This is a self-archived version of an original article. This version may differ from the original in pagination and typographic details.

Author(s): Nokelainen, Ossi; van Bergen, Erik; Ripley, Brad S.; Brakefield, Paul M.

Title: Adaptation of a tropical butterfly to a temperate climate

Year: 2018

Version: Accepted version (Final draft)

Copyright: © 2017 The Linnean Society of London, Biological Journal of the Linnean Society.

Rights: In Copyright

Rights url: <http://rightsstatements.org/page/InC/1.0/?language=en>

Please cite the original version:

Nokelainen, O., van Bergen, E., Ripley, B. S., & Brakefield, P. M. (2018). Adaptation of a tropical butterfly to a temperate climate. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 123(2), 279-289.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/biolinnean/blx145>

Adaptation of a tropical butterfly to a temperate climate

Journal:	<i>Biological Journal of the Linnean Society</i>
Manuscript ID	Draft
Manuscript Type:	Original article
Date Submitted by the Author:	n/a
Complete List of Authors:	Nokelainen, Ossi; University of Jyväskylä, The Department of Biological and Environmental Science van Bergen, Erik; Instituto Gulbenkian de Ciência Ripley, Brad; Rhodes University, Department of Botany Brakefield, Paul; University of Cambridge, Department of Zoology
Keywords:	<i>Bicyclus safitza</i> , developmental plasticity, geographic variation, local adaptation, phenology, seasonal polyphenism

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

View

1
2
3 1 GENERAL INFORMATION
4
5
6

7 2
8 3 **Title:** Adaptation of a tropical butterfly to a temperate climate
9
10 4

11 5 **Authors:** Ossi Nokelainen^{1,2#*}, Erik van Bergen^{1,3#*}, Brad S. Ripley⁴ & Paul M. Brakefield¹
12
13 6

14
15
16 7 **Addresses:**

17
18 8 ¹ Department of Zoology, University of Cambridge, Downing Street, Cambridge, CB2 3EJ,
19
20 9 United Kingdom

21
22 10 ² Department of Biological and Environmental Science, University of Jyväskylä, P.O. Box
23
24 11 35, 40014 University of Jyväskylä, Finland

25
26 12 ³ Instituto Gulbenkian de Ciência, Rua da Quinta Grande 6, P-2780 Oeiras, Portugal

27
28 13 ⁴ Department of Botany, Rhodes University, P.O. Box 94, 6140 Grahamstown, South Africa
29
30 14

31
32 15 [#] These authors contributed equally to this work.

33
34 16 ^{*} Authors for correspondence: Ossi Nokelainen (ossi.nokelainen@jyu.fi), Erik van Bergen
35
36 17 (erikvanbergen.science@gmail.com)
37
38 18

39
40 19 **Running headline:** Tropical butterfly adapting to temperate zone
41
42 20

43
44 21 **Keywords:** *Bicyclus safitza*, developmental plasticity, geographic variation, local adaptation,
45
46 22 phenology, seasonal polyphenism
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

23 ABSTRACT

24 Developmental plasticity enables organisms to cope with environmental heterogeneity, such
25 as seasonal variation in climatic conditions, and is thought to affect a species' capability to
26 adapt to environments with novel seasonal and ecological dynamics. We studied
27 developmental plasticity of the widespread tropical butterfly, *Bicyclus safitza*, which reaches
28 the southern edge of its distribution in the temperate zone of South Africa. In wet-dry
29 seasonal environments in tropical Africa, adults of *Bicyclus* butterflies are present all-year-
30 around and exhibit discrete seasonal forms in alternating generations. We demonstrate that a
31 population that colonized a more temperate climate region has adopted a different strategy to
32 cope with local environment as no active adults were encountered during the temperate
33 winter. The flight season coincided with a period when evaporation stress was lowest and
34 temperatures were higher in the South African population. Butterflies collected from the field
35 did not express seasonal polyphenism or show full expression of the tropical wet season form
36 phenotype. Reaction norm experiments comparing stocks from South Africa and Uganda
37 indicated that local adaptation of this tropical butterfly to a more temperate climate involved
38 the evolution of developmental plasticity, such that a more robust development in response to
39 thermal variation was observed for a broad suite of morphological and life history traits. Our
40 findings have implications for understanding the mechanisms that facilitate expanding into a
41 novel ecological niche under seasonally variable climatic conditions.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

42 INTRODUCTION

43 Natural environments are heterogeneous and many insect species have evolved strategies to
44 cope with spatial and temporal environmental variation. Typically these involve dispersal
45 from unfavourable to favourable conditions, either in space by means of migration, or in time
46 by inducing a state of arrested development or diapause (Bohonak and Jenkins 2003).
47 Compelling examples of both phenomena include the annual migrations of monarch
48 butterflies (*Danaus plexippus*) and the winter diapause in many other temperate butterflies,
49 such as the speckled wood butterfly (*Pararge aegeria*), which is induced when changes in
50 day length indicate that winter is coming (Aalberg Haugen and Gotthard 2015). An
51 alternative strategy to cope with environmental variability is seasonal polyphenism; an
52 extreme example of developmental plasticity in which different forms of a species are
53 produced at different times of the year. Seasonal forms have adaptive traits specific to the
54 environment in which they occur (Shapiro 1976). In contrast to spatially or temporally
55 dispersing insects in the tropics, seasonally polyphenic species remain active throughout the
56 year and, thus, demonstrate less dramatic seasonal peaks in activity and abundance.

57 *Bicyclus* butterflies have become a hallmark example of adaptive developmental
58 plasticity and seasonal polyphenism as they have proved a tractable system in which to study
59 the environmental regulation of development in both natural (Brakefield and Reitsma 1991,
60 Windig et al. 1994) and laboratory populations (de Jong et al. 2010, Oostra et al. 2014, van
61 Bergen et al. 2017). The genus consists of over 100 extant species that inhabit a wide range
62 of tropical habitats in sub-Saharan Africa (Aduse-Poku et al. 2015). Recent work has
63 supported that a single *Bicyclus* species began to colonize more open and seasonal habitats
64 during the Miocene epoch, when much of the trans-continental forests began to open up
65 (Aduse-Poku et al. 2015). Such environments, with highly distinct wet and dry seasons, are
66 characterized by predictable patterns of variation in temperature, rainfall and humidity that

are closely associated with changes in vegetation cover and host plant availability (e.g. Brakefield and Larsen 1984). The rains of the wet season result in a luxuriant growth of herbs, including species of grass, which the larvae of most *Bicyclus* species use as host plants. Adult butterflies in the middle of the warm, wet season are highly active and reproduce quickly (Brakefield and Reitsma 1991). Larvae of this generation develop in increasingly arid and cooler conditions towards the dry season when the ground vegetation, including larval host plants, dies back to become a layer of brown leaf litter. The next generation of adult butterflies emerges around the transition between wet and dry season, and then survives the unfavourable conditions as active, but reproductively dormant, adults before reproducing at the beginning of the next wet season (Brakefield and Reitsma 1991, Windig et al. 1994, van Bergen et al. 2016).

