合報	學運擴大 近萬學生湧入 教授大街開講	A4
09.04.2014	江碩涵	聯合報	施崇棠：這次學運 是網路行銷的展現	A5
11.05.2015	林上祚	聯合報	LIVEhouse.in 線上直播 瞄準網路世代	AA3
02.02.2016	劉康彥&管嫻媛	中國時報	蘇將推公民記者、網路提案	A3
29.05.2014	劉俐珊	聯合報	接軌網路世代 政府想通了	A5
24.05.2016	呂雪慧	中國時報	一句政治事件 就可跨法治紅線？	A2
03.03.2014	羅添斌	自由時報	服貿大開方便門 中國人非法滯台將惡化	A2

02.01.2014	馬光慈	聯合報	向立院喊話 快通過服貿 馬：台灣成功故事，續集恐不再	A3
19.05.2014	彭顯鈞	自由時報	監控網路 緊盯「抗爭」 情資	A5
23.01.2014	錢震宇&王光慈	聯合報	馬：服貿延宕 傷害台灣	A8
24.03.2014	舒子榕&楊毅	中國時報	占國會攻政院 憲政最大危機	A3
30.08.2014	唐筱恬	中國時報	學運退燒，中國人認同比率回升	A18
22.03.2014	唐筱恬&顧佳欣	中國時報	學生民主沙龍 教立委審服貿	A4
30.03.2014	王光慈&陳洛薇	聯合報	馬：現在台灣民主制度綦然大備	A3
14.03.2018	王宏舜	聯合報	太陽花學運 二審維持無罪	A5
25.05.2016	王聖藜	聯合報	政治掛帥 台灣沒法律了？	A4
24.03.2014	王光慈&楊湘鈞	聯合報	棉被蓋拒馬 手機號召同伴翻越	A3
21.03.2014	徐子晴	中國時報	網路世代「學運2.0」成形	A3
20.03.2014	楊舒媚	中國時報	速開啟對話 勿讓鬧劇變悲劇	A2
06.03.2016	楊湘鈞、郭瓊俐 & 周志豪	聯合報	太陽花學運 大數據早示警	A5
29.09.2014	余佳穎	聯合報	管中閔：善用網路與年輕人溝通	A7
29.03.2014	詹立群	自由時報	網路直播 太陽花放送全世界	A10
27.03.2014	張錦宏	聯合報	孩子問「該不該去反服貿」家長好為難	A6
31.03.2014	朱真楷、徐子晴 & 舒子榕	中國時報	獨派插花 太陽花學運染綠	A3
Editorials				
Publication Date	Author	Title of Newspaper	Title of Article	Page
03.02.2015	無	中國時報	笨蛋！重點不在婉君 在網路民主	A15
05.04.2014	無	聯合報	誰是外力？	A2
29.03.2014	無	聯合報	這堂民主課教我們的事	A2

Letters to the Editor				
Publication Date	Author	Title of Newspaper	Title of Article	Page
14.05.2014	陳芳明	聯合報	學運世代的誕生	A15
05.04.2014	陳孝平	聯合報	直接民權 因科技而可能	A17
23.03.2014	簡韻真	聯合報	當權者 請了解民主·網路世代	A14
30.03.2014	盧世祥	自由時報	太陽花學子感召了台灣人	A14
27.03.2014	王尚智	中國時報	當iPad打敗SNG	A16
06.04.2014	鄭秀玲	聯合報	細讀服貿 攸關生計 無關藍綠	A14