In the laboratory, development of phenotypes similar to the seasonal forms found in nature can be induced by manipulating the temperature during a sensitive phase of pre-adult development (Kooi and Brakefield 1999). Larvae reared at low temperatures, which represent the environmental conditions of the tropical dry season, develop into relatively large individuals, which allocate resources toward a more durable body and demonstrate cryptic patterning of the ventral wings that are exposed when at rest. In contrast, wet season form individuals, which are induced by high developmental temperatures, have a series of conspicuous marginal eyespots on their ventral wing surfaces, and demonstrate an increased investment in reproduction. The distinct wing patterns serve an important fitness function in terms of coping with changing predatory threats between seasonal environments (Lyytinen et al. 2004, Prudic et al. 2015).

The common bush brown, *Bicyclus safitza* (Westwood, 1850), is one of the most widely distributed species of *Bicyclus* butterflies (e.g. Larsen 2005). Whereas all other species of *Bicyclus* are restricted to tropical climate zones, the distribution of *B. safitza*

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

92 extends far into more temperate climate zones in southern Africa. One of the most
93 fundamental differences between temperate and tropical ecosystems is the ambient
94 temperature during winter, which can even drop below freezing in temperate regions, and
95 populations of tropical butterflies which successfully colonized more temperate climate
96 regions are predicted to have evolved a suite of adaptations to cope with local environmental
97 conditions. For example, recent field studies have revealed that populations of *B. safitza* in
98 these temperate regions have a strong preference for shaded forests habitats (Nokelainen et al.
99 2016), which may buffer seasonal fluctuations in temperature and humidity, whereas in
100 tropical biomes *B. safitza* is mainly found in semi-open woodland and forest edge habitats
101 (Brakefield and Reitsma 1991, Windig et al. 1994).

102 Here, we explore whether a population of *Bicyclus safitza* that occurs in Eastern Cape
103 of South Africa has become locally adapted to temperate climatic conditions. We also aim to
104 find explanations for the strong population-specific preference for more shaded habitats
105 (Nokelainen et al. 2016). To address these questions, we study the phenology and the
106 expression of seasonal polyphenism of temperate population by conducting a longitudinal
107 survey in the Eastern Cape, South Africa, and compare these to a well-studied tropical
108 population of *B. safitza* (Brakefield and Reitsma 1991, Windig et al. 1994). Secondly, using
109 the ratios of stable isotopes of oxygen obtained from the exoskeleton of field-trapped
110 individuals as well as measurements of local water evaporation during the larval stage, we
111 explore whether evaporation stress may constrain the butterfly niche. Finally, we conducted a
112 comparative reaction norm study, using populations from temperate and tropical climate
113 regions, to investigate the extent of local adaptation in response to different thermal
114 environments. Using data from these two populations, we aim to provide insights on the
115 mechanisms that facilitate the colonization of novel ecological niches under seasonally
116 variable climatic conditions.

117

118 MATERIALS AND METHODS

119 *Field sites and butterfly monitoring*

120 We monitored butterflies at the southern-most southern edge of the species' range in the
121 Eastern Cape province of South Africa. The Eastern Cape spans over a multitude of climatic
122 regions including cold and temperate interior parts as well as temperate and sub-tropical
123 coastal regions (Mucina and Rutherford 2006). Our study sites were predominantly in a
124 temperate zone that is characterised by open, semi-arid grasslands, whereas afro-montane
125 forests and coastal thickets provide more humid, shaded-habitats. The field sites in the
126 vicinity of Grahamstown and more humid coastal and riverine environments were chosen
127 using satellite images (Google Earth, Google Inc., Mountain View, CA, USA) to detect
128 suitable habitats after which the areas were visited to confirm the presence of *B. safitza*.
129 Three field sites were used in this study: Bathurst (33°30'S, 26°46'E), Kapriver (33°21'S,
130 26°52'E) and Kasouga (33°39'S, 26° 44'E). The Bathurst site represents a riparian bush
131 habitat with more open areas along the edges. The Kapriver site is an open, grassy hilltop,
132 which transitions into riparian forest in a lower lying river gorge. The Kasouga site is
133 characterised by coastal thickets and bordered by pastureland to the north, and the shores of
134 the Indian Ocean to the south.

135 To investigate the seasonal phenology of *B. safitza* in temperate regions, we
136 monitored field populations by conducting monthly trapping sessions between November
137 2014 and October 2015. Nine traps (Megaview, DC0017, Pop-up Butterfly Bait Trap, cone
138 type) were placed at each of the three field sites and equally distributed among three habitat
139 types, open grasslands, forest fringes and under shaded canopy, within each site (for further
140 details and habitat preference comparisons, see Nokelainen et al. 2016). These traps were
141 baited with fermented banana once a month and emptied on the following day. Wild-caught

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

individuals were stored in entomological envelopes until further processing. Measurements of relative humidity and temperature were obtained from each of the three habitats at all three sites using data loggers (Maxim DS1922T iButton Temperature Logger, San Jose, CA, USA) to enable comparisons of climatic conditions. Data on the phenology and wing pattern plasticity of tropical populations have been published by Brakefield and Reitsma (1991) and Windig *et al.* (1994), and here we use the same methodologies to quantify habitat use and variation in butterfly occurrence and wing patterning.

Evaporation stress measures

Evaporation stress from wild-caught butterflies was first studied using the ratio of stable isotopes of oxygen ($\delta^{18}\text{O}$) present in the exoskeleton, which have been shown to reflect the mean atmospheric conditions surrounding the insect before moulting (Ellwood *et al.* 2011). Briefly, the more common, lighter ^{16}O -isotope evaporates more readily than the ^{18}O -isotope, which leads to enrichment of ^{18}O in sample tissues and thus, more positive $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ -values. To quantify the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ -values of the specimens collected at the field sites, two legs were placed into silver capsules, sealed and loaded into an auto-sampler. The tissue within the capsule was pyrolysed at 1200°C using a Thermo Finnigan TC/EA attached to a Thermo Delta V mass spectrometer via a ConFlo 3. Reference standards from IAEA in Vienna were run at intervals throughout the sequence and these values are used to calibrate to the international standards of $^{18}\text{O}/^{16}\text{O}$ ($\delta^{18}\text{O}$ V-SMOW). Analyses were conducted at the Godwin Laboratory for Palaeoclimate Research, Department of Earth Sciences at University of Cambridge, UK.

We measured larval rates of water loss with Li-Cor 6400 photosynthesis system (Li-Cor Biosciences, Lincoln, NE, USA). Three separate runs were conducted using a total of nine similar-sized 3rd instar larvae of *B. safitza* ($\bar{x}$ = 22.5 mg). Larvae originated from an F1-laboratory stock, initially collected from the Kasouga field site, and were used only once. For

the measurements, three larvae were placed together (for better measurement accuracy) in a small mesh cage that was inserted into the leaf chamber of the photosynthesis system in order to obtain rates of water-loss. The device measures the exchange of CO₂ and H₂O between organism and atmosphere, controlling ambient CO₂ concentration, temperature and relative humidity and hence, the vapour pressure deficit (VPD, the difference between the amount of moisture in the air and how much moisture the air can hold when it is saturated). The conditions under which an organism maintains its water balance during temperature changes are more clearly shown by noting the VPD than the relative humidity (Anderson 1936). Based on this, we measured larval evaporation rates in response to five different VPD conditions (VPD [kPa] = 1.5, 2, 2.5, 3, 3.5) at a constant ambient temperature of 25°C. Evaporation measures were started at the lowest VPD and successively increased. Once a target VPD was attained, five water loss measures (over ten seconds duration) were recorded and averaged. Values were used to calculate average water loss as a percentage of larval body mass per hour (% H₂O g⁻¹ hr⁻¹). Climate data at the study sites was then used to calculate natural range of VPD's (Table 1) and predicted larval water loss based on the relationship established in the laboratory (see supplementary information).

183

184 *Temperature reaction norm experiment*

To study the geographic variation in the degree of developmental plasticity we conducted a reaction norm experiment using two populations of *B. safitza* and four constant thermal regimes. The laboratory populations of *B. safitza* were established in 2013 from eggs collected at a single location in the Semuliki National Park in Uganda (0°50'N, 30°9'E) and the Kasouga field site in South Africa (33°39'S, 26°44'E). The eggs from at least ten females contributed to each stock population. Thus, the Ugandan colony was derived from a population in the tropics whereas the South African colony originated from a temperate

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

population at the poleward margin of the species range. After about four generations of laboratory rearing, eggs were collected from both laboratory stocks and larvae were randomly divided over four climate-controlled chambers (21°C, 23°C, 25°C and 27°C) within one day after hatching. In these chambers (Sanyo/Panasonic MLR-350H, 70% RH, 12:12 L:D cycle), larvae were reared in sleeve-like gauze cages on young wheat (*Triticum aestivum*) plants: a host plant that is frequently used to rear newly established laboratory populations of *Bicyclus* butterflies (Oostra 2014, van Bergen 2017). Pre-pupae were collected daily and one day after pupation they were weighed to the nearest 0.1 mg (Fisherbrand PS-60) and individually placed in transparent pots until they eclosed. On the first day after eclosion the adults were sacrificed by freezing and carefully dissected. In addition to wing pattern measurements (see below) we recorded the larval and pupal development times, calculated the growth rate, and measured adult dry mass, relative fat content and abdomen ratio. Data from the Ugandan population were included in a comparative study on developmental plasticity in mycalesine butterflies, for details on methodology see van Bergen *et al.* (2017).

Wing pattern measurements

The ventral surface of one hind- and one forewing of each individual were photographed using a Leica DFC495 digital camera with a Leica M125 stereomicroscope. The images were analysed with the image processing package Fiji (Schindelin et al. 2012). We followed the Comstock-Needham system to refer to wing veins and cells (see Miller 1970). On the ventral hind wing, the area of the yellow outer ring, the black inner-disc, and white focus of the eyespot in cell Cu1 were measured. The relative distance of the proximal edge of the median band along the second wing vein was taken as a measure of the width of the band. The measurements on the ventral forewing included the yellow, black and white areas of the eyespot in cell M1 as well as area of the black inner-disc of the larger eyespot in cell Cu1.

For all wings an area enclosed by three clear landmarks was used as a proxy of wing size (Figure 1). The same protocol was used for both experimental and field-caught individuals.

Statistical analyses

Prior to analyses, all wing pattern elements were corrected for wing size and the nine ventral wing-pattern measurements (traits 1-5; see Fig. 1) were reduced using a principal component analysis, pooling all available data. The first principal component (PC1) explained 60 per cent of the total variation and was strongly associated with the effect of the developmental temperature and month of capture. PC2 explained 15 per cent of the variation and was correlated with sex rather than seasonality. In addition, all development times from temperature reaction norm experiment were log-transformed to improve normality. Statistical analyses were performed with the R Statistical Package v 3.1.2 (R Development Core Team 2014) and IBM SPSS Statistics (v22). For the field-collected data, 3-way ANOVAs were used to analyse the effect of monthly mean temperature, sex and sampling site on wing pattern morphology (PC1) and butterfly dry mass. Full models were fitted including temperature, sex, population and their interactions, before successive removal of non-significant terms. To investigate seasonal phenology of the butterflies, we tested expected equal monthly occurrence of butterflies (i.e. frequency of captured butterflies) across months using Chi-Square tests.

We used 3-way ANOVAs to investigate evaporation stress. For stable oxygen isotope data collected from adults, we used the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values as the dependent variable and monthly mean temperature, sex and sampling population and their interactions as explanatory variables. In addition, 3-way ANOVAs were used to analyse the effect of monthly mean temperature, population and habitat on predicted larval water loss (i.e. proportional loss of body mass per hour).

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

242 For the reaction norm experiment, 3-way ANOVAs were used to analyse the effect of
243 developmental temperature, sex and population on each phenotypic trait of interest. Full
244 models were fitted initially before successive removal of non-significant terms. The degree of
245 plasticity was estimated by calculating the effect size (Hedges's g), using the means and
246 standard deviation of the data from 21°C and 27°C, for each sex and population separately.

247

248 RESULTS

249 *Seasonal phenology and plasticity in the wild*

250 Butterfly monitoring revealed that the number of butterflies varied across months ($\chi^2 =$
251 353.46, $df = 8$, $p < 0.001$), with a clear absence of adult activity between May and August
252 (Figure 2). Out of 490 *B. safitza* recorded, males were overrepresented with approximately
253 3:1 ratio in comparison to females.

254 Variation in ventral wing pattern morphology (PC1) of field-collected specimens of
255 South African *B. safitza* was best explained by the monthly average temperature ($F_{5,161} =$
256 12.20, $p < 0.001$) while adult dry mass showed a three-way-interaction: apart from one
257 sampling site, females were heavier than males and female dry mass varied significantly
258 depending on the month of capture, whereas it remained similar in males throughout the
259 survey. However, dry mass was also dependent of the sampling site and the month of capture
260 varied between sites (3-way-interaction among sex, month and site, $F_{4,202} = 9.87$, $p < 0.001$).

261

262 *Evaporation stress*

263 Stable isotopes of oxygen ($\delta^{18}O$) indicated that month ($F_{5,227} = 26.24$, $p < 0.001$) and site
264 ($F_{2,227} = 12.20$, $p < 0.001$) both influenced evaporation stress as measured from adult
265 butterflies. However, there was also an interaction between the month and site ($F_{8,227} = 2.66$,
266 $p < 0.008$), and the main flight season coincided with a period when $\delta^{18}O$ -values were lowest
267 (min = 20.03) in contrast to the end of the season with highest $\delta^{18}O$ -values (max = 32.84).

268 This effect, however, was not as strong in the Kapriver population. The lowest $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ -values
269 were recorded at Kasouga ($\bar{x} = 24.84$, $n = 160$, $\text{s.d.} = 2.57$), followed by Bathurst ($\bar{x} = 25.24$,
270 $n = 7$, $\text{s.d.} = 2.28$), whereas butterflies from Kapriver mirrored a higher and more variable
271 evaporation stress ($\bar{x} = 25.61$, $n = 76$, $\text{s.d.} = 2.63$).

272 To explore further how evaporation stress may constrain the butterfly niche, we used
273 the laboratory-established physiological relationship to predict larval water loss with respect
274 to abiotic conditions through the monitoring period. We found two interactions that
275 significantly influenced larval water loss: an interaction between site and month ($F_{8,8857} =$
276 5.00 , $p < 0.001$), and between site and habitat ($F_{3,8857} = 14.02$, $p < 0.001$). The main effects of
277 site ($F_{2,8857} = 143.39$, $p < 0.001$), month ($F_{5,8857} = 10.98$, $p < 0.001$) and habitat also
278 influenced predicted larval water loss ($F_{2,8857} = 103.71$, $p < 0.001$). Both temperature and
279 humidity fluctuations through the survey period were less dramatic under the shaded-forest
280 canopy than in forest fringes or grasslands (Table 1).

282 *Plastic responses to developmental temperature*

283 In total, 728 individuals were reared in the temperature reaction norm experiment. We found
284 significant interactions between population and temperature for most life history traits and
285 wing pattern elements, indicating that populations respond differently to developmental
286 temperature (see supplementary material for all minimum adequate models). For all traits,
287 except for the pupal development time in females, the degree of plasticity was larger in the
288 Ugandan population (Figure 3) and the phenotypic differences between populations were
289 wider at higher temperatures. Not all traits were equally plastic in their response to
290 developmental temperature. Relative to other wing pattern elements, the plastic response of
291 the large eyespot on the forewing (2), as well as the width of the ventral bands (4-5) was less
292 pronounced in both populations (Figure 3).

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

293 The relationships between developmental temperature and phenotypic variation in the
294 South African population were linear or continuous in most traits. In contrast, the Ugandan
295 population showed more discontinuous responses to temperature (Figure 4). For example, the
296 conspicuousness of the wing pattern elements (PC1) increased dramatically between 23°C
297 and 25°C in Ugandan population and, as a consequence, all individuals reared at the extremes
298 of the temperature gradient showed a close phenotypic resemblance. The difference in the
299 shape of the reaction norm was even more pronounced when using developmental time as a
300 proxy for environmental variation (Figure 4).

301
302 DISCUSSION

303 We show that a natural population of *Bicyclus safitza* in temperate South Africa displays a
304 different seasonal phenology and reduced developmental plasticity in comparison to a
305 population from a tropical region in Uganda. In the tropics, populations of *B. safitza* are
306 typically found in wet-dry seasonal habitats and active butterflies are present here throughout
307 the year. They exhibit discrete seasonal forms, one with conspicuous, and one with cryptic
308 wing patterns (Windig 1991, Brakefield and Reitsma 1991, van Bergen et al. 2016). In
309 contrast, our data show that field-collected specimens in South Africa displayed continuous
310 morphological variation throughout the year with no individuals showing the large eyespots
311 typical of the wet season form in the tropical regions. Moreover, a flight season, in which
312 adult butterflies were active, was followed by a period when no active adults were
313 encountered.

314 Populations of *B. safitza* that inhabit tropical environments typically survive the
315 unfavourable conditions of the dry season as semi-active adults that will feed
316 opportunistically on fruit, and freely and continuously entered fruit-baited traps (Brakefield
317 and Reitsma 1991, Windig et al. 1994). Our results reveal that a population that colonized a

more temperate climate region in southern Africa has adopted a different strategy to cope with local environmental conditions. In South Africa two large activity peaks in November and February, and a smaller increase in butterfly numbers in April, were followed by a quiescent period in which no butterflies were caught until late September. These data suggest that this tropical butterfly species takes on a different ‘overwintering’ strategy in temperate climates, possibly with butterflies aestivating as fully dormant individuals in shelters or surviving in an arrested stage of pre-adult development (Stålhandske et al. 2017).

The adjusted phenology as well as the preference for more shaded habitats at the range margin of the species’ distribution may be associated with different evaporation constraints. Stable isotopes of oxygen, which in butterflies reflect evaporation rates during the late larval development (van Bergen et al. 2016), indicated that individuals caught at the beginning of the flight season experienced high evaporation rates during development. In contrast, we observed less evaporation stress in the middle of summer months while larval evaporation rates rose again closer towards the end of the flight season. The quiescent period of adults could thus reflect coping with evaporation stress and as well as targeting the more favourable environmental conditions for reproduction (Brakefield and Larsen 1984, Brakefield and Reitsma 1991). Moreover, larval evaporation rates were predicted to be significantly higher in forest fringes and open grassland compared to more shaded habitats. In the shaded forests the temperature was mild, humidity high and vapour pressure deficit low, which provides a buffer against the weather extremes (Addo-Bediako et al. 2001, Chown et al. 2011). Thus, it is possible that the maintenance of the body water balance, together with plant–insect co-evolution (Braschler and Hill 2007, Nokelainen et al. 2016), constrains populations of *B. safitza* to microclimates provided by shade-habitats in temperate zone.

Our results show that local adaptation of this tropical butterfly species to more temperate climatic conditions in southern Africa involved the evolution of developmental

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

plasticity. Field surveys confirmed the absence of polyphenism in the wild and, when compared in the laboratory to a population from the tropics, the South African population showed more robust development in response to thermal variation for a broad suite of morphological and life history traits. In addition to geographical variation in the degree of plasticity (i.e. the steepness of the reaction norm), we also observed clear differences in the shapes of reaction norms between the two populations. The expression of ventral wing pattern elements responded in a discontinuous manner to the temperature gradient, which is typical of polyphenism, while the relationship between developmental temperature and phenotypic variation in the South African population was more or less linear for these traits.

The evolution of developmental plasticity in this group of butterflies has been studied by conducting artificial selection experiments using *B. anynana*, a species closely related to *B. safitza* and a model system in the field of eco-evo-devo (Brakefield et al. 2009). Rapid responses to selection were observed with respect to the height of reaction norms (intercept), while developmental plasticity for eyespot size was retained in the selection lines (Brakefield et al. 1996). In contrast, attempts to change the slope (steeper or shallower) or the shape of the reaction norms were largely unsuccessful (Wijngaarden et al. 2002), which suggested that the slope of reaction norms is unlikely to evolve as readily as the intercept. Subsequent studies using two different tropical populations of *B. anynana* from different latitudes revealed parallel reaction norms for a suite of traits and no obvious genotype-by-environment interactions (de Jong et al. 2010), confirming the results obtained in the laboratory. Moreover, recent work confirms that intra-population genetic variation for plasticity is highly depleted in *B. anynana* (Oostra et al. 2017), which may hinder expansions of this species into environments with different seasonal and ecological dynamics. The striking differences in plasticity among populations described in the present study indicate that natural populations of *B. safitza* contain sufficient genetic variation in the response to thermal variation for

developmental plasticity to evolve. In insects, including *Bicyclus anynana* (Koch et al. 1996, Mateus et al. 2014, Monteiro et al. 2015), developmental plasticity is often mediated by endocrine signalling (Nijhout 1999, Zera et al. 2007). The evolution of environmentally sensitive traits, as shown here for *B. safitza*, likely involved evolutionary changes in the levels and timing of systemic hormone titres in response to external cues or in the degree and timing of the sensitivity of hormonal receptors in the developing target tissues.

Finally, phenotypic plasticity not only enables organisms to cope with environmental heterogeneity, such as seasonal variation in climatic conditions, but it may also enable dispersal into regions with climates to which organisms are not adapted to at source (West-Eberhard 2003, Wund et al. 2008, Gibert 2017). Upon exposure to novel environmental variation, plasticity provides an immediate shift in phenotypic variation, leading to increased population persistence and providing time for adaptive evolution to take place. Based on the data from the two populations studied here, we postulate that developmental plasticity of the ancestral population of *B. safitza* may have facilitated the process of local adaptation to temperate climates. Interestingly, individuals from the extant populations mate and produce viable offspring in the laboratory (personal observations). However, hybrid females demonstrated signs of reduced fertility, which is in line with Haldane's rule: the preferential hybrid sterility of the heterogametic sex. This may imply that the South African population of *B. safitza* is becoming genetically isolated and may be on its way to evolving full reproductive isolation.

388

389 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We are grateful to Andrew Balmer, Lea van de Graaf, Dave Osbaldeston and James Rolfe for practical assistance and technical support. All authors conceived and designed the experiments. ON and EvB performed the experiments, analysed the data and wrote the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

393 manuscript. All authors read and approved the final version of the manuscript for publication.
394 This work was supported by the European Research Council grant EMARES (250325) and
395 the John Templeton Foundation grant #60501 to PMB. During the final stages of the project
396 ON was funded through an Emil Aaltonen Foundation’s young researcher grant and EvB was
397 supported by funding from the Portuguese Foundation for Science and Technology (FCT; ref:
398 PTDC/BIA-EVF/0017/2014). We have no conflict of interest to declare.

For Peer Review

FIGURE LEGENDS

Figure 1: Wing pattern elements measured in all specimens of *Bicyclus safitza*. The images represent the typical phenotype of individuals reared at 27°C (row 1 and 3) and 21°C (row 2 and 4). The first two columns represent females (left) and males (right) of the population from the Kasouga field site in South Africa. The last two columns represent individuals of the population from Semuliki National Park in Uganda. For each individual, we obtained 11 wing measurements corresponding to three categories of traits: ventral eyespots (1-3), ventral bands (4-5) and wing areas (6-7). Different letter codes were used to refer to the corresponding yellow rings (y), black discs (b) and white pupils (w). References to wing veins and cells follow the Comstock-Needham system (Miller 1970). The icons were provided by Manuel Marques-Pita and adjusted from Mateus et al. (2014).

Figure 2: Seasonal phenology of *Bicyclus safitza*. A) Monthly numbers of butterflies captured during the longitudinal survey in the Eastern Cape, South Africa (2014-2015) are given in log₂-scale while the red dots represent monthly mean temperatures for a period of 30 years (1980-2009). In the temperate climate zone a flight period (Oct-Apr) was followed by a period in which no active adults were encountered (May-Aug). B) In tropical climate zones, here represented by data from Zomba in Malawi (1988-1989), adults of *B. safitza* are actively present throughout the year. Data presented in panel B were derived from Windig *et al* (1994).

Figure 3: The degree of plasticity for a suite of phenotypic traits in populations of *Bicyclus safitza* from temperate South Africa (blue) and tropical Uganda (red). Open symbols represent the degree of plasticity, calculated as the effects size (Hedges' g) between 21°C and 27°C, in females while males are represented by filled symbols. The black circles in the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

424 legend at the bottom of the figure represent the effect size in Hedge's g. For details of the
425 icons and codes for the wing pattern elements see Figure 1.
426
427 Figure 4: Effects of developmental temperature (A, B) and development time (C, D) on the
428 first principal component (PC1) of nine ventral wing pattern elements (see Fig. 1) of *Bicyclus*
429 *Safitza* butterfly. Panels A and C represent the data from the South African population
430 whereas panels B and D represent the Ugandan population. Coloured dots represent the
431 values for individuals reared at 21°C (purple), 23°C (blue), 25°C (pink) and 27°C (red). In
432 graphs C and D, non-linear sigmoidal curves were fitted and explained over 49% and 80% of
433 the variation in the population from South Africa and Uganda, respectively.

434 TABLES

435 Table 1: Variation in climatic conditions during a field survey of *Bicyclus safitza* in Eastern
 436 Cape, South Africa. Table shows air temperature (C °), relative humidity (RH %) and vapour
 437 pressure deficit (VPD kPa) range values and their standard deviations in three habitat types
 438 along the coastal range. Vapour-pressure deficit is the difference between the amount of
 439 moisture in the air and how much moisture the air can hold when it is saturated, and thus
 440 important in understanding the conditions under which an organism maintains its water
 441 balance during temperature changes.

Abiotic factor	min	mean	max	s.d.
Temperature				
Open	11.05	21.50	43.54	4.80
Edge	8.05	21.40	52.08	5.21
Closed	9.10	20.49	39.60	3.90
Relative humidity				
Open	12.59	77.80	100	16.75
Edge	12.57	79.54	100	16.08
Closed	17.25	84.16	100	13.45
Vapour pressure deficit				
Open	0	0.71	7.41	0.82
Edge	0	0.67	12.01	0.86
Closed	0	0.45	6.00	0.51

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

REFERENCES

Aalberg Haugen, I. M., and K. Gotthard. 2015. Diapause induction and relaxed selection on alternative developmental pathways in a butterfly. *Journal of Animal Ecology* 84:464–472.

Addo-Bediako, A., S. L. Chown, and K. J. Gaston. 2001. Revisiting water loss in insects: A large scale view. *Journal of Insect Physiology* 47:1377–1388.

Aduse-Poku, K., O. Brattström, U. Kodandaramaiah, D. C. Lees, P. M. Brakefield, and N. Wahlberg. 2015. Systematics and historical biogeography of the old world butterfly subtribe *Mycalesina* (Lepidoptera: Nymphalidae: Satyrinae). *BMC Evolutionary Biology* 15:167.

Anderson, D. B. 1936. Relative humidity or vapor pressure deficit. *Ecology* 17:277–282.

van Bergen, E., H. S. Barlow, O. Brattström, H. Griffiths, U. Kodandaramaiah, C. P. Osborne, and P. M. Brakefield. 2016. The stable isotope ecology of mycalesine butterflies: implications for plant-insect co-evolution. *Functional Ecology*:Accepted article.

van Bergen, E., D. Osbaldeston, U. Kodandaramaiah, O. Brattström, K. Aduse-Poku, and P. M. Brakefield. 2017. Conserved patterns of integrated developmental plasticity in a group of polyphenic tropical butterflies. *BMC Evolutionary Biology* 17:59.

Bohonak, A. J., and D. G. Jenkins. 2003. Ecological and evolutionary significance of dispersal by freshwater invertebrates. *Ecology Letters* 6:783–796.

Brakefield, P. M., P. Beldade, and B. J. Zwaan. 2009. The African butterfly *Bicyclus anynana*: A model for evolutionary genetics and evolutionary developmental biology. *Cold Spring Harbor Protocols* 4:1–10.

Brakefield, P. M., J. Gates, D. Keys, F. Kesbeke, P. J. Wijngaarden, A. Monteiro, V. French, and S. B. Carroll. 1996. Development, plasticity and evolution of butterfly eyespot

- 468 patterns. *Nature* 384:236–242.
- 469 Brakefield, P. M., and T. B. Larsen. 1984. The evolutionary significance of dry and wet
470 season forms in some tropical butterflies. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*
471 22:1–12.
- 472 Brakefield, P. M., and N. Reitsma. 1991. Phenotypic plasticity, seasonal climate and the
473 population biology of *Bicyclus* butterflies (Satyridae) in Malawi. *Ecological*
474 *Entomology* 16:291–303.
- 475 Braschler, B., and J. K. Hill. 2007. Role of larval host plants in the climate-driven range
476 expansion of the butterfly *Polygonia c-album*. *Journal of Animal Ecology* 76:415–423.
- 477 Chown, S. L., J. G. Sørensen, and J. S. Terblanche. 2011. Water loss in insects: An
478 environmental change perspective. *Journal of Insect Physiology* 57:1070–1084.
- 479 Ellwood, M. D. F., R. G. W. Northfield, M. Mejia-Chang, and H. Griffiths. 2011. On the
480 vapour trail of an atmospheric imprint in insects. *Biology letters* 7:601–604.
- 481 Gibert, J. M. 2017. The flexible stem hypothesis: evidence from genetic data. *Development*
482 *Genes and Evolution*:1–11.
- 483 de Jong, M. A., F. M. N. H. Kesbeke, P. M. Brakefield, and B. J. Zwaan. 2010. Geographic
484 variation in thermal plasticity of life history and wing pattern in *Bicyclus anynana*.
485 *Climate Research* 43:91–102.
- 486 Koch, P. B., P. M. Brakefield, and F. Kesbeke. 1996. Ecdysteroids control eyespot size and
487 wing color pattern in the polyphenic butterfly *Bicyclus anynana* (Lepidoptera:
488 Satyridae). *Journal of Insect Physiology* 42:223–230.
- 489 Kooi, R. E., and P. M. Brakefield. 1999. The critical period for wing pattern induction in the
490 polyphenic tropical butterfly *Bicyclus anynana* (Satyrinae). *Journal of Insect Physiology*
491 43:201–212.
- 492 Larsen, T. B. 2005. *Butterflies of West Africa*. Apollo Books.

1
2
3 493 Lyytinen, A., P. M. Brakefield, L. Lindström, and J. Mappes. 2004. Does predation maintain
4
5 494 eyespot plasticity in *Bicyclus anynana*? Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B:
6
7 495 Biological Sciences 271:279–83.
8
9
10 496 Mateus, A. R., M. Marques-Pita, V. Oostra, E. Lafuente, P. M. Brakefield, B. J. Zwaan, and
11
12 497 P. Beldade. 2014. Adaptive developmental plasticity: compartmentalized responses to
13
14 498 environmental cues and to corresponding internal signals provide phenotypic flexibility.
15
16 499 BMC biology 12:97.
17
18 500 Miller, L. 1970. Nomenclature of wings veins and cells.
19
20 501 Monteiro, A., X. Tong, A. Bear, S. F. Liew, S. Bhardwaj, B. R. Wasik, A. Dinwiddie, C.
21
22 502 Bastianelli, W. F. Cheong, M. R. Wenk, H. Cao, and K. L. Prudic. 2015. Differential
23
24 503 Expression of Ecdysone Receptor Leads to Variation in Phenotypic Plasticity across
25
26 504 Serial Homologs. PLoS Genetics 11:1–20.
27
28 505 Mucina, L., and M. C. Rutherford. 2006. The vegetation of South Africa, Lesotho and
29
30 506 Swaziland. Strelitzia 19:1–30.
31
32 507 Nijhout, H. F. 1999. Control Mechanisms of Polyphenic Development in Insects. BioScience
33
34 508 49:181.
35
36 509 Nokelainen, O., B. S. Ripley, E. van Bergen, C. P. Osborne, and P. M. Brakefield. 2016.
37
38 510 Preference for C4 shade grasses increases hatchling performance in the butterfly,
39
40 511 *Bicyclus safitza*. Ecology and Evolution:1–10.
41
42 512 Oostra, V., P. M. Brakefield, Y. Hiltemann, B. J. Zwaan, and O. Brattström. 2014. On the
43
44 513 fate of seasonally plastic traits in a rainforest butterfly under relaxed selection. Ecology
45
46 514 and Evolution 4:2654–2667.
47
48 515 Oostra, V., M. Saastamoinen, B. J. Zwaan, and C. W. Wheat. 2017. Extensive phenotypic
49
50 516 plasticity in a seasonal butterfly limits potential for evolutionary responses to
51
52 517 environmental change. bioRxiv.
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

- 1
2
3 518 Prudic, K. L., A. M. Stoehr, B. R. Wasik, and A. Monteiro. 2015. Eyespots deflect predator
4
5 519 attack increasing fitness and promoting the evolution of phenotypic plasticity.
6
7 520 Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 282.
8
9
10 521 Schindelin, J., I. Arganda-Carreras, E. Frise, V. Kaynig, M. Longair, T. Pietzsch, S.
11
12 522 Preibisch, C. Rueden, S. Saalfeld, B. Schmid, J.-Y. Tinevez, D. J. White, V. Hartenstein,
13
14 523 K. Eliceiri, P. Tomancak, and A. Cardona. 2012. Fiji: an open-source platform for
15
16 524 biological-image analysis. Nature Methods 9:676–682.
17
18
19 525 Shapiro, A. M. 1976. Seasonal polyphenism. Pages 259–333 in M. K. Hecht, W. C. Steere,
20
21 526 and B. Wallace, editors. Evolutionary Biology. Ninth edition. Springer US.
22
23 527 Stålhandske, S., K. Gotthard, and O. Leimar. 2017. Winter chilling speeds spring
24
25 528 development of temperate butterflies. Journal of Animal Ecology.
26
27
28 529 West-Eberhard, M. J. 2003. Developmental plasticity and evolution. Oxford University Press.
29
30 530 Wijngaarden, P. J., P. B. Koch, and P. M. Brakefield. 2002. Artificial selection on the shape
31
32 531 of reaction norms for eyespot size in the butterfly *bicyclus anynana*: Direct and
33
34 532 correlated responses. Journal of Evolutionary Biology 15:290–300.
35
36 533 Windig, J. J. 1991. Quantification of Lepidoptera wing patterns using an image analyzer.
37
38 534 Journal of Research on the Lepidoptera 30:82–94.
39
40 535 Windig, J. J., P. M. Brakefield, N. Reitsma, and J. G. M. Wilson. 1994. Seasonal
41
42 536 polyphenism in the wild: Survey of wing patterns in five species of *Bicyclus* butterflies
43
44 537 in Malawi. Ecological Entomology 19:285–298.
45
46
47 538 Wund, M. A., J. A. Baker, B. Clancy, J. L. Golub, and S. A. Foster. 2008. A Test of the
48
49 539 “Flexible Stem” Model of Evolution: Ancestral Plasticity, Genetic Accommodation, and
50
51 540 Morphological Divergence in the Threespine Stickleback Radiation. The American
52
53 541 Naturalist 172:449–462.
54
55
56 542 Zera, A. J., L. G. Harshman, and T. D. Williams. 2007. Evolutionary Endocrinology: The
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

543 Developing Synthesis between Endocrinology and Evolutionary Genetics. Annual
544 Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 38:793–817.
545

For Peer Review

Figure 1: Wing pattern elements measured in all specimens of *Bicyclus safitza*. The images represent the typical phenotype of individuals reared at 27°C (row 1 and 3) and 21°C (row 2 and 4). The first two columns represent females (left) and males (right) of the population from the Kasouga field site in South Africa. The last two columns represent individuals of the population from Semuliki National Park in Uganda. For each individual, we obtained 11 wing measurements corresponding to three categories of traits: ventral eyespots (1-3), ventral bands (4-5) and wing areas (6-7). Different letter codes were used to refer to the corresponding yellow rings (y), black discs (b) and white pupils (w). References to wing veins and cells follow the Comstock-Needham system (Miller 1970). The icons were provided by Manuel Marques-Pita and adjusted from Mateus et al. (2014).

560x330mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Figure 2: Seasonal phenology of *Bicyclus safitza*. A) Monthly numbers of butterflies captured during the longitudinal survey in the Eastern Cape, South Africa (2014-2015) are given in log2-scale while the red dots represent monthly mean temperatures for a period of 30 years (1980-2009). In the temperate climate zone a flight period (Oct-Apr) was followed by a period in which no active adults were encountered (May-Aug). B) In tropical climate zones, here represented by data from Zomba in Malawi (1988-1989), adults of *B. safitza* are actively present throughout the year. Data presented in panel B were derived from Windig et al (1994).

189x262mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Figure 3: The degree of plasticity for a suite of phenotypic traits in populations of *Bicyclus safitza* from temperate South Africa (blue) and tropical Uganda (red). Open symbols represent the degree of plasticity, calculated as the effects size (Hedges' g) between 21°C and 27°C, in females while males are represented by filled symbols. The black circles in the legend at the bottom of the figure represent the effect size in Hedges' g. For details of the icons and codes for the wing pattern elements see Figure 1.

388x1250mm (72 x 72 DPI)

Figure 4: Effects of developmental temperature (A, B) and development time (C, D) on the first principal component (PC1) of nine ventral wing pattern elements (see Fig. 1) of *Bicyclus Safitza* butterfly. Panels A and C represent the data from the South African population whereas panels B and D represent the Ugandan population. Coloured dots represent the values for individuals reared at 21°C (purple), 23°C (blue), 25°C (pink) and 27°C (red). In graphs C and D, non-linear sigmoidal curves were fitted and explained over 49% and 80% of the variation in the population from South Africa and Uganda, respectively.

502x424mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Table 1 Minimum adequate models of the effect of population, developmental temperature and sex on a suite of phenotypic traits in populations of *Bicyclus safitza* from Uganda and South Africa, related to figure 3 in the main text and figure 1 in the supplementary material. Significant interactions between population and temperature are denoted in bold, indicating both populations respond significantly different to developmental temperature. The codes for the wing pattern element refer to figure 1 in the main text. Statistical significance is indicated as: * $P < 0.05$, ** $P < 0.01$, *** $P < 0.001$. Data of the population from Uganda have previously been used in another study (van Bergen et al. 2017).

Trait	(transformation)	fixed effects	F	df	df	P
Total development time (d)	(log)	Population	51.3	1	715	***
		Temperature	1057.2	3	715	***
		Sex	27.3	1	715	***
		Population x Temperature	43.8	3	715	***
Larval development time (d)	(log)	Population	86.8	1	719	***
		Temperature	572.4	3	719	***
		Sex	49.7	1	719	***
		Population x Temperature	28.9	3	719	***
Pupal development time (d)	(log)	Population	68.7	1	715	***
		Temperature	2785.3	3	715	***
		Sex	100.3	1	715	***
		Population x Temperature	66.3	3	715	***
Pupal mass (mg)		Population	492.5	1	719	***
		Temperature	21.0	3	719	***
		Sex	518.5	1	719	***
		Temperature x Sex	4.9	3	719	**
Growth Rate (ln mg/d)	(log)	Population	190.5	1	719	***
		Temperature	459.8	3	719	***
		Sex	4.4	1	719	*
		Population x Temperature	37.4	3	719	***

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Table 1 *Continued*

Trait	(transformation)	fixed effects	F	df	df	P
Adult Drymass (mg)		Population	232.3	1	714	***
		Temperature	11.0	3	714	***
		Sex	1836.8	1	714	***
		Population x Sex	7.8	1	714	**
Adult Fat content (%)	(arcine)	Sex	127.8	1	713	***
Abdomen Ratio (%)	(arcine)	Population	9.5	1	712	**
		Temperature	35.2	3	712	***
		Sex	3082.7	1	712	***
		Population x Temperature	3.4	3	712	*
Total Wing Area (mm ²)		Population	1299.6	1	710	***
		Temperature	25.4	3	710	***
		Sex	1384.5	1	710	***
		Population x Temperature	4.6	3	710	**
		Population x Sex	4.1	1	710	**
Wing pattern element 1y	(size corrected)	Population	135.1	1	715	***
		Temperature	363.2	3	715	***
		Population x Temperature	88.0	3	715	***
Wing pattern element 1b	(size corrected)	Population	490.1	1	714	***
		Temperature	325.2	3	714	***
		Sex	4.5	1	714	***
		Population x Temperature	113.2	3	714	***
Wing pattern element 1w	(size corrected)	Population	605.3	1	713	***
		Temperature	119.4	3	713	***
		Sex	7.5	1	713	**
		Population x Temperature	26.2	3	713	***
		Population x Sex	7.4	1	713	**
Wing pattern element 2	(size corrected)	Population	188.5	1	716	***
		Temperature	29.8	3	716	***
		Sex	100.1	1	716	***
		Population x Sex	16.1	3	716	***

Table 1 Continued

Trait	(transformation)	fixed effects	F	df	df	P
Wing pattern element 3y	(size corrected)	Population	776.2	1	717	***
		Temperature	490.2	3	717	***
		Sex	4.0	1	717	*
		Population x Temperature	113.6	3	717	***
Wing pattern element 3b	(size corrected)	Population	1197.9	1	718	***
		Temperature	447.7	3	718	***
		Population x Temperature	145.9	3	718	***
Wing pattern element 3w	(size corrected)	Population	1456.8	1	716	***
		Temperature	335.9	3	716	***
		Sex	16.0	1	716	***
		Population x Temperature	168.6	3	716	***
		Population x Sex	6.0	1	716	*
Wing pattern element 4	(size corrected)	Population	214.3	1	716	***
		Temperature	175.3	3	716	***
		Sex	467.6	1	716	***
		Population x Sex	4.2	1	716	*
Wing pattern element 5	(size corrected)	Population	18.7	1	719	***
		Temperature	146.4	3	719	***
		Sex	192.5	1	719	***
		Population x Sex	9.8	1	719	**

Figure 1 Reaction norm representations of the effect of population, developmental temperature and sex on a suite of phenotypic traits in populations of *Bicyclus safitza* from Uganda and South Africa, related to figure 3 in the main text and table 1 in the supplementary material. Data from males is given in the left hand panel, females in the panel on the right. The South African population is represented by the filled symbols and dashed lines. Ugandan population is represented open symbols and solid lines Codes for the wing pattern element refer to figure 1 in the main text and error bars represent 95% confidence intervals.

Figure 1 Continued

Figure 1 Continued

Figure 1 Continued

Figure 1 Continued

Figure 1 Continued

Figure 1 Continued

Table 2: Extrapolated larval water loss of *Bicyclus safitza* in Eastern Cape, South Africa. Water loss was calculated as a percentage of larval body mass per hour (% H₂O g⁻¹ hr⁻¹). Negative values indicate water uptake (i.e. weight gain), while positive values indicate water (or weight) loss in relation to body weight (i.e. 100 would indicate the loss of entire body weight within an hour).

Larval water loss	min	mean	max	s.d.
Habitat				
Open	-10.46	-5.11	38.52	5.36
Edge	-11.11	-5.38	68.47	5.66
Closed	-10.44	-6.80	29.35	3.36
Site				
Kapriver	-10.46	-4.62	68.47	6.66
Kasouga	-11.11	-6.69	16.53	2.89
Bathurst	-10.44	-6.52	24.84	3.99
Month				
November	-9.79	-5.79	5.06	3.13
December	-10.11	-6.04	19.14	4.20
January	-10.45	-5.28	30.90	5.27
February	-11.11	-6.24	35.09	4.45
March	-10.51	-5.75	68.47	5.90
April	-10.46	-6.08	27.47	4.12

*Negative values imply water uptake and positive values water loss